



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
M E M O R A N D U M

DATE: January 10, 2019

TO: Historical Resources Board

FROM: Kelley Stanco, Development Project Manager, Historic Preservation Planning

SUBJECT: **INFORMATION ITEM A: Mission Valley Community Plan Update Workshop**

Background

The community of Mission Valley runs west to east along the San Diego River between Interstate 5 and an area just east of Interstate 15. Mission Valley is surrounded by the communities of Linda Vista, Serra Mesa and Tierrasanta to the north, Navajo to the east, Kensington-Talmadge, Normal Heights, North Park, Uptown and Old Town to the south, and Mission Bay Park to the west.

In 2015 the City Council authorized a comprehensive update to the Mission Valley Community Plan, which was last updated in 1985. The City Planning Department contracted with Dyett & Bhatia Urban and Regional Planners and their sub-consultants to assist in the preparation of the Mission Valley Community Plan Update (CPU) and its associated technical studies, which include a Cultural Resources Constraints Analysis addressing archaeological and Tribal Cultural resources, and a Historic Context Statement that addresses built environment resources. These documents were used to provide background on the development of the community; shape the plan's policies related to the identification and preservation of archaeological, tribal cultural and historic resources; and will provide context for the development of the Program Environmental Impact Report. With this Information Item, staff is seeking the Board's review and comment on the Cultural Resources Constraints Analysis, the Historic Context Statement, and the draft policies related to the identification and preservation of Mission Valley's archaeological, tribal cultural and historic resources.

Mission Valley Community Plan Cultural Resources Constraints Analysis

A Cultural Resources Constraints Analysis (Attachment 1) was prepared by Tierra Environmental Services in support of the community plan update for the community of Mission Valley. The Constraints Analysis provides a discussion of the environmental and cultural setting; defines archaeological and tribal cultural resources; summarizes the results of archival research and outreach to the Native American Heritage Commission and local tribal representatives; analyzes the cultural sensitivity levels within the community; and provides recommendations to best address archaeological and tribal cultural resources in the Mission Valley Community.

The Cultural Resources Constraints Analysis concluded that much of the community of Mission Valley has a moderate or high cultural sensitivity level for the presence of prehistoric and historic archaeological resources. While much of the community of has been developed, it consists of a heavily active, depositional river valley utilized over thousands of years and the potential for intact cultural deposits at depth is probable at many locations. For these reasons, future discretionary projects within the community of Mission Valley would be evaluated by a qualified archaeologist following the Mitigation Framework included in the Cultural Resources Constraints Analysis to determine the potential for the presence or absence of buried archaeological resources. Because the majority of the community of Mission Valley is developed, many prehistoric and archaeological resources are buried. Buried deposits offer a unique opportunity to broaden our understanding of the lives, culture, and lifeways of the diverse occupation of the community through time. As such, the following recommendations have been made to ensure that buried resources are identified and documented:

- Conduct extensive, non-intrusive investigations to better located potential undocumented burials that may exist within the community.
- Require archaeological and Native American monitoring during all construction related ground-disturbing activities within the community of Mission Valley. Such projects include, but are not limited to, installation of water, sewer, or utility lines; building demolition projects; new construction projects; and road paving or repairs that require subsurface disturbance.

If it is determined that a resource is historically significant, it would be referred to the City's Historical Resources Board for possible designation. Mitigation measures would be initiated for all significant sites, either through avoidance or data recovery. All phases of future investigations, including survey, testing, data recovery, and monitoring efforts, would require the participation of local Native American tribes. Early consultation is an effective way to avoid unanticipated discoveries and local tribes may have knowledge of religious and cultural significance of resources in the area. In addition, Native American participation would ensure that cultural resources within the community of Mission Valley are protected and properly treated.

Mission Valley Community Plan Historic Context Statement

The draft historic context statement presents an overview of the history of the Mission Valley community, with a specific emphasis on describing the historic themes and patterns that have contributed to the community's physical development. It presents the history of the community's built environment from the Spanish Period to the present in order to support and guide the identification and evaluation of historic properties throughout the community, as well as to inform future planning decisions. It is important to note that the Mission Valley Historic Context Statement is intended only to address extant built environment resources. Archaeological and Tribal Cultural resources are addressed in the Cultural Resources Constraints Analysis.

