



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 1, 2018 REPORT NO. HRB-18-058

HEARING DATE: November 15, 2018

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – Ralph Hurlburt /Alexander Schreiber Spec. House #3**

RESOURCE INFO: California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link

APPLICANT: Jason Hess and Amy Cook; represented by Vonn Marie May

LOCATION: 4179 Palmetto Way, Uptown Community, Council District 3
APN 443-472-02-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Ralph Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec. House #3 located at 4179 Palmetto Way as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Ralph Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec. House #3 located at 4179 Palmetto Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1919 under HRB Criteria C and D. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of its character defining features of Craftsman style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1919 period of significance. Specifically, the resource has an asymmetrical two-story stucco exterior, original wood windows, wide overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails, tapered columns on stuccoed piers, and a partial-width front porch.
2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource represents an excellent, early example of Schreiber's well-crafted Craftsman style homes.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject property was built in the North Florence Heights Addition neighborhood in Mission Hills.

The historic name of the resource, the Ralph Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec. House #3 has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the names of Ralph

Hurlburt, the original owner of the house and Alexander Schreiber, a Master Builder, who built the house as a speculative property.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Vonn Marie May, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criteria C and D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

Constructed in 1919, the subject property located at 4179 Palmetto Way is an excellent example of a two-story Craftsman style home that retains many of its character defining features. The property features a medium-coarse, sand stucco finish on the exterior of its asymmetrical layout. The front façade features an off-centered, large wooden door accessed by a partial-width front porch flanked by two tapered columns on large stuccoed piers that support the gabled roof overhead. A wide concrete walkway leading to four stairs flanked by small, stuccoed wing walls provides access to the front porch as well as four stairs on the south façade of the porch that are accessed by the concrete driveway. The stuccoed chimney, which has two ribbons of exposed, wire cut brick is located on the north façade of the first floor and the low-pitched roof provides wide overhanging eaves with visibility of exposed wood rafters underneath. The property also features all original wood windows which are either fixed or double hung. Additional window detailing includes a ribbon of curved, 3 over 1 pane windows on the south façade.

Modifications to the site are minimal and include the recent re-stuccoing of the exterior to match the original texture and the stuccoing of the piers under the tapered columns, as well as the two wing walls that flank the main stairs on the front façade. Additional modifications include the loss of a small beam next to the chimney and a small window added on the rear façade during a 2017 remodel. These modifications do not significantly detract from the resource or impair its ability to convey significance as a Craftsman with a period of significance of 1919.

The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including an asymmetrical layout, a partial width front porch supported by columns, large wood windows and doors, and a low-pitched roof with exposed rafter tails. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the property at 4179 Palmetto Way under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Alexander Schreiber was a prolific builder of the early 1910s, designing and constructing houses and commercial buildings throughout San Diego communities like South Park, North Park, Loma Portal, Encanto, University Heights and Mission Hills. Schreiber joined an impressive list of distinguished architects and builders who both lived and designed houses in Mission Hills during this time and he is credited with building over 45 houses in Mission Hills. In the 1910s, Schreiber was setting style

trends in San Diego by the early adoption of building Arts & Crafts Bungalows and well-crafted Craftsman style houses. As his style evolved, he designed Japoneseque "eyebrow" bungalows and San Diego versions of Midwestern Prairie School Houses. Towards the end of this career, he built Spanish Revival houses that eventually dominated the San Diego landscape. In addition to Schreiber being a skilled builder, he was an early experimenter in the use of electricity in houses. His obituary credits him with building the first home in San Diego completely wired for electrical appliances.

There are presently thirteen designated historic resources listed on the City's register which were built by Schreiber and designated for that association. The subject property exhibits Alexander Schreiber's characteristic Craftsman style and it retains a high degree of integrity to its 1919 date of construction, retaining all aspects of integrity. Although the property was owned by Master Builder Ralph Hurlburt when the original permits were pulled by Alexander Schreiber, there is no documentation to show that Ralph Hurlburt had anything to do with the design or construction of the property. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion D, as a notable work of established Master Builder Alexander Schreiber.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Ralph Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec. House #3 located at 4179 Palmetto Way be designated with a period of significance of 1919 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that exhibits the distinctive characteristics of Craftsman architecture and HRB Criterion D as a resource that is representative of a notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber.


Emma Haggerty
Assistant Planner


Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/ Acting HRB Liaison

EH/ks

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 11/15/2018

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 11/15/2018, to consider the historical designation of the **Ralph Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec. House #3** (owned by Jason Hess and Amy Cook, 4179 Palmetto Way, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **4179 Palmetto Way, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **443-472-02-00**, further described as BLK 4 LOT 11 LOT 10 & S 1/2 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Ralph Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec. House #3 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristic through the retention of its character defining features of Craftsman style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1919 period of significance. Specifically, the resource has an asymmetrical two-story stucco exterior, original wood windows, wide overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails, tapered columns on stuccoed piers, and a partial-width front porch. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource represents an excellent, early example of Schreiber's well-crafted Craftsman style homes. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
JEREMY JUNG,
Deputy City Attorney