

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: June 13, 2019 REPORT NO. HRB 19-025

HEARING DATE: June 27, 2019

SUBJECT: ITEM #7 - Union Trust Company of San Diego Spec House #1

RESOURCE INFO: California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link

APPLICANT: Stuart & Sharon Rosenberg represented by Heritage Architecture & Planning

LOCATION: 4369 Argos Drive, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9

APN 465-281-04-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Union Trust Company of San Diego Spec

House #1 located at 4369 Argos Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Union Trust Company of San Diego Spec House #1 located at 4369 Argos Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the garage conversion and southeast wing addition constructed outside of the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a flat roof with a tile-trim and a gabled red clay tile roof at the front; stucco cladding; round clay tile attic vent; large arched focal windows; asymmetrical primary façade; arched entry wood door; and fenestration primarily of multi-lite and single-lite wood windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a one-story, single-family residence constructed in 1926 in the Spanish Eclectic Style on the south side of Argos Drive in the Talmadge Park Unit 2 Subdivision of the Kensington-Talmadge Community.

The property was identified in the 1996 Mid-City Survey and given a Status Code of 5D2, "Contributor to a district that is eligible for local listing or designation."

The historic name of the resource, the Union Trust Company of San Diego Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Union Trust Company of San Diego, who constructed the property as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Heritage Architecture & Planning which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u>, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The resource is a one-story single-family home with a detached garage constructed in 1926 in the Spanish Eclectic style. The building is of standard wood frame construction on a concrete foundation and maintains its horizontal orientation and asymmetrical configuration. The roof form is predominantly flat with a tile-trim and a gabled red clay tile roof at the front. The structure is clad in a stucco with a decorative round clay tile attic vent centered under the front gable. The arched wood entry door is generally centered and accessed via a tile walkway and steps. Along the west wall to the right of the entry door is the original external tapered stucco chimney.

A projecting wing is present to the right of the front entry and features a large decorative focal divided-lite window flanked by two smaller arched divided-lite windows. A wood framed divided-lite bay window is located to the left of the front entry. Fenestration is primarily of multi-lite and single-lite wood windows with a variety of operations. At the end of the concrete driveway on the southeast elevation is the original detached garage.

Modifications to the property include: the southeast wing addition constructed circa 1950; the addition of the front site walls, walkways, low northwest wing wall and the tile features were added to the house circa 1990; the exterior was re-stuccoed circa 1990; two windows on the south elevation were replaced with vinyl circa 1990; and the garage was converted into a guest quarters and storage area in 2018. These modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling and the building retains integrity as it relates to architectural significance.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features

include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The resource continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style including a flat roof with a tile-trim and a gabled red clay tile roof at the front; stucco cladding; round clay tile attic vent; large arched focal windows; asymmetrical primary façade; arched entry wood door; and fenestration primarily of multi-lite and single-lite wood windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that Union Trust Company of San Diego Spec House #1 located at 4369 Argos Drive be designated as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style architecture and retains integrity. The designation excludes the garage conversion and southeast wing addition constructed outside of the period of significance.

Shannon Anthony Junior Planner

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner

SA/ss

Attachments:

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 6/27/2019

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 6/27/2019, to consider the historical designation of the **Union Trust Company of San Diego Spec House #1** (owned by Stuart and Sharon Rosenberg, 26 Fawn Court, Middletown, NY, CA 10940) located at **4369 Argos Drive**, **San Diego**, **CA 92116**, APN: **465-281-04-00**, further described as LOT 392 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as $\bf Site$ $\bf No. 0$, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Union Trust Company of San Diego Spec House #1 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1926 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a flat roof with a tile-trim and a gabled red clay tile roof at the front; stucco cladding; round clay tile attic vent; large arched focal windows; asymmetrical primary façade; arched entry wood door; and fenestration primarily of multi-lite and single-lite wood windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.**

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the garage conversion and southeast wing addition constructed outside of the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

_		
Vote: N/A		
	BY:	
	DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Cha Historical Resources Board	
APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,		•
AFFINOVED. IVIANA VV. ELLIOTT,		
CITY ATTORNEY	BY:	
	LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,	
	Deputy City Attorney	