



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 1, 2018 REPORT NO. HRB 18-055

HEARING DATE: November 15, 2018

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 – 2212 La Callecita**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Gregg Parise represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

OWNER: Zein C. Prater

LOCATION: 2212 La Callecita, Uptown Community, Council District 3
APN 443-370-46-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 2212 La Callecita as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 2212 La Callecita under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is a two story single family home located on APN 443-370-46-00 in the Mission Hills Neighborhood within the Uptown Community Planning Area. The property was evaluated as part of 2016 Uptown Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey Report and was identified as a potential contributing resource to the potential Northwest Mission Hills Historic District.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc. which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff disagrees, and finds that the building is not eligible under any HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity. This determination is consistent with the [Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria](#), as follows.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The resource is a two-story single-family home constructed in 1926 in the Spanish Eclectic style and features a combined flat and gable/shed clay tile roof. The massing of the subject property consists of a two-story front facing gable in the middle flanked by gables extending out on both the northeast and southeast sides. The building exhibits an asymmetrical primary façade and is clad in the original hand finished stucco with decorative round clay tile attic vents. The recessed entry porch is accessed via the original concrete walkways; which split at the porch landing and connect to both La Callecita and Witherby Street. The wood entry door is set to the right of the front porch, perpendicular to the street. Fenestration is primarily of multi-lite and single-lite wood casement and fixed windows. Wood lintels and shutters are located on some of the windows and doors.

Modifications include the addition of wooden stairs and a roof extension to the Juliet balcony on the front façade at an unknown date; the enclosure of the second story balcony with fixed and jalousie green glass on the rear; the addition of a second story wood deck and patio cover to the rear of the home circa 1971; and the replacement of the garage door with a non-historic metal garage door at a date unknown. There have also been several window modifications to the property that are noted on pages 49 and 50 of the applicant's report. The most significant window modifications are the replacement of two original windows on the front façade with non-historic jalousie windows at an unknown date.

Staff worked with the applicant to develop a plan to restore the property to a point where staff could recommend designation under HRB Criteria C and D, as noted in the applicant's addendum dated October 22nd. The restoration plan included replacing the non-historic front single light casement windows and jalousie window on the central two-story façade with original French doors relocated from the rear of the building; replacing the two jalousie windows on the front façade with historically appropriate windows; and removing the stairs and roof addition at the Juliet balcony. To date, the applicant has only been able to complete the first item – relocating the French doors. . While the applicant's addendum alludes that staff stated we would support restoration of the French doors alone, staff was clear when this property came up for designation in October that all items listed above would need to be restored prior to designation. Supporting designation of a property with only partial restoration of prominent, key character defining features would not be consistent with staff's direction on restoration in the past. The lack of restoration on the front elevation remains a concern for staff when evaluating the building's integrity and eligibility.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

The building did originally retain the significant features of Spanish Eclectic architecture and continues to exhibit many features. However, the cumulative effect of the overall modifications and the prominent nature of several of these modifications including the wooden stairs and roof extension added to the Juliet balcony on the front façade and, the replacement of two original windows on the front façade with non-historic jalousie windows, have significantly impaired the building's integrity of design, materials, workmanship and feeling to the point that the building is no longer eligible under HRB Criterion C. Therefore, staff cannot recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

As an aside, the applicant submitted an addendum on October 30th to include the interiors of the home, which did not give staff enough time to evaluate it or complete a site visit prior to distribution of hearing materials. However, the inclusion of the interiors in the nomination does not impact the staff recommendation to not designate.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 2212 La Callecita was constructed in 1926 by Master Builder Charles H. Tifal and designed by Master Designer Ralph E. Hurlburt. Tifal was established as a Master Builder in 2003 with the designation of HRB Site #613 and Hurlburt was established as a Master Architect in 2001 with the designation of HRB Site #464.

