

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	February 14, 2019	REPORT NO. HRB-19-002
HEARING DATE:	February 28, 2019	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #10 – Jose "Captain Joe" Machado Medina House	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Data	<u>abase (CHRID) link</u>
APPLICANT:	Gregg Haggart Trust & Deborah Reyes Trust; Johnson Architects	represented by Johnson and
LOCATION:	760 Armada Terrace, 92106, Peninsula Comm APN 532-291-0200	nunity, Council District 2
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Jose "Captair located at 760 Armada Terrace as a historica	•

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Jose "Captain Joe" Machado Medina House located at 760 Armada Terrace as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1938-1961 under HRB Criteria A and B. The designation excludes the modern pool, spa, greenhouse and structures located in the backyard as well as the enclosed porch on the rear of the house that was done outside the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource is a special element of the City's historical, social, cultural and economic development related to San Diego's Portuguese fishing community and retains integrity for that association. Specifically, the resource was built for Jose Machado Medina, a prominent and influential member of San Diego's Portuguese fishing community, who used the home as a gathering place for the fishing community and the broader Portuguese community in San Diego before any formal community spaces had been established. The resource, in its location in the heart of La Playa, its substantial size and grandeur, and association with the Medina family, exemplifies the historical, social, cultural and economic development of the Portuguese community and the tuna fishing industry that the community, led by entrepreneurs like Medina, successfully grew into San Diego's third largest industry.

2. The resource is associated with Jose Machado Medina, a historically significant person and retains integrity for that association. Specifically, the resource was the main residence for Jose Machado Medina whose entrepreneurial efforts helped grow the fishing community into San Diego's third largest industry.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. Located in the La Playa area of the Peninsula Community of Point Loma facing the bay and constructed in 1938, the large Spanish Eclectic style property sits within a pie shaped, elevated lot with the backyard slightly inclined over the subject resource. The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Jose "Captain Joe" Machado Medina House has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Jose Machado Medina, who is a historically significant individual.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by Johnson and Johnson Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A, B, C, and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criteria A and B but not HRB Criteria C and D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Within the La Playa section of the Peninsula Community of Point Loma, there is a rich history of the Portuguese fishing community starting in the late 19th century. Families who migrated from Portugal and the Portuguese Azores chose Point Loma as their home due to the proximity of the community to the sea. Families like the Medina's settled into the fishing industry as there were opportunities for immigrants who could not find work elsewhere and already had the experience and skills. Within this ethnic enclave, families shared their resources and wealth, allowing them to build one another up to succeed. Ultimately the Portuguese community was able to dominate the fishing industry and turned it into San Diego's third largest industry.

The property exemplifies the historical, social, cultural and economic development of Point Loma's Portuguese community. The Medinas, who were one of the most significant Portuguese families of the Point Loma community, used their status and wealth to help grow the Portuguese community, it's social institutions, and the tuna fishing industry in San Diego. The Medina family home accommodated a constant flow of family and social gatherings before community spaces for the Portuguese community had been established.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The subject property, in its location in the heart of La Playa, its substantial size and grandeur, and its association with the Medina family, exemplifies the historical, social, cultural and economic development of the Portuguese community and the tuna fishing industry that the community, led by entrepreneurs like Medina, successfully grew into San Diego's third largest industry. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the resource located at 760 Armada Terrace under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

The subject resource has been identified with a person of local significance. Jose Machado Medina, also known as "Captain Joe", immigrated from the Pico Island of Portugal Azores with his family when he was 13. Upon arrival to San Diego, he worked his way up from a self-educated fisherman to become one of San Diego's top captains and entrepreneurs. With his success, he was able to build a fleet of ships and use them to grow the tuna fishing industry to become San Diego's third largest industry, behind military and aviation.

Medina also became part owner of the Fisherman's Tuna Packing Company and was a representative for safer environmental practices with the U.S Fish and Wildlife Service. Additionally, during World War II, Medina lent his fleet of ships to help defend the country and purchased war bonds to fight rising inflation.

Medina was also a spokesperson for the tuna fishing industry and implementing safer practices. He met with U.S Senator William F. Knowland to discuss the impacts the market was experiencing from the fishing business, which resulted in San Diego being named the leader in commercial fishing.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The subject resource was the primary residence of Jose "Captain Joe" Machado Medina during his success as a captain and businessman to which he helped elevate the tuna fishing business to be San Diego's third largest industry. In addition, he utilized his home as a place of social gathering and community-building within the Portuguese fishing community. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the resource located at 760 Armada Terrace under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject resource is a large two-story single-family home with an attached garage. The property is constructed of wood frame construction on a raised foundation. The house features arched openings, red clay tile roofing, a modern smooth stucco finish, modern wood windows, original glass block detailing, clay tile vents, decorative columns as well as exposed rafter tails under the extended eaves.

The east elevation features the main entrance and the attached garage/basement. Due to the physical elevation of the site there are portions that are both two and three stories in an irregular format and topped with a hipped clay roof. This elevation has prominent features including a smooth stucco finish, a large staircase that ascends to an entry porch and recessed balcony surrounded by decorative columns, wood windows, a large focal window and decorative clay tile vents.

The south elevation features an asymmetrical layout as well with a low-pitched roof with deep eaves and exposed rafter tails underneath, smooth stucco finish and wood windows. Additional features include decorative clay vents and pipes, a segmented arch opening leading to another staircase into the arcade.

The west elevation features the rear of the property that displays a hipped roof with red clay tiles, the original 6x5 and 6x12 glass block windows. Additional features include the front of the full combined arcade which includes a total of 5 segmented arches carried by squat Tuscan style columns with low stucco retaining walls filling the space between each archway. Windows on this portion of the house are wood and stuccoed in a smooth stucco finish. The rear of the property features a porch enclosure that occurred outside the period of significance.