The periods and themes identified cover a variety of related topics and associated property types. Consistent with the purpose and intent of a historic context statement, themes were only developed if extant properties directly associated with the theme and located within Mission Valley community limits were identified. The periods and themes identified in the context statement are outlined below:

Spanish and Mexican Period (1769-1848)

When the Spanish returned to San Diego in 1769 with the intent to settle the area, Mission Valley and the San Diego River was found to be a “river with excellent water”. Soon thereafter a land expedition led by Gaspar de Portola reached San Diego Bay and initially camp was made on the shore of the bay in the area that is now downtown San Diego. However, lack of water at this location led to moving the camp to a small hill closer to the San Diego River near the Kumeyaay village of Kosaii/Kosa’aay/Cosoy. The Spanish built a primitive mission and presidio structure on the hill near the river.

- **Theme: Establishment of the Mission**

The padres recommended that the Mission be moved further east in the valley to a location that was “much more suitable for a population, on account of the facility of obtaining necessary water, and on account of the vicinity of good land for cultivation.” The move was accomplished in August of 1774 and Mission Valley became its permanent location.

American Period (1848-1975)

At the conclusion of the Mexican-American War, California was ceded by Mexico to the United States under the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo in 1848. In his survey of the San Diego River in 1853, Lt. George H. Derby records the area as Mission Valley due to the proximity of the Mission San Diego de Alcalá. By 1870, Mission Valley becomes the adopted name. Development of Mission Valley in the American period is marked by development of the valley’s natural resources, followed by commercialization and tourism facilitated by road networks.

- **Theme: Development of Natural Resources (1850-1968)**

Dry farming of crops such as oats, barley and alfalfa within the valley provided little money for the farmers, and soon dairies dotted the large, flat landscape where land was cheap. By the 1950s, Mission Valley had 20 dairy farms. In addition to farming and dairy operations, sand and gravel mines were scattered throughout the valley, and at one point occupied about 596 acres within the valley.

- **Theme: Modern Commercialization, Tourism and Commercialization of the Valley (1940-1970)**

Mission Valley’s character as it exists today, began to take shape during the Post-WWII era. Prior to World War II, commercial development around Mission Valley was random and sparse and mostly serviced the local farmers. Open areas around the major principle traffic arteries attracted early businesses, which were initially mostly recreational related. However, with the ease of access in and out of the Valley by expansion of the freeway system, developers began to scout undeveloped

areas along the principal traffic arteries, namely Camino del Rio, Hotel Circle, and Friars Road. A second wave of roadway and freeway expansions during this period facilitated commercial development along the valley which catered to both locals and tourists alike. It was these transportation networks through the valley connecting downtown and the suburbs with new Post-World War II auto-oriented suburbia, that helped set the stage for the development of Mission Valley as a commercial and recreational destination.

- **Sub-Theme: Sports, Recreation and Leisure**
In the 1940s, the rural environment of the valley attracted recreation and leisure activities such as horse farms, riding stables, and polo clubs. In 1947, the Mission Valley Golf Club was established along the agricultural greenbelt of the San Diego River. The Bowlero Bowling Alley along Camino del Rio South opened in 1957 and included 56-lanes and a lounge, at the time the largest bowling alley in the west. Businessman C. Arnholt Smith, owner of Westgate-California Tuna Packing Co., had acquired the Pacific Coast League (PCL) Padres and immediately constructed Westgate Park on the site of present-day Fashion Valley mall in 1956-1958. The Padres relocated to the newly constructed San Diego Stadium (now SDCCU Stadium) upon its completion in 1967.
- **Sub-Theme: Motels/Hotels**
The development of Hotel Circle was spearheaded by Charles H. Brown, a local developer, in an effort to increase property values and draw business towards Mission Valley and away from downtown. In the 1950s, Brown helped secure zoning variances from the San Diego City Council, founded Atlas Hotel, Inc. and began developing hotels and motels along the I-8.
- **Sub-Theme: Commercial Regional Shopping Centers and Office Development**
The large span of open land in Mission Valley also began to attract the potentiality of a large regional shopping center at the center of the Valley. At the same time that the Hotel Circle was rezoned, other areas of Mission Valley were rezoned for general commercial construction, specifically for the Mission Valley Shopping Center developed by the May Company in 1958, which became the precedent for the broad commercialization of the community. By the end of the 1960s, office building development began to take root in areas of Mission Valley, particularly along Camino del Rio South and portions of Camino del Rio North.
- **Sub-Theme: Residential Apartments**
Unlike other neighborhoods, residential properties within Mission Valley came much later following the commercialization of the valley. Briefly starting in the late 1960s, a wave of residential development did not readily follow until the 1970s when apartment complexes began to develop further east above the Mission San Diego site along Rancho Mission Road.