Charles H. Tifal was born in 1882 in Wisconsin and relocated to San Diego in approximately 1920. In the early 20s, Hurlburt and Tifal designed and constructed structures, primarily high-end custom residences, in a myriad of styles. In 1942 Tifal was no longer working with Hurlburt but was partnered with Scott King. The firm of Tifal and King installed the Alvarado Road Pump House, cottage, and garage. Charles Tifal died at the age of 86 in 1968. Houses built by Tifal on the San Diego Register include:

- HRB Site#311- Emmett G. O'Neill Residence, 2765 2nd Avenue
- HRB Site #613-Alfred LaMotte/Hurlburt and Tifal House, 3557 3rd Avenue
- HRB Site #697-Edwin and Rose Emerson/Hurlburt and Tifal House, 2645 28th Street
- HRB Site #824-Sam and Mary McPherson/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal House, 3133 28th Street
- HRB Site #904-Frederick and Helen Thompson/Charles H. Tifal House, 1232 Myrtle
- HRB Site #906-John Snyder/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal Spec House #1, 2315 Fort Stockton Drive
- HRB Site #933-John Snyder/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal Spec House #2, 4370 Trias
- HRB Site #1008-054-North Park Dryden Historic District Contributor, 3404 Pershing
- HRB Site #1011-Guilford H. and Grace Whitney House, 4146 Miller Street
- HRB Site #1089- John Snyder/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal Spec House #3, 4386 Trias Street
- HRB Site #1147- Edward and Emma Barrett/Charles Tifal House, 4156 Middlesex Drive
- HRB Site #1229- J.W. and Dora Fleming/Hurlburt and Tifal House, 2925 Cedar Street
- HRB Site #1276-004-South Park Historic District Contributor, 1335 28th Street
- HRB Site #1276-070-South Park Historic District Contributor, 1435 30th Street

Ralph E. Hurlburt was born in 1888 in Nebraska. He was trained by his grandfather in the construction trade. In 1916, he married and relocated to San Diego. Upon arrival, he was involved in real estate financing and law and later transferred to architectural design. Early in his career, Hurlburt partnered with builder Charles H. Tifal, a partnership that lasted until shortly before Hurlburt's death in 1942. Houses designed by Hurlburt and listed on the local register include:

- HRB Site#311- Emmett G. O'Neill Residence, 2765 2nd Avenue
- HRB Site #464-The Wonder House of Stone, 4386 Adams Avenue
- HRB Site #523-James C. & Lillie Byers / Ralph E. Hurlburt House, 4230 Arguello Street
- HRB Site #613-Alfred LaMotte/Hurlburt and Tifal House, 3557 3rd Avenue
- HRB Site #697-Edwin and Rose Emerson/Hurlburt and Tifal House, 2645 28th Street
- HRB Site #824-Sam and Mary McPherson/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal House, 3133 28th Street
- HRB Site #906-John Snyder/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal Spec House #1, 2315 Fort Stockton Drive
- HRB Site #929- Ralph Hurlburt/ Alexander Schreiber Spec House # 1, 3917 Hawk Street
- HRB Site #932- Lucy Killea House, 3248 Brant Street
- HRB Site #933-John Snyder/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal Spec House #2, 4370 Trias
- HRB Site #948- Ralph Hurlburt/ Alexander Schreiber Spec House #2, 3907 Hawk Street
- HRB Site #1008-054-North Park Dryden Historic District Contributor, 3404 Pershing
- HRB Site #1089- John Snyder/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal Spec House #3, 4386 Trias Street
- HRB Site #1011-Guilford H. and Grace Whitney House, 4146 Miller Street
- HRB Site #1229-J.W. and Dora Fleming/Hurlburt and Tifal House, 2925 Cedar Street
- HRB Site #1276-004-South Park Historic District Contributor, 1335 28th Street
- HRB Site #1276-010-South Park Historic District Contributor, 1503 28th Street
- HRB Site#1281-34- Valle Vista Terrace Historic District Contributor, 4727 Panorama Drive

As detailed in the discussion of Criterion C above, the building has been significantly altered since its original design and construction in 1926. Specifically, the wooden stairs and roof extension added to the Juliet balcony on the front façade and most importantly, the replacement of two original windows on the front façade with non-historic jalousie windows, have significantly impaired the building's integrity of design, materials, workmanship and feeling. Therefore, the building no longer reflects the notable work of Master Builder Charles H. Tifal and Master Designer Ralph E. Hurlburt, and staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the property located at 2212 La Callecita not be designated under any HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.


Shannon Anthony
Junior Planner


Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison

SA/ks

Attachments:

1. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover
2. Addendum to Report under separate cover