



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: June 14, 2018 REPORT NO. HRB-18-028

HEARING DATE: June 28, 2018

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – Nettie Innes House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Amor Hernandez, Reyes Family Trust;

LOCATION: 1659-1663 Dairy Mart Road, San Ysidro Community, Council District 8
APN 637-021-1700

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Nettie Innes House located at 1659-1663 Dairy Mart Road as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Nettie Innes House located at 1659-1663 Dairy Mart Road as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1887 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the residence at 1659 Dairy Mart Road and the corrugated metal barn constructed outside of the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Italianate style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1887 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits tall narrow windows, a bracketed cornice, low pitched hipped roof with moderately overhanging eaves, wide wood siding, and an unelaborated front porch.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application to determine whether or not the building is historically significant as part of a constraints analysis for future development. The preliminary review was initiated by a prospective buyer; however, the owner has chosen to bring the property before the Historical Resources Board for a determination. The resource is a large triangular parcel in San Ysidro which contains an Italianate residential structure, a modern house constructed in 1985 and a barn built in 1938. According to the Assessor's Building Record, the Italianate residential structure was constructed in 1887 and moved to the property in 1938.

The property was identified in the 2011 San Ysidro Historic Context Statement and Survey Report and given a Status Code of 3CS, "appears eligible for California Register as an individual property through survey evaluation." In that report, the property was suspected to be associated with the Little Landers community as well as the dairy farming industry and incorrectly given a construction date of 1910.

The historic name of the resource, the Nettie Innes House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Nettie Innes, who owned the property in 1938 when the structures were assembled on the parcel.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff disagrees and finds the site a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the [Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria](#), as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The 2011 San Ysidro Historic Context Statement and Survey Report identifies three significant associations that could potentially apply to the subject resource under Criterion A. These potential associations are the Little Landers community, dairy farming and the Bracero program.

Little Landers was a utopian agricultural community established in San Ysidro in 1908 by William E. Smythe. In 1916 the Hatfield Flood destroyed the community and very few houses survived. The Historic Context Statement associates the property with Little Landers; however, there is no evidence that 1663 Dairy Mart Road is one of these surviving structures. The structure's 1887 construction date would imply that it had been moved from another location to be a part of the Little Landers community and then moved once more to the Dairy Mart Road location which is not within the border of the former community. Because no direct link can be made between 1663 Dairy Mart Road and the Little Landers community, staff is not recommending the property for this association.

Despite the collapse of Little Landers, farming continued in the San Ysidro community until the mid-twentieth century. Dairy farming became the primary agricultural venture in the area and Dairy Mart Dairy became one of the largest dairies in San Diego. In reference to the 1663 Dairy Mart Road property, the Historic Context Statement states "it is possible that this property was a part of the former dairy." According to the current owner, whose family purchased the property in 1960, the property was never a part of the Dairy Mart Dairy and the corrugated metal barn was never used in association with any dairy farming activities. Because the property was not related to the dairy farming industry in San Ysidro, staff is not recommending the property for this association.

The Bracero program was an agreement between the U.S. and Mexican governments that allowed Mexicans to temporarily work in the U.S. on farms and ranches. The subject resource is not known to have an association with the Bracero program.

The property located at 1659- 1663 Dairy Mart Road could not be conclusively associated with Little Landers, dairy farming or the Bracero program; therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 1659-1663 Dairy Mart Road did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The Dairy Mart Road property is a large triangular piece of land containing three structures; an Italianate residential structure constructed in 1887 and moved to the property in 1938, a corrugated metal barn constructed in 1938, and a residence constructed in 1985. The modern stucco residence, 1659 Dairy Mart Road, and the large metal barn are excluded from this designation.

The subject resource is a one-story, single family residence constructed in the Italianate style. The house is compact and rectangular in shape with a low pitched hipped roof and wide wood siding. The property features a small concrete front porch, tall narrow windows, and bracketed cornice. An interior chimney is located on the western side of the house. At the rear of the property is a shed addition which was clearly constructed in two phases. A garage addition projects from the rear eastern side of the structure.