The north elevation is a narrow two-story form with a hipped clay roof with deep eaves and exposed rafter ends. The first-floor steps about ten feet further than the second and is topped with a hipped clay roof with deep eaves and exposed rafter ends as well. The windows on this portion of the house have been modernized and some of their openings have been modified.

The property has been significantly modified since its 1938 date of construction resulting in a loss of integrity. These modifications include: a rear porch enclosure completed in 1962, modern stucco replacement, the removal of 7 shutters from the front façade, side and backyard additions including a modern pool, spa, greenhouse and shade structures. Additionally, the windows were modernized in the 1980s. Three groupings located on the east and north elevation of the front façade have been modified in their size, glazing, and operation. The first grouping that have been noticeably altered are the second-floor windows on the south side of the east elevation which have two originally sized outer windows while the two center windows have had their window openings modified. These new windows are no longer multi-lite and single pane, but instead single-lite and dual pane. The second grouping of windows are also on the second floor, but on the north side of the east elevation. The outer windows are their original size, but the two center windows have been combined to be one large picture window. Again, these windows are not historically accurate in their size, glazing, and operation and are single-lite and dual pane. The third group of windows are the corner windows on the first floor of the north side on the east elevation. The corner post separating the windows has also been stuccoed over, modifying their size. These modifications have resulted in a loss of integrity of design and materials and the building no longer retains integrity as it relates to architectural significance.

The Spanish Eclectic style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. Its vocabulary is influenced by Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic or Renaissance precedents. The style became popular after the Panama-California Exposition of 1915 and reached its height in the 1920's and early 1930's before rapidly declining in the 1940's. Identifying features include a low-pitched roof with little or no eave overhang, red tile roof covering, stucco exterior wall finishes, an asymmetrical façade and arches above doors and principle windows. Common decorative details are patterned tiles, carved stonework, large focal windows, wooden or iron window grilles, decorative vents and balconies.

Although the house is a good example and features many of the character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style, such as red clay tile roofing, deep eaves with exposed rafter tails, wood

windows, irregular layout and form, decorative clay tile vents and columns, and a stuccoed exterior, the modifications have resulted in a loss of integrity and the property can no longer be eligible. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman

The A.L. and A.E. Dennstedt Company are previously established Master Builders within the City of San Diego's historical register. The Dennstedt brothers came to San Diego from Minnesota in 1924 and soon began their careers as builders. By the mid-1930s, the Dennstedt Company split, and the resulting company, the A.L. and A.E. Dennstedt Company continued in custom home construction. They produced houses in the Spanish Eclectic, Mexican Hacienda, Tudor, English Monterrey, and Ranch styles in San Diego communities including North Park, Talmadge, Kensington, La Jolla and Point Loma, as well as in Escondido and La Mesa.

The A.L. and A.E. Dennstedt Company became well known as a design-build company producing high quality custom homes with financing options. Features for their properties include high quality materials and attention to details that, to be considered eligible under this Criterion, should be retained.

The subject property at 760 Armada Terrace was built by A.L. & A.E. Dennstedt Building Company, however the alterations have impacted integrity of design and materials to the extent that the building can no longer convey the work of a Master. When the property was constructed, the subject resource had single pane, multi-lite, wood windows. A historic photograph of the subject resource from 1938 provided within the Historical Resources Research Report shows that the property has since undergone extensive window modifications on its front façade including alterations to their size, operation, and glazing with their replacements being made of dual pane, single-lite, wood windows. Additionally, portions of the window openings have filled in and been stuccoed over, furthering the loss of their historical integrity. Since a historic photograph of the resource has been provided within the HRRR's report proving that the windows on this property were different in their size, operation, and glazing staff cannot support the updated window and stucco configuration regarding HRB Criterion D.

Should the owners like to have their property designated under HRB Criterion D, they may work with staff to restore the windows to their original configuration. However, due to the window and stucco modifications, integrity of design and materials has been compromised and the resource no longer represents the notable work of a Master Builder. Therefore, staff does not recommend that the house at 760 Armada Terrace is designated under HRB Criterion D at this time.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Jose "Captain Joe" Machado Medina House located at 760 Armada Terrace be designated with a period of significance of 1938-1961 under HRB Criterion A as a resource that reflects the City's historical, social, cultural and economic development related to San Diego's Portuguese fishing community, and under HRB Criterion B for its association with Jose Machado Medina, who is a historically significant individual. The designation excludes the modern pool, spa, greenhouse and structures located in the backyard as well as the enclosed porch on the rear of the house that was done outside the period of significance.

Emma Haggerty Assistant Planner

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner

EH/ss

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER ADOPTED ON

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 2/28/2019, to consider the historical designation of the the **Jose "Captain Joe" Machado Medina House** (owned by Gregg Haggart Trust 11-06-09 and Deborah Reyes Trust 03-10-07, 760 Armada Terrace, San Diego, CA 92106) located at **760 Armada Terrace**, **San Diego**, **CA 92103**, APN: **532-291-02-00**, further described as LOT 174 POR in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as $\ensuremath{\textbf{Site}}$ No. , and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Jose "Captain Joe" Machado Medina House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION A for its connection with the historical, social, cultural, economic efforts the Portuguese fishing community had not just for Point Loma, but for San Diego as a whole. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION B for its connection with Captain Jose Machado Medina who is a historically significant person and retains integrity for that association. Specifically, the resource was his main residence during his entrepreneurial efforts which helped grow the fishing community into San Diego's third largest industry.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No.**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the modern pool, spa, greenhouse and structures located in the backyard as well as the enclosed porch on the rear of the house that was done outside the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: ____

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY:

JEREMY JUNG, Deputy City Attorney