

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	March 8, 2018	REPORT NO. HRB-18-015
HEARING DATE:	March 22, 2018	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #8 – William and Elva Page House	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Data	<u>abase (CHRID) link</u>
APPLICANT:	Christopher Bosworth Trust and Alonzo Fimb Legacy 106, Inc.	rez Trust represented by
LOCATION:	4803 Kensington Drive, Kensington-Talmadge APN 440-511-12-00	e Community, Council District 9
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the William and I Kensington Drive as a historical resource.	Elva Page House located at 4803

## STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the William and Elva Page House located at 4803 Kensington Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes a rear addition to the main residence consisting of a bedroom, bathroom, and a covered patio (constructed 2008), and a 6' x 18' rear addition to the rear detached garage (constructed 1955). This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of characterdefining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource displays an *espadaña* shaped parapet continuously lined with clay roof tiles, a central covered porch with basket arches, thick grit style stucco cladding, sloping wing walls, round clay tile attic vents, and wood windows with divided upper lites and stucco raised arched hood moldings above.

## BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is a one-story single family residence built in 1927 as part of the Kensington Manor subdivision located in the community of Kensington-Talmadge.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the William and Elva Page House has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the names of William and Elva Page who constructed the house as their personal residence.

## <u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc. which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C, and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.* 

The subject resource is a single family residence constructed in 1927 in the Spanish Eclectic style. It is one story with a flat roof and shaped parapet composed of two espadañas of varying dimension and continuously lined with decorative clay roof tiles. A raised porch with scored, colored concrete leads to the central, covered entryway with hipped clay tile roof, basket arches, and original gumwood door. The raised porch extends to the south along the front façade where it is uncovered and is set behind a low stucco wall. The front façade faces west onto Kensington Drive and is framed by sloping wing walls. Fenestration at the primary (west) elevation consists of two sets of tripartite wood windows sheltered above by stucco arched hood moldings. On the left side of the front facade, a fixed center window with three-lite transom is flanked on either side by double hung windows with six-lite rectangular upper sashes over a single-lite lower sash. On the right side of the front façade, the window configuration is similar except that the center window features a five-lite transom. The south elevation is centered about an inset porch accessed by a multi-lite wood French door flanked by matching sidelights and covered by a clay tile shed roof supported by a large wood beam. A stucco chimney with sloped sides is at the left side of the south elevation. The base of the chimney features an arched inset. Decorative round clay tile attic vents are arranged in pairs centered above the windows at the south elevation. An original, detached two-car garage is east of the main residence at the rear of the property.

Modifications to the property include a 6' x 18' rear addition to the detached garage (constructed 1955), and a rear addition to the main residence consisting of a bedroom, bathroom, and a covered patio (constructed 2008). At the south elevation, non-original tile artwork has been added to the arched inset at the base of the chimney (date unknown). The original garage door has been replaced with a modern roll-top garage door (date unknown). The decorative clay roof tiles that continuously line the parapet also appear to be a later replacement of, but not an exact match to the presumed original clay roof tiles (replaced c. 2000). They appear to be slightly larger in overall dimension than the clay roof tiles at the hipped front porch. The clay tiles of the side porch shed roof also appear to be newer replacements of original roof tiles, noting a slight difference in the size of the tiles in comparison to those at the front porch. Overall, the modifications noted do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling and do not result in a loss of integrity.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition held in San Diego, California, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, reaching its height in Southern California in the 1920s and 1930s before rapidly declining in the 1940s. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture, including but not limited to Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character-defining features include a low-pitched roof with little or no eave overhang, red clay tile roof covering, stucco exterior wall finishes, an asymmetrical façade, and arches above doors and principle windows.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style including a flat roof with espadaña shaped parapet adorned with decorative roof tiles, a partially covered porch with basket arches and a clay tile hipped roof, thick grit style stucco cladding, sloping wing walls, and wood windows with divided upper lites and stucco raised arched hood moldings above. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

## OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

## **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the William and Elva Page House located at 4803 Kensington Drive be designated with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that exhibits the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style. The designation excludes a rear addition to the main residence consisting of a bedroom, bathroom, and a covered patio (constructed 2008), and a 6' x 18' rear addition to the rear detached garage (constructed 1955).

Sonnier Francisco Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

SF

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report and Addendum under separate cover

## RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 3/22/2018

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 3/22/2018, to consider the historical designation of the **William and Elva Page House** (owned by Christopher Bosworth Trust 11-09-11 and Alonzo Fimbrez Trust 12-18-15, 4803 Kensington Drive, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **4803 Kensington Drive**, **San Diego**, **CA 92116**, APN: **440-511-12-00**, further described as BLK 3 LOT 19 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

## NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the William and Elva Page House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource displays an *espadaña* shaped parapet continuously lined with clay roof tiles, a central covered porch with basket arches, thick grit style stucco cladding, sloping wing walls, round clay tile attic vents, and wood windows with divided upper lites and stucco raised arched hood moldings above. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude a rear addition to the main residence consisting of a bedroom, bathroom, and a covered patio (constructed 2008), and a 6' x 18' rear addition to the rear detached garage (constructed 1955).

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY:

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_

JEREMY JUNG, Deputy City Attorney