



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

M E M O R A N D U M

DATE: February 14, 2019

TO: Historical Resources Board and Interested Parties

FROM: Suzanne Segur, Senior Planner, Historical Resources, Development Services Department

SUBJECT: **ITEM 7 – JIM AND RUBY SLAUGHTER SPEC HOUSE #1**

---

The property at 4166-4170 Oregon Street was previously docketed for review by the Historical Resources Board on September 27, 2018, at which time staff recommended designation under HRB Criterion C as a resource that exhibits the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style. At this time the applicant was not the owner of the property. Prior to the September meeting, the item was withdrawn from the agenda by the applicant.

On November 19, 2018 an addendum to the previous Historical Resources Research Report (HRRR) was submitted to Historic Resources staff on behalf of the property owner. The addendum, written by Jennifer Ayala, reiterated that the property was not historically significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff continues to disagree and finds that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. The property was again docketed to be heard by the Historical Resources Board for a determination on historical significance.

The addendum provided analysis of the property's integrity and eligibility for individual designation using the 2016 North Park Historic Context Statement. Also in the addendum were additional historic photographs. The addendum introduced several new modifications to the property which were not discussed in the HRRR. These modifications include the addition of a wood trellis and the reconstruction of the front porch which both can be determined to be consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. Other modifications include the trimming of rafter tails and the addition of a fascia board. These modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling. Historic photos provided in the report confirm that the chimney and porch columns were both covered in stucco in the 1950's. The HRRR and the addendum call out both of these features as being originally brick; however, this cannot be proven. Additionally, photos from 1952 show the projecting bay on the south façade indicating that this may have been an original feature of the house. The historic photos provide evidence that the property has not been altered significantly since the mid-twentieth century and retains a high level of integrity.

The addendum asserts that the property is not eligible for individual designation based on the guidance of the 2016 *North Park Historic Context Statement*. The *Context Statement* recommends that single-family residences constructed between 1907 and 1929 should retain a high level of integrity and be excellent or rare examples of an architectural style in order to be considered individually eligible. As previously discussed, the property has very few alterations that can be confirmed and staff believes that it retains a

high level of architectural integrity. Additionally, staff believes that the property is an excellent, although modest, example of the Craftsman style. Therefore, staff continues to recommend the designation of 4170 Oregon Street under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of the Craftsman style.



---

Suzanne Segur  
Senior Planner

- Attachments:
1. Staff Report HRB-18-049 dated September 13, 2018
  2. The Applicants Addendum dated November 16, 2018



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

## Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 13, 2018 REPORT NO. HRB-18-049

HEARING DATE: September 27, 2018

SUBJECT: **ITEM #5 – Jim and Ruby Slaughter Spec House #1**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Frances L Roe Living Trust; represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 4166-4170 Oregon Street, North Park Community, Council District 3  
APN 445-541-2400

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Jim and Ruby Slaughter Spec House #1 located at 4166-4170 Oregon Street as a historical resource.

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Jim and Ruby Slaughter Spec House #1 located at 4166-4170 Oregon Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1922 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear dwelling, 4166-4168 Oregon Street, which was constructed outside of the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low pitched gable roof with wide, overhanging eaves; multiple roof planes; a partial width porch with battered columns on pedestals; horizontal wood siding; decorative beams and attic vents; and wood windows.

### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application to determine whether or not the building is historically significant as part of a constraints analysis for future development. The property contains a one-story Craftsman style residence and garage constructed in 1922 as well as a minimal traditional duplex constructed in 1952. During the initial phases of the preliminary review the rear structure was determined to be not historically significant by City staff. The parcel is located in a residential neighborhood directly across from the North Park Community Park.

The property was located within the boundary of the 2016 North Park Survey Report, but was not identified in the survey because the property was not evaluated.

The historic name of the resource, the Jim and Ruby Slaughter Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the names of Jim and Ruby Slaughter, who constructed the house as a speculation house.

## ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff disagrees and finds that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the [\*Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria\*](#), as follows.

*CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.*

Research into the history of the property at 4166-4170 Oregon Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or North Park's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

*CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.*

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 4166-4170 Oregon Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

*CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject resource, 4170 Oregon Street, is a one-story single family residence constructed in 1922 in the Craftsman style. The house features low pitched, gable roofs with a wide eave overhang on both the main massing and porch. The partial width front porch is supported by battered columns on stucco pedestals and is elaborated by a decorative attic vent. The house features a number of original double hung and fixed wood windows as well as three original cottage (large lower pane with decorative transom) windows. The subject resource is covered in horizontal wood siding that flares at the bottom and features a stucco covered chimney on the south façade. The east and south façades also display decorative beams at the roofline which are characteristic of the Craftsman style.

Several alterations have been made to the subject resource since its construction in 1922. A projecting bay was added to the south elevation and the rear porch was enclosed both at unknown

dates sometime between 1956 and 1962. On the north elevation, a window opening was modified to accommodate a replacement awning window at an unknown date. Additionally, modern tiles have been added to the front porch which was originally concrete according to the Assessor's Building Record. The chimney was likely to originally brick which is evident by the modern stucco texture and decorative stepped detailing of the bricks beneath the stucco. The Historical Resources Research Report asserts that the piers of the porch columns were originally brick however there is no conclusive evidence to determine that the piers were not originally covered in stucco. These modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; multiple roof planes; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; decorative attic vents; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style and retains integrity from its 1922 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low pitched gable roof with wide, overhanging eaves; multiple roof planes; a partial width porch with battered columns on pedestals; horizontal wood siding; decorative beams and attic vents; and wood windows.

*CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.*

Research into the construction of the property at 4166-4170 Oregon Street failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

*CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.*

The property at 4166-4170 Oregon Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

*CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.*

The property at 4166-4170 Oregon Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Jim and Ruby Slaughter Spec House #1 located at 4166-4170 Oregon Street be designated with a period of significance of 1922 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Craftsman style. The designation excludes the rear dwelling, 4166-4168 Oregon Street, which was constructed outside of the period of significance.



---

Suzanne Segur  
Associate Planner



---

Sonnier Francisco  
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

SS/am

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A  
ADOPTED ON 9/27/2018

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 9/27/2018, to consider the historical designation of the **Jim and Ruby Slaughter Spec House #1** (owned by Frances L Roe Living Trust 05-27-03, 4170 Oregon Street, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **4166-4170 Oregon Street, San Diego, CA 92104**, APN: **445-541-24-00**, further described as BLK 150 LOTS 41 & 42 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Jim and Ruby Slaughter Spec House #1 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1922 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low pitched gable roof with wide, overhanging eaves; multiple roof planes; a partial width porch with battered columns on pedestals; horizontal wood siding; decorative beams and attic vents; and wood windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the rear dwelling, 4166-4168 Oregon Street, which was constructed outside of the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair  
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,  
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
JEREMY JUNG,  
Deputy City Attorney