

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	June 14, 2018	REPORT NO. HRB-18-029
HEARING DATE:	June 28, 2018	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #9 – Pasquale and Nunzia Antonicelli House	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resource	s Inventory Database (CHRID) link
APPLICANT:	Randolph LLC represented by	Heritage Architecture & Planning
LOCATION:	4030-4034 Randolph Street, 9 APN 443-663-09	2103, Uptown Community, Council District 3
DESCRIPTION:	0	he Pasquale and Nunzia Antonicelli House andolph street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Pasquale and Nunzia Antonicelli House located at 4034-4034 ½ Randolph Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes 4030-4032 Randolph Street constructed in 1940; an enclosed kitchen porch addition at the rear of 4034-4034 ½ Randolph Street and the converted detached garage. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of characterdefining features of Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains a flat roof with a parapet, stucco exterior, wood fixed and divided light windows, clay tile vents, and decorative relief work.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is located in the North Florence Heights subdivision of the Mission Hills area. The surrounding area is a mixture of residential, commercial and park land.

The property was identified in the 2016 Uptown Historic Resources Survey and given a Status Code of 5D3, "Appears to be a contributor to a district that appears eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the Pasquale and Nunzia Antonicelli House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the Antonicelli's who constructed the house as their personal residence.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Heritage Architecture and Planning which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria B and C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not HRB Criterion B. This determination is consistent with the <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u>, as follows.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Pasquale Antonicelli immigrated to the United States from his native Italy in 1913. Shortly after his arrival in San Diego he began working for Kate Sessions. He continued to serve as her foreman for many years until her death in 1940. As Ms. Sessions' foreman, Pasquale worked on many of her plantings including Balboa Park, Presidio Park and Pioneer Park. Ms. Sessions foster-parented Pasquale's son after his first wife Nunzia passed away in 1933. Ms. Sessions granted her nursery to Pasquale and his brother Guiseppe in 1925. Both brothers managed the business until 1940 when Pasquale opened the Washington Street Nursery in 1940. This nursery remained in operation until 1970 when Pasquale retired.

While Pasquale worked several decades for Ms. Sessions, there is no indication that he collaborated with her on any of the designs or played a larger role in the nursery other than a dedicated employee. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

Constructed in 1927, the house is designed in the Spanish Eclectic style. The exterior of the house features a flat roof with a parapet and stuccoed exterior walls. The house is sited on a sloped lot allowing for a one-story house at the main façade and a two-story house at the rear. The main entrance is centrally located on the front façade. The entrance is stepped back from the front façade and to the left of a tripartite window. The tripartite window features a fixed single pane, arched window flanked by 4/4 double hung windows. The entrance, a fixed window to the left of the front door and a 4/4 double hung window to the right of the front door are located on an uncovered porch surrounded by a low wall. The fixed window displays a decorative relief above it while the door has a small shed roof with clay tile over it.

The north façade features a mixture of fenestration and includes a horizontal slider, double hung and fixed wood windows. The primary feature of the north façade is the bay at the northwestern corner. The southern half of the lot features a walkway leading to units at the rear of the house.

The south façade has double hung divided light windows which flank a chimney. Past the chimney on the lower level is an entrance to a lower level unit and a multi-light double hung window. The rear of the house has an enclosed porch addition sheathed with lap siding and a shed roof.

At the rear of the lot, a two-story duplex was constructed in 1940. The duplex has a partial basement, low-pitched hipped roof and stucco exterior. Windows on the duplex are 1/1 and 2/2 double hung wood windows and vinyl windows.

At the northwest corner of the parcel is a detached garage. The single car garage is original to the site, but has been modified with an addition at the southwest corner. The garage has also been converted to livable space. The original garage door has been removed and replaced with a glass unit in the original opening.

There have been a number of modifications to the lot which include the previously noted detached garage, the rear kitchen addition and the 1940 duplex. Modifications are located at the rear of the property and have limited visibility from the public right of way. The integrity of the main house remains intact.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, and unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a flat roof with a parapet, stucco exterior, wood fixed and divided light windows, clay tile vents, and decorative relief work. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Pasquale and Nunzia Antonicelli House located at 4034-4034 ½ Randolph Street be designated with a period of significance of 1971 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of a Spanish Eclectic style house. The designation excludes 4030-4032 Randolph Street constructed in 1940; an enclosed kitchen porch addition at the rear of 4034-4034 ½ Randolph Street and the converted detached garage

Jodie Brown, AICP Senior Planner

Sonnier Francisco Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison

JB/sf

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 6/28/2018

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 6/28/2018, to consider the historical designation of the **Pasquale and Nunzia Antonicelli House** (owned by Randolph LLC, 3000 Upas Street #101, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **4030-4034 Randolph Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92103**, APN: **443-663-09-00**, further described as BLK 9 LOT 3 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as Site No. 0, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Pasquale and Nunzia Antonicelli House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains a flat roof with a parapet, stucco exterior, wood fixed and divided light windows, clay tile vents, and decorative relief work. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude 4030-4032 Randolph Street constructed in 1940; an enclosed kitchen porch addition at the rear of 4034-4034 ½ Randolph Street and the converted detached garage.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY:

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: ____

JEREMY JUNG, Deputy City Attorney

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board