



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: March 8, 2018 REPORT NO. HRB-18-017

HEARING DATE: March 22, 2018

SUBJECT: **ITEM #6 – Dr. Michael and Jane Quinn Duplex and Custer Apartments**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Capexco East Village LP represented by Marie Burke Lia

LOCATION: 1035 and 1045 E Street, Downtown Community, Council District 3
APN 534-335-09-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Dr. Michael and Jane Quinn Duplex located at 1045 E Street and the Custer Apartments located at 1035 E Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Dr. Michael and Jane Quinn Duplex located at 1045 E Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1888-1913 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Italian Renaissance style with Craftsman influences, and designate the Custer Apartments located at 1035 E Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1888-1913 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Italianate style architecture. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource at 1045 E Street embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of the Italian Renaissance style with Craftsman influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource displays Italian Renaissance character-defining features including a square plan, symmetrically arranged facades, low-pitched hipped roof, wide-set boxed eaves, and decorative rafters, and Craftsman style influences such as wood clapboard siding, composition shingle roof, large Craftsman cottage style wood tripartite windows with decorative sills, and decorative metal vents at the soffits.
2. The resource at 1035 E Street embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of the Italianate style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource displays a hipped roof with moderate pitch and moderate overhang supported by decorative wood brackets, gabled dormers with cornices that frame a tympanum, wood clapboard siding, double-hung wood windows with decorative wood lintels and sills supported below by wood brackets.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application to determine whether or not the buildings at the property are historically significant as part of a constraints analysis for future development. The property consists of a single parcel containing two 2-story multifamily residential buildings in Downtown San Diego. Both buildings face north onto E Street near the intersection of 11th Avenue in the East Village area of the Centre City Planned District. The building at 1045 E Street was built at the site in 1888 and enlarged from a duplex to an 8-unit residential dwelling in 1913. The building at 1035 E Street was built in 1888 (original location unknown) and relocated to the current site in 1913.

The subject property buildings were identified in the *1988 Historic Resources Inventory of Centre City* prepared by Dr. Ray Brandes and the Office of Marie Burke Lia for the Centre City Development Corporation (CCDC) and each given a tentative rank of 3, determining them eligible for listing in the Local Historical Register. The subject property buildings were identified in a subsequent *2003 Historic Resources Inventory of Centre City* also prepared by the Office of Marie Burke Lia and each given a status code of 5S2, "Individual property that is eligible for local listing or designation." The Historical Resource Technical Report (HRTR) prepared December 2017 by the Office of Marie Burke Lia for the subject property notes corrections to misinformation presented in the 1988 and 2003 Historic Resources Inventory forms. The HRTR asserts that the building at 1045 E Street was built in 1888 rather than 1913 as stated in the 1988 and 2003 inventory forms, and that L.D. Burbeck, who was credited with the design of the building on the 2003 inventory form, was retired and no longer living in San Diego by that time. The HRTR also makes note that the 2003 inventory form incorrectly lists the building at 1035 E Street as "not moved," and provides an update that the building was built in 1888 and moved to the site in 1913 based on evidence from the Assessor's Building Record, Sanborn Fire Insurance maps, chain of title, and *San Diego Directory*.

In 2005 both buildings were reviewed as part of the *East Village Combined Historical Surveys 2005* by Diane Kane of Historical Resources Board staff. In that survey, the building at 1045 E Street was given a status code of 5S2, "Individual property that is eligible for local listing or designation," and the building at 1035 E Street was given a status code of 6Z, "Found ineligible for NR, CR or Local designation through survey evaluation," because the building had been "significantly altered on three sides."

The historic name of the resource, the Dr. Michael and Jane Quinn Duplex (at 1045 E Street) has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the names of Dr. Michael and Jane Quinn, who constructed the building as their personal residence and investment property.

The historic name of the Custer Apartments (at 1035 E Street) has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the historical name of the property as established by subsequent owners and identified by the community in previous historic survey evaluations for the property.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Technical Report was prepared by Dolores Mellon, of the Office of Marie Burke Lia, Attorney at Law, which concludes that the resource at 1045 E Street (Dr. Michael and Jane Quinn Duplex) is significant under HRB Criterion C, and that the resource at 1035 E Street (Custer Apartments) is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff concurs that the resource at 1045 E Street (Dr. Michael and Jane Quinn Duplex) is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, however disagrees with regard to 1035 E Street (Custer Apartments) and finds that the property is a significant historical resource under Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the properties at 1035 E Street and 1045 E Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Downtown's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the properties at 1035 E Street and 1045 E Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

Dr. Michael and Jane Quinn Duplex, 1045 E Street

The subject property building at 1045 E Street was built 1888 as a duplex by Dr. Michael and Jane Quinn who constructed the building as their personal residence and investment property. The Quinns occupied the building until 1900. In 1913 the building was purchased by Fred D. Carper, who then remodeled and enlarged the property, turning it into one building comprising 8 residential units. The resulting multi-unit residential Italian Renaissance building with Craftsman style influences is extant at the site. The building is square in plan, and its north-facing primary façade is symmetrical. It is clad in wood clapboard siding. The building is entered by a shallow raised porch leading to a recessed entryway protected above by a wood balcony and supported by decorative wood brackets. The single-paned wood front door is flanked by fixed sidelights. The low-pitched roof with wide, boxed eaves is supported below by decorative rafters, and the soffits feature decorative metal vents. Fenestration consists of a combination of tripartite wood windows and large wood double-hung windows identically positioned at first and second stories, with wood trim surrounds, sills and lintels. The tripartite windows consist of fixed wood windows with 5-lite transoms that are centered about single-lite narrow double-hung windows on either side.

Modifications to the building at 1045 E Street include replacement of the original wood railing at the second story balconies with wood railing of a taller height (sometime after 2005), addition of new wood railing at the rear staircase, and infill of five of the original seven vents at each of the west and east elevations with wood clapboard siding (dates unknown). Overall, the modifications noted do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling and do not result in a loss of integrity of the building, remaining recognizable to its 1888-1913 construction as a multi-family residence in the Italian Renaissance style with Craftsman influences.

The Italian Renaissance style developed in the 1880s and flourished through the 1920s. In *A Field Guide to American Houses*, Virginia Savage McAlester states that although the style was used in houses throughout the United States, it was much less commonly used than the contemporaneous styles of the time, and steadily declined in popularity by the 1930s and 1940s. It was more commonly used in the design of upscale residences and public buildings. Common character-defining features of the style include low-pitched hipped and flat roofs; widely overhanging eaves supported by decorative brackets; ceramic roof tiles; symmetrical façade; stone, brick, or stucco cladding; round arches above doors, windows, and porches; and recessed entryways usually accented by small columns or pilasters. Other common decorative details of the style are molded cornices, belt courses, roofline balustrades, and pedimented windows.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character-defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Significance Statement: The building continues to convey the historic significance of the Italian Renaissance style with Craftsman influences by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style. The building retains Italian Renaissance character-defining features of a square plan, symmetrically arranged facades, low-pitched hipped roof, wide-set boxed eaves and decorative rafters, and Craftsman style character-defining features such as wood clapboard siding, composition roof, decorative metal vents at soffits, and Craftsman cottage-style wood tripartite windows with decorative sills.

Custer Apartments, 1035 E Street

The multi-unit residential building at 1035 E Street was built 1888, per the Assessor's Residential Building Record, in the Italianate style and relocated to the subject property site in 1913 by Fred D. Carper (original location unknown). On the subject property parcel it is located west of the building at 1045 E Street. The building faces north onto E Street and is entered by an off-center (to the right) recessed entryway protected above by a shed roof that is supported by wood knee brackets. The moderately-pitched hipped roof features gabled dormers with wood windows at the east and south elevations. The moderately-overhanging eaves are supported by evenly-spaced decorative wood brackets. Fenestration consists of an asymmetrical arrangement of single-lite wood double-hung windows in singles and pairs. The windows all generally feature decorative wood sills adorned below

by decorative wood brackets. Windows at the first story also feature decorative wood lintels with wood brackets. At the left side of the south elevation is a small enclosed doorway that projects outward from the primary massing of the building and is topped by a gable roof. The building is clad in wood clapboard siding and the roof is composite shingle.

