



**THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO**

## Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: February 8, 2018 REPORT NO. HRB-18-010

HEARING DATE: February 22, 2018

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 – Paul and Nellie McCoy Spec House #2**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Amezquita Family 1999 Trust; represented by Allen Hazard and Janet O’Dea

LOCATION: 5182 East Bedford Drive, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9  
APN 440-051-11-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Paul and Nellie McCoy Spec House #2 located at 5182 East Bedford Drive as a historical resource.

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Paul and Nellie McCoy Spec House #2 located at 5182 East Bedford Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of the Monterey/Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a two-story asymmetrical façade; low-pitched gable and hipped roof forms covered in red clay tile; narrow eaves with decorative rafter tails; smooth stucco walls; a corner-wrap around wood balcony with square balusters, supported by cantilevered beams and decorative diagonal bracing; and an arched wood six-paneled front door.

### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is a two-story Monterey/Spanish Colonial Revival style, single-family residence with a detached garage that was built in 1929 on the west side of East Bedford Drive, near the intersection of Bedford Drive, as part of the Kensington Heights neighborhood in the community of Kensington-Talmadge.

The historic name of the resource, Paul and Nellie McCoy Spec House #2, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the names of builder Paul L. McCoy and his wife Nellie McCoy who purchased the property as a speculative investment and built a house there. It is labeled as #2 as their first spec house was known as the *Casa Descanso* at 5201 Marlborough Drive, completed approximately one month prior to the completion of the subject property resource at 5182 East Bedford Drive.

## ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Allen Hazard and Janet O'Dea which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C, and Staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the [Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria](#), as follows.

*CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

Constructed in 1929, the subject property is a two-story Monterey/Spanish Colonial Revival style single family residence facing east onto East Bedford Drive. It is a frame construction with unadorned smooth stucco cladding on a concrete foundation with a small crawl space. The asymmetrical, two-story home features a low-pitch primary hipped roof that covers a centrally-located corner-wrapping balcony, and a single-story ell projection with low-pitch gable roof at the left side of the front elevation. The roof is sheathed in red clay tile, and the eaves are shallow and adorned with exposed rafter tails. The prominent balcony is accessed via French doors at the second story of the east elevation, and is supported below by cantilevered wood beams and decorative diagonal bracing. There is a small stucco battered chimney at the south elevation. Fenestration generally consists of a combination of irregularly-spaced, one-over-one wood double hung windows at secondary elevations. A set of three one-over-two original wood casement windows is centered at the north face of the single story portion of the house. Windows at the first story on the west elevation consist of a large fixed wood picture window at the front of the single-story ell projection, and a narrow arched fixed wood window with flared beveled surround near the entry. The arched, six-panel wood front door is north-facing, and is located below the balcony. Three original concrete steps lead to the scored concrete porch and entry door. The wide driveway leads to the original detached front-facing rectangular garage that features a flat roof with stacked red clay roof tiles along the eaves. Except for a few differences, the house was built to mirror the property at 5201 Marlborough Drive, which is located in the same neighborhood, and was also built by Paul L. McCoy shortly before completing the subject property house at 5182 East Bedford Drive. The property at 5201 Marlborough Drive was designated as a historical resource as HRB 1275, under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Monterey/Spanish Colonial Revival style in October 2017.

Modifications to the house include removal and replacement in-kind of the original glass at the narrow arched fixed window near the entry, date unknown. It also has an applied, non-original decorative film that gives the illusion of decorative etched glass but is very easily removable by simply peeling it away. There is unoriginal wrought iron railing at the porch, date unknown. The original wood garage door was replaced with a newer roll-top style garage door, date unknown.

Smooth stucco that matches the exterior walls has been applied to the exposed wood rafter tails (date unknown), which implies that the stucco throughout is unlikely the original finish but later applied in-kind.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition held in San Diego, California, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, reaching its height in Southern California in the 1920s and 1930s before rapidly declining in the 1940s. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture, including but not limited to Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character-defining features include a low-pitched roof with little or no eave overhang, red clay tile roof covering, stucco exterior wall finishes, an asymmetrical façade, and arches above doors and principle windows. Despite modifications, the subject property retains requisite integrity to be recognizable to its original design and construction as a 1929-built Monterey/Spanish Colonial Revival style house.

Monterey/Spanish Colonial Revival style architecture, a subtype of the Spanish Eclectic style, is named for Monterey, California, making it indigenous to California and the United States. It is distinguished by primary character-defining features of two-stories, low-pitched hipped and/or gabled roof, and broad balconies usually cantilevered and covered by the principal roof. Secondary character-defining features of the style include asymmetrical façade, stucco wall surfaces, walls extending into a gable without break, shallow eaves, red tile roof covering, and one or more prominent arches.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Monterey/Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1929 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains all of the primary character-defining features of the Monterey/Spanish Colonial Revival style: two-stories, low-pitched hipped and/or gabled roof, and broad balconies usually cantilevered and covered by the principal roof, and retains secondary character-defining features of the style including asymmetrical façade, smooth stucco wall surfaces, red clay tile roof covering, and shallow eaves.

#### OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Paul and Nellie McCoy Spec House #2 located at 5182 East Bedford Drive be designated with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C.



---

Sonnier Francisco  
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

sf/ss

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A  
ADOPTED ON 2/22/2018

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 2/22/2018, to consider the historical designation of the **Paul and Nellie McCoy Spec House #2** (owned by Amezquita Family 1999 Trust 07-29-99, 4455 Hermosa Way, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **5182 East Bedford Drive, San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **440-051-11-00**, further described as LOT 49 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Paul and Nellie McCoy Spec House #2 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of the Monterey/Spanish Colonial Revival style and a good level of architectural integrity from its 1929 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a two-story asymmetrical façade; low-pitched gable and hipped roof forms covered in red clay roof tiles; narrow eaves with decorative rafter tails; smooth stucco walls; a corner-wrap around wood balcony with square balusters, supported by cantilevered beams and decorative diagonal bracing; and an arched wood six-paneled front door. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair  
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,  
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
JEREMY JUNG,  
Deputy City Attorney