Several modifications have been made to the residence since its relocation to the site in 1938. Relocation would imply that the concrete porch was added after the house was moved to the site. All of the original wood windows were replaced with aluminum and a window opening on the east façade was shortened at an unknown date. The wood clad shed addition at the rear was added sometime between 1969 and 1971, the stucco addition constructed at a later unknown date and the garage addition was constructed in 1992. Also, the new brick chimney was added approximately during the 1940s. Any modifications that occurred to the structure prior to its move in 1938 are unknown. These modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship, feeling or association and the building retains integrity as it relates to architectural significance. This is consistent with the San Ysidro Historic Context Statement which states that the rarity of early single-family residences in San Ysidro allows for some alterations to the property, such as window replacements, to be acceptable and of little impairment to integrity.

In general, moving a property destroys the relationship between the property and its surroundings, destroys associations with historic events and persons, and may cause the loss of building materials such as foundations and chimneys. However, properties that were moved may still be eligible for designation. According to the Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria, in order for a moved property to be significant under HRB Criterion C it must retain enough features to convey its architectural values and retain integrity of design, materials, workmanship, feeling and association. Because the 1663 Dairy Mart Road property retains each of

these aspects of integrity and is also a rare example of an early residence in San Ysidro, the relocation of the property should not prohibit its eligibility for designation.

The Italianate style was part of the Picturesque Movement that began in England, and was a reaction to the formal classical ideals in art and architecture that had been fashionable for about 200 years. The movement expressed a desire for greater freedom of architectural expression and for more organic, complicated forms that were intended to complement their natural setting. Beginning in the 1840s and 1850s, the Italianate style was popularized in America through pattern books by architect Andrew Jackson Downing. As an easily adaptable style it became popular with residential, commercial, and institutional buildings alike from 1855 to 1880. Freestanding Italianate buildings displayed the cornice under widely overhanging eaves, while contiguous Italianate row houses or commercial buildings have a bracketed cornice on the front façade. Other markers of the Italianate style are tall, narrow windows, some with elaborate hoods, often shaped like an inverted U. Italianate windows often have round arch or square tops and can also be crowned by a pediment or entablature with brackets. Most Italianate buildings have columned porticoes or porches, sometime extending the full width of the front façade. The west coast produced a slightly different variation of the style with a higher concentration in San Francisco and northern California. In San Diego, the style arrived a few decades after the rest of the country and continued to be popular through the 1910's.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Italianate style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including tall narrow windows, bracketed cornice, low pitched hipped roof with moderately overhanging eaves, wide wood siding, and unelaborated front porch. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Research into the construction of the property at 1659-1663 Dairy Mart Road failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 1659-1663 Dairy Mart Road has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 1659-1663 Dairy Mart Road is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Nettie Innes House located at 1659-1663 Dairy Mart Road be designated with a period of significance of 1887 under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Italianate style. The designation excludes the residence at 1659 Dairy Mart Road and the corrugated metal barn constructed outside of the period of significance.



Suzanne Segur
Associate Planner



Sonnier Francisco
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison

SS/sf

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. The Applicant's Addendum dated May 30th, 2018 and Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 6/28/2018

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 6/28/2018, to consider the historical designation of the Nettie Innes House (owned by Amor Hernandez, Reyes Family Trust, 1663 Dairy Mart Road, San Diego, CA 92173) located at **1659-1663 Dairy Mart Road, San Diego, CA 92173**, APN: **637-021-17-00**, further described as SEC 35-18-2W NWQ 1.66 AC M/L IN S H OF S H OF NEQ OF in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Nettie Innes House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Italianate style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1887 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits tall narrow windows, a bracketed cornice, low pitched hipped roof with moderately overhanging eaves, wide wood siding, and an unelaborated front porch. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the residence at 1659 Dairy Mart Road and the corrugated metal barn constructed outside of the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
JEREMY JUNG,
Deputy City Attorney