

### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	April 11, 2019	REPORT NO. HRB-19-012
HEARING DATE:	April 25, 2019	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #7 – William Tascher House	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Data	<u>abase (CHRID) link</u>
APPLICANT:	Steve Oas and Eric Schumacher; represented	by Legacy 106, Inc.
LOCATION:	5000 Westminster Terrace, Kensington- Talm District 9, APN 440-341-1600	adge Community, Council
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the William Tasc Westminster Terrace as a historical resource	

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the William Tascher House located at 5000 Westminster Terrace as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the retaining wall and the 140 sq. ft rear addition which were both were built outside the period of significance. The designation includes the living room tile fireplace. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical façade, a flat roof with a detailed parapet as well as shed roofs clad in clay tiles, stucco chimney, wood windows with detailed lite patterns, arched entrance arcade, decorative details such as plaster elaborations and clay vents, as well as a stucco exterior.

## BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is a two-story single-family residence with a detached garage located on a large corner lot between Norfolk Terrace and Westminster Terrace in the Kensington community.

The property was identified in the 1996 Mid-City Survey as a Contributing Structure within the Kensington Potential Historic District.

The historic name of the resource, the William Tascher House has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of William Tascher, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

## ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Kiley Wallace of Legacy 106, Inc. which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs with this finding. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

# CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 5000 Westminster Terrace did reveal that an individual, Robert Ely, who has been considered historically significant under the National Register designation of Fire Station #6 in Little Italy, lived at the subject property from 1974-2003. However, staff concurs with the report's findings that because Robert Ely joined the San Diego Fire Department and developed his standardized hose threading apparatus long before he purchased 5000 Westminster Terrace, the subject resource would not best represent his productive years. Furthermore, no additional events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, staff is not recommending designation under HRB Criterion B.

# CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The property is a two-story Spanish Eclectic style residence which features an asymmetrical façade, L shaped layout, a flat roof with a detailed parapet as well as shed roofs clad in clay tiles, original wood windows with detailed lite patterns, decorative details such as plaster elaborations and clay vents, as well as a stucco exterior.

The northeast elevation faces Westminster Terrace and features a front courtyard with an arched front entrance arcade with a flat roof and detailed parapet. The upper corners of the parapet contain decorative elaborations which are located throughout the property as well as above a group of tripartite windows located to the right of the entrance. Additional details include shed roofs clad in clay tiles that accentuate the corners of the parapets.

The southeast elevation faces Norfolk Terrace and features the secondary entrance porch which is sheltered by an extended shed roof. Additional features on this façade include the stuccoed chimney with a centralized plaster elaboration flanked by what are assumed to be two missing elaborations that are above two double hung wood windows. Three angled windows are located to the left of the entrance and directly above lies a detailed parapet with a setback second story. The second story features an entirely flat roof with the original wood pergola as well as wood windows and a door that allows exterior access to a roof deck.

This elevation also features the original detached garage which has its original wood doors, shed roof detailing clad in clay tiles cornered between detailed parapets. Additional features on the

garage include a stucco exterior that matches the stucco texture on the house and double hung wood windows.

The northwest elevation faces the neighboring property and features one smooth plane with a flat roof and detailed parapet with, original wood windows and a stuccoed exterior.

The southwest elevation features the 140 sq. ft addition which features modern windows, a covered porch with a differentiated stucco texture than what is on the rest of the property. The second story addition is also visible from this façade and features both double hung and fixed wood windows.

Modifications to the property are minimal and include a site wall that encloses the front courtyard which was estimated to be added between 1939-1958, an extension to the original shed roof above the southeast façade's entrance, and a rear 140 sq. ft addition that was completed in 1987. Additionally, three out of the eleven decorative elaboration along the parapet have been either removed or have fallen off at unknown dates, leaving behind shadows of their original location. After conducting a site visit, staff determined that the house was likely restuccoed; however, the new stucco appears to be consistent with the original texture. Overall, the modifications noted do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling and do not result in a loss of integrity.

The Spanish Colonial Revival style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. Its vocabulary is influenced by Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic or Renaissance precedents. The style became popular after the Panama-California Exposition of 1915 and reached its height in the 1920's and early 1930's before rapidly declining in the 1940's. Identifying features include a low-pitched roof with little or no eave overhang, red tile roof covering, stucco exterior wall finishes, an asymmetrical façade, wing walls, and arches above doors and principle windows. Common decorative details are patterned tiles, carved stonework, large focal windows, wooden or iron window grilles, decorative vents and balconies.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including an asymmetrical façade, a flat roof with a detailed parapet as well as shed roofs clad in clay tiles, stucco chimney, wood windows with detailed lite patterns, arched entrance arcade, decorative details such as plaster elaborations and clay vents, as well as a stucco exterior. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

## OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process and included in any future Mills Act contract.

### **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the William Tascher House located at 5000 Westminster Terrace be designated with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C as the resource specifically embodies the characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style. The designation excludes the site wall and the 140 sq. ft rear addition which were both were built outside the period of significance. The designation includes the living room tile fireplace.

Jaggerty mma

Emma Haggerty Assistant Planner

EH/ss

Attachment(s):

Suzanne Segur

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Interior fireplace proposed for designation
- 3. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 4/25/2019

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 4/25/2019, to consider the historical designation of the **William Tascher House** (owned by Steven Oas and Eric M Schumacher, 5000 Westminster Terrace, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **5000 Westminster Terrace**, **San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **440-341-16-00**, further described as BLK 15 LOT 28 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

### NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the William Tascher House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristic through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical façade, a flat roof with a detailed parapet as well as shed roofs clad in clay tiles, stucco chimney, wood windows with detailed lite patterns, arched entrance arcade, decorative details such as plaster elaborations and clay vents, as well as a stucco exterior. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall include the interior fireplace.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the retaining wall and the 140 sq. ft rear addition which were both were built outside the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: \_

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_

CORRINE NEUFFER, Deputy City Attorney



Site Plan with Footprint