Historic Preservation Policies of the Mission Valley Community Plan Update

The City's General Plan is the foundation upon which all land use decision in the City are based. Through its eight elements, the General Plan expresses a citywide vision and provides a comprehensive policy framework for how the City should grow and develop, provide public services, and maintain the qualities that define the City of San Diego. The City's 52 Community Plans are written to refine the General Plan's citywide policies, designate land uses and housing densities and include additional site-specific recommendations based upon the needs of the community. Together, the General Plan and the Community Plans seek to guide future growth and development to achieve citywide and community level goals.

In an effort to streamline the Community Plans and make the documents more user-friendly, the Planning Department is altering the approach to Community Plan formatting and content. Because Community Plans are intended to work in concert with the General Plan, content and policies from the General Plan will not be replicated in new Community Plan Updates. Instead, the Community Plans will focus on issue areas and policies that are unique to the needs to the community at hand. Each element or section within the Community Plan will be streamlined to provide the most relevant information and guide the reader to the location of additional, supporting resources and documents as appropriate. Finally, all policies will be located in tables at the end of the documents, allowing property owners, applicants, community members and City staff to quickly locate and review all policies in order to ensure project compliance.

Staff is currently finalizing the preparation of the Historic Preservation section of the Draft Mission Valley Community Plan. The section will discuss the Cultural Resource Constraints Analysis and the Historic Context Statement and provide a brief summary of the prehistoric and historic development of Mission Valley as well as the extant resources within the community. It is anticipated that the section will be approximately three pages in length. The policies will then be located at the end of the document in two tables, one for policies that a project would be required to comply with, and one for implementation actions that the City would be responsible for. These policies are as follows:

Policies for Development

- Conduct project-specific investigations in accordance with all applicable laws and regulations in order to identify potentially significant tribal cultural and archaeological resources.
- Conduct project-specific Native American consultation early in the development review process to ensure culturally appropriate and adequate treatment and mitigation for significant archaeological sites or sites with cultural and religious significance to the Native American community in accordance with all applicable local, state, and federal regulations and guidelines.
- Consider eligible for listing on the City's Historical Resources Register any significant archaeological or Native American cultural sites that may be identified as part of future development within Mission Valley or otherwise, and refer sites to the Historical Resources Board for designation, as appropriate.

- Ensure adequate data recovery and mitigation for adverse impacts to archaeological and Native American sites as part of new development; including measures to monitor and recover buried deposits from the prehistoric and historic periods, under the supervision of a qualified archaeologist and a Native American monitor.
- Identify, designate, preserve, and restore historical resources in Mission Valley and encourage their adaptive reuse consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- Evaluate properties at the project level to determine whether a historic resource exists and is eligible for designation and refer those properties to the Historical Resources Board for designation, as appropriate.
- Due to the highly limited nature of known extant resources related to Mission Valley's agricultural history, evaluate and consider for listing on the City's Historical Resources Register any resource related to agricultural history and development that may be discovered as part of future development within Mission Valley.

Implementation Actions

- Support the development of interpretive programs to educate the public and acknowledge the cultural heritage of Mission Valley and its significance to the Kumeyaay people. This could include a physical and/or virtual interpretive program based on the historical, biological and cultural resources of the river that illustrate the cultural use of Mission Valley and its connections to Old Town and Mission Bay to the west and the mountains to the east.
- Acknowledge the place names and places important to Native Americans who utilized and inhabited Mission Valley.
- Conduct a Reconnaissance Survey of the Mission Valley Community to identify the location of resources that may be eligible for historic designation.
- Provide support and guidance to community members and groups who wish to prepare and submit historical resource nominations to the City.

Conclusion

At this time, staff is seeking the Board's review of and comment on the Draft Mission Valley Cultural Resources Constraints Analysis; the Draft Mission Valley Historic Context Statement; and the archaeological, Tribal Cultural, and historic preservation policies of the Draft Mission Valley Community Plan. Staff will review all comments and direction received from the Board and the public and consider them as we proceed with the community plan update process. The Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) for the CPU is currently in process and is anticipated to be released for public review and comment in February of 2019. The adoption hearing process for the Mission Valley CPU is expected to begin in the Spring of 2019, at which time the Board will provide a recommendation to the City Council on the adoption of the Mission Valley Community Plan Area Historic Context Statement, the

Page 7
Historical Resources Board
January 10, 2019
Mission Valley Community Plan Update Workshop

Cultural Resources Constraints Analysis, the historic preservation policies of the CPU, and the environmental mitigation related to impacts to historical resources.



Kelley Stanco
Development Project Manager

KS/ks

- Attachment: 1. Draft Mission Valley Community Plan Update Cultural Resources Constraints Analysis (**Available on January 17, 2019**)
2. Draft Mission Valley Community Plan Update Historic Context Statement