Modifications to the building include its relocation to the subject parcel from an unknown original location (1913), a door replacement and additions of non-original wood stairs and railing at the south elevation (dates unknown), and replacement of the original front door with a non-original glazed wood door (date unknown). Several modification have occurred at the west elevation including removal and infill of two original wood windows, the removal of decorative wood brackets at the sills and lintels of windows, and removal of the decorative wood brackets at the cornice. Although the building lacks integrity of location with respect to its original location, the property has been in its current location for 104 years and has achieved significance at this location in its own right. Overall, the modifications noted do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling and do not result in a loss of integrity.

The Italianate style was part of the Picturesque Movement that began in England, and was a reaction to the formal classical ideals in art and architecture that had been fashionable for about 200 years. The movement expressed a desire for greater freedom of architectural expression and for more organic, complicated forms that were intended to complement their natural setting. Popularized in the 1840s and 1850s, the Italianate style was popularized in pattern books by architect Andrew Jackson Downing. Freestanding Italianate buildings displayed the cornice under widely overhanging eaves, while contiguous Italianate row houses or commercial buildings have a bracketed cornice on the front façade. Other markers of the Italianate style are tall, narrow windows, some with elaborate hoods, often shaped like an inverted U. Italianate windows often have round arch or square tops and can also be crowned by a pediment or entablature with brackets. Most Italianate buildings have columned porticoes or porches, sometime extending the full width of the front façade. The style was dominate from 1855 through 1880. As an easily adaptable style it became popular with residential, commercial, and institutional buildings alike.

Significance Statement: The building continues to convey the historic significance of the Italianate style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a hipped roof with moderate pitch and moderate overhang supported by decorative wood brackets, gabled dormers with cornices that frame a tympanum, wood clapboard siding, double-hung wood windows with decorative wood lintels and sills supported below by wood brackets.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Research into the construction of the property at 1045 E Street failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

The property at 1035 E Street was designed by L.D. Burbeck, a contractor known to have worked in San Diego in the 1880s. L.D. Burbeck has not been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architect, Designer or Builder, and there is insufficient information to designate him as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - *Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.*

The properties at 1035 and 1045 E Street have not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - *Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.*

The properties at 1035 and 1045 E Street are not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Dr. Michael and Jane Quinn Duplex located at 1045 E Street be designated with a period of significance of 1888-1913 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that exhibits the distinctive characteristics of the Italian Renaissance Style with Craftsman influences, and that the Custer Apartments located at 1035 E Street be designated with a period of significance of 1888-1913 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that exhibits the distinctive characteristics of the Italianate style.



Sonnier Francisco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

SF/jb

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 3/22/2018

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 3/22/2018, to consider the historical designation of the **Custer Apartments** and **Dr. Michael and Jane Quinn Duplex** (owned by Capexco East Village LP, 250 5th Street SW #2200, Calgary, AB, Canada, T2P0R4) located at **1035 and 1045 E Street, San Diego, CA 92101**, APN: **534-335-09-00**, further described as BLK 56 LOT L N 3 FT LOT K & ALL in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Custer Apartments and Dr. Michael and Jane Quinn Duplex on the following findings:

(1) The property at 1035 E Street (Custer Apartments) is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of the Italianate style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource displays a hipped roof with moderate pitch and moderate overhang supported by decorative wood brackets, gabled dormers with cornices that frame a tympanum, wood clapboard siding, double-hung wood windows with decorative wood lintels and sills supported below by wood brackets. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property at 1045 E Street (Dr. Michael and Jane Quinn Duplex) is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of the Italian Renaissance style with Craftsman influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource displays Italian Renaissance character-defining features including a square plan, symmetrically arranged facades, low-pitched hipped roof, wide-set boxed eaves, and decorative rafters, and Craftsman style influences such as wood clapboard siding, composition shingle roof, large Craftsman cottage style wood tripartite windows with decorative sills, and decorative metal vents at soffits. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
JEREMY JUNG,
Deputy City Attorney