

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

### Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	September 13, 2018	REPORT NO. HRB-18-047
HEARING DATE:	September 27, 2018	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #9 – Harry Turner/ Bristow and Lyman House	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Invent	ory Database (CHRID) link
APPLICANT:	Bollard/Bridges Trust; represented by	Allen Hazard and Janet O'Dea
LOCATION:	1808 Altamira Place, Uptown Commu APN 443-140-3700	nity, Council District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Harry located at 1808 Altamira Place as a hi	-

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Harry Turner/ Bristow and Lyman House located at 1808 Altamira Place as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1914 under HRB Criterion C and D. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

- The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Prairie style with Spanish Renaissance influence and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1914 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low pitched, hipped tile roof with wide overhanging boxed eaves; decorative soffit; leaded glass wood windows; geometric paneling and decorative trellis.
- 2. The resource is representative of a notable work of proposed Master Architects Bristow and Lyman and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is a good example of Bristow and Lyman's work in the Prairie style with Spanish Renaissance influence and expresses a quality of craftsmanship seen in the partnership's other known works.

### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is a one-story, single family residence located on a corner lot in the Mission Hills neighborhood.

The property was identified in the 2016 Uptown Community Plan Update and given a Status Code of 5S3, "appears to be individually eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the Harry Turner /Bristow and Lyman House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Harry Turner, who constructed the house as their personal residence and the names of Leonard Bristow and Jack Lyman Jr., who are being proposed as Master Architects with this designation.

### <u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Allen Hazard and Janet O'Dea, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board</u> <u>Designation Criteria</u>, as follows.

## CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject resource is a single-family residence constructed in 1914 in the Prairie style with a Spanish Renaissance influence. From the primary façade, the house reads as one-story; however, at the rear the grading slopes to reveal a basement level. The stucco house is generally rectangular in shape with a curved bay on the rear façade. The house features a low pitched, hipped tile roof with wide overhanging boxed eaves. Beneath the eaves, a decorative soffit surrounds the house and accentuates the overall horizontal emphasis of the structure. The main entrance is located on the center of the front façade and surrounded by geometric paneling. On either side of the front entrance are leaded glass casement windows, a typical feature on Prairie style houses. A wooden trellis believed to be original to the house covers an exterior staircase on the west façade. At the rear of the house is a large balcony which extends onto the roof of the property's original garage. The house displays wood windows in a variety of casement and double hung forms. While most of the character defining features of the property are consistent with the Prairie style, the tile roof displays a Spanish Renaissance influence consistent with the work of architects Bristow and Lyman.

Several alterations have been made to the subject resource since its construction in 1914. The tile on the front porch and the covering of the exterior staircase on the west façade both do not appear to be original. In 2005 the property owners applied for a permit to remodel the interior and exterior of the structure. Modifications completed during this project were mostly located on the rear façade and include the enlargement of the rear balcony, the modification of non-original balcony stairs, the reframing of the deck above the garage, changing a set of French doors to a window and adding a new set of French doors. Also, a new pool house was constructed at this time. The modification of the front entry was originally a part of this project but was later removed from the scope of work. These modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling.

The Prairie style originated in Chicago and was popular primarily in the Midwest for the early part of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. An indigenous American style, the Prairie School shared the ideals of the British Arts and Crafts movement and was popularized by architects including Frank Lloyd Wright, George Maher and others. Character defining features of Prairie style architecture include low-pitched,

usually hipped roofs, wide overhanging eaves, cornices and façade detailing emphasizing horizontal lines. Prairie style houses are typically two stories and often feature casement windows, one-story wings, porches, porte cocheres and inconspicuous entries. Pattern books and popular magazines spread vernacular examples widely to suburbs throughout the country, with most being built between 1905 and 1915.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Prairie style with a Spanish Renaissance influence by embodying the historic characteristics associated with those styles and retains integrity from its 1914 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low pitched, hipped tile roof with wide overhanging boxed eaves; decorative soffit; leaded glass wood windows; geometric paneling and decorative trellis. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

# CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Leonard Temple Bristow was born in 1876 and began his architectural career in Winnipeg, Canada before moving to San Francisco in 1909. Bristow moved to San Diego and partnered with John Beattie "Jack" Lyman Jr. in 1912. Lyman, originally from Buffalo, New York, was working as the superintending architect for the Marston Department store when he began working with Bristow. After the partnership dissolved, Lyman moved to Tucson, Arizona around 1920 and continued to work as an architect. The 1919 campus plan for the University of Arizona is accredited to Lyman as well as the school's agricultural and mining buildings.

The partnership between Bristow and Lyman lasted until 1916 and the two designed over twenty properties in the San Diego area including several downtown commercial buildings, apartments, institutional buildings and upscale residences. The architects worked in a wide vocabulary of architectural styles such as Spanish Renaissance, Italianate, Beaux Arts, Craftsman and Prairie. Their work was well known and highly publicized in contemporary newspapers. Two of Bristow and Lyman's buildings have been historically designated:

- HRB Site #127-062 Gaslamp Historic District Contributor, Watts-Robinson Building, 903 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, constructed in 1913
- HRB Site #781 Charles and Matie Sumner House, 2810 Chatsworth Blvd., Constructed in 1915

The subject resource was designed in 1914 by Bristow and Lyman and is a good example of their work in the Prairie style with a Spanish Renaissance influence seen in the tile roof. The building demonstrates the high quality of design and craftsmanship seen in Bristow and Lyman's other known works. Therefore, staff recommends the establishment of Bristow and Lyman as Master Architects and the designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion D.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The resource is representative of a notable work of proposed Master Architects Bristow and Lyman, a prominent and accomplished architectural partnership responsible for the design of many well-known properties in the City, some of which have been historically designated. Specifically, the resource is a good example of Bristow and Lyman's work in the Prairie style with Spanish Renaissance influence and expresses a quality of craftsmanship seen in the partnership's other known works.

### **OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

### **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Harry Turner/ Bristow and Lyman House located at 1808 Altamira Place be designated with a period of significance of 1914 under HRB Criterion C as good example of the Prairie style with Spanish Renaissance influence; and HRB Criterion D as a resource that is representative of the notable work of proposed Master Architects Leonard Bristow and Jack Lyman Jr.

Suzanne Segur Associate Planner

Sonnier Francisco Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

SS/am

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

### RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 9/27/2018

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 9/27/2018, to consider the historical designation of the **Harry Turner/ Bristow and Lyman House** (owned by Bollard/Bridges Trust 05-02-05, 1808 Altamira Place, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **1808 Altamira Place**, **San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **443-140-37-00**, further described as BLK A LOTS 20 & 21 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

### NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Harry Turner/ Bristow and Lyman House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Prairie style with Spanish Renaissance influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1914 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low pitched, hipped tile roof with wide overhanging boxed eaves; decorative soffit; leaded glass wood windows; geometric paneling and decorative trellis. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of proposed Master Architects Bristow and Lyman and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is a good example of Bristow and Lyman's work in the Prairie style with Spanish Renaissance influence and expresses a quality of craftsmanship seen in the partnership's other known works. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due. Vote: N/A

BY: \_

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_

JEREMY JUNG, Deputy City Attorney