

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	April 11, 2019	REPORT NO. HRB 19-011
HEARING DATE:	April 25, 2019	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #6 – Josephine and Albert Anderson House	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Data	<u>abase (CHRID) link</u>
APPLICANT:	Davidson Family Trust represented by Alexan	der D. Bevil
LOCATION:	821 Armada Terrace, Peninsula Community, (APN 532-312-02-00	Council District 2
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Josephine an located at 821 Armada Terrace as a historical	

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Josephine and Albert Anderson House located at 821 Armada Terrace as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes rear additions completed after the 1927 period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a combined hipped and gabled clay tile roof; asymmetrical front façade; stuccoed exterior walls; recessed front porch and entryway; accented windows and entries with decorative grillwork; stucco chimney with an elaborated top; heavy wood paneled front door; stucco and clay tile vents; and fenestration consisting primarily of multi-light wood casement windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a two story, single-family residence constructed in 1927 in the Spanish Eclectic Style on the east side of Armada Terrace in the Cuesta Loma area of the Peninsula Community.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Josephine and Albert Anderson House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Josephine and Albert Anderson, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Alexander D. Bevil which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A and C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u>, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development

The Historical Resource Research Report argues that the home is significant under HRB Criterion A, reflecting special elements of architectural, social and historical development as the first house erected in the Cuesta Loma subdivision, its association with the historical, social and architectural development of San Diego's highly restrictive coastal suburbs between 1927 and 1935 and it represents the physical manifestation of turning a local family's dream of upward social mobility during a time of unchecked real estate speculation, turn it into a nightmare amid a nationwide financial crisis and ensuing economic depression.

Although the Historical Resource Research Report provides information regarding the existing structure at the subject property being the first home built in the Cuesta Loma subdivision, it appears that the home only reflects early development in the subdivision and does not do so to any greater extent than other early homes. There is no documentation to show that this home was intended to serve as a model for the tract or to stimulate development within the area. It was not commissioned by the tract developers, nor was it featured in ads promoting the Cuesta Loma subdivision. The home was built by Josephine and Albert Anderson as their personal residence and does not reflect a special element of a community's development.

It is important that report to acknowledges the property 's association with the historical, social and architectural development of San Diego's highly restrictive coastal suburbs between 1927 and 1935 and it represents the physical manifestation of turning a local family's dream of upward social mobility during a time of unchecked real estate speculation, turn it into a nightmare amid a nationwide financial crisis and ensuing economic depression. As noted on pages 5 and 6 of the Historic Resources Board's adopted <u>criteria guidelines</u>, deed *"restrictions play no role in the Board's designation actions."* It should also be noted that the financial crisis and economic depression was a nationwide epidemic and was not unique within the City of San Diego.

This is not sufficient for eligibility under Criterion A, which requires that a property reflect a special element of a community's development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under Criterion A.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject resource is a two-story Spanish Eclectic style residence with attached garage built in 1927 and features a combined flat and gable/shed clay tile roof. The building maintains its original, irregular plan sited on a steep sloping lot facing east toward San Diego Bay. The primary façade faces west towards Armada Terrace. The recessed front porch and entry is accessed by a curved concrete walkway. The wood plank entry door is set to the left of the front porch entrance, parallel to the street. Other decorative features include stucco and tile vents, and wrought iron used over windows and doors. The building is clad in an irregular-surfaced off-white stucco finish with a decorative brick topped stucco chimney. A tiled arched "Lion's Head" fountain is set in the garage wall on the front façade. Fenestration is primarily of multi-lite wood casement windows.

At the rear elevation, the house's southeast-facing two-story projecting wing provides welcome lateafternoon shade to a narrow brick-paved terrace area below. The original two-car garage, with the original wood doors, is located on the font façade and is accessed via Armada Terrace.

Modifications include a L-shaped stucco-clad retaining wall and pool added in 1959. There were no changes to the property until 2011, since 2011 the following modifications have been made: rear elevation (northeast) addition included the extension to the upper level porch and room additions from the upper and lower floors'; a small boxy skylight that projects out of the roof; an elevator; pool; in-kind replacement of 4 sets of French doors on the rear elevation; replacement of the tiles and base on the "Lion's Head" fountain; installation of the ceramic tile artwork on the seat backrest located within the front porch; replacement of fifty percent of the roof tiles; metal rain gutters and downspouts; stucco-clad retaining walls and brick-lined walkways and stairways, a greenhouse, and an outdoor fireplace/conversation area. These modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling and the building retains integrity as it relates to architectural significance.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The resource continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style including a combined flat and gable/shed clay tile roof; asymmetrical front façade; stuccoed exterior walls; recessed front porch and entryway; accented windows and entries with decorative grillwork; stucco

chimney with an elaborated top; heavy wood paneled front door; stucco and clay tile vents and fenestration consisting primarily of multi-light wood casement windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Josephine and Albert Anderson House located at 821 Armada Terrace be designated as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style architecture and retains integrity. The designation excludes rear additions completed after the 1927 period of significance.

Suzanne Segur

Senior Planner

Shannon Anthony

Shannon Anthony Junior Planner

SA/ss

Attachments:

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 4/25/2019

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 4/25/2019, to consider the historical designation of the **Josephine and Albert Anderson House** (owned by Davidson Family Trust 10-01-02, 821 Armada Terrace, San Diego, CA 92106) located at **821 Armada Terrace**, **San Diego**, **CA 92106**, APN: **532-312-02-00**, further described as LOT 1 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as Site No. 0, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Josephine and Albert Anderson House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, Specifically, the resource exhibits a combined hipped and gabled clay tile roof; asymmetrical front façade; stuccoed exterior walls; recessed front porch and entryway; accented windows and entries with decorative grillwork; stucco chimney with an elaborated top; heavy wood paneled front door; stucco and clay tile vents; and fenestration consisting primarily of multi-light wood casement windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude rear additions completed after the 1927 period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY:

Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney