



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

## Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: July 11, 2019 REPORT NO. HRB-19-029

HEARING DATE: July 25, 2019

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – Frank and Isabel Young House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Matthew and Kristin Kirk represented by Legacy 106, Inc

LOCATION: 3065 Ivy Street, 92104, Golden Hill Community, Council District 3  
APN 539-161-10-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Frank and Isabel Young House located at 3065 Ivy Street as a historical resource.

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Frank and Isabel Young House located at 3065 Ivy Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1911 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear 55 square foot porch enclosure and the detached garage which were constructed outside the 1911 period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1911 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a partial width front porch, smooth square columns over a sided balustrade, narrow and wide wood siding, cedar shingles, and fenestration consisting primarily of wood double hung and fixed windows.

### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is located in the South Park neighborhood of the Greater Golden Hill Community Plan Area. The narrow width parcel features a single-family residence with a detached garage.

The property was located within the boundary of the Golden Hill Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey (2016) but was not identified in the survey because it was not evaluated.

The historic name of the resource, the Frank and Isabel Young House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Frank and Isabel Young, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

### ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows

*CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject property is made of wood frame construction on a raised concrete foundation. The primary facade features a medium pitch front gabled roof with wide enclosed eaves and a decorative cornice band beneath. A partial width front porch with smooth square columns atop a sided balustrade supports the main gable pediment. The front entrance is centrally located between a large decorative lite fixed wood window and a tripartite wood window. The east elevation of the property features a small protrusion with tripartite wood windows as well as a stepped brick chimney. The west elevation features a smaller protrusion with two double hung wood windows as well as three square fixed windows and one diamond shaped fixed window closer to the rear. The rear of the property features wood windows and siding, a small enclosed porch, an open patio with a shed roof. The entire property features wide wood siding along the first floor, narrower wood siding along the attic level and cedar shingles in the main gabled end. The fenestration on the property is primarily double hung and fixed wood windows

Modifications to the property are minimal and include a rear 55 square foot porch enclosure, an added rear open patio with a shed roof. Additionally, three windows located on the rear of the property have been replaced with aluminum windows, but within their existing openings. Lastly, due to modifications and the initial later date of construction, the detached garage is not included in the designation. Overall, these modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; multiple roof planes; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; decorative attic vents; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style. Specifically, the resource features a partial width front porch, smooth square columns over a sided balustrade, narrow and wide wood siding, cedar shingles, and fenestration consisting primarily of wood double hung and fixed windows.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Frank and Isabel Young House located at 3065 Ivy Street be designated with a period of significance of 1911 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear 55 square foot porch enclosure and the detached garage which were constructed outside the 1911 period of significance.



Emma Haggerty  
Assistant Planner



Suzanne Segur  
Senior Planner

EH/ss

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A  
ADOPTED ON 7/25/2019

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 7/25/2019, to consider the historical designation of the Frank and Isabel Young House (owned by Matthew and Kristin Kirk, 3065 Ivy Street, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **3065 Ivy Street, San Diego, CA 92104**, APN: **539-161-10-00**, further described as BLK 4 LOTS 31 & 32 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Frank and Isabel Young House on the following findings:

The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1911 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a partial width front porch, smooth square columns over a sided balustrade, narrow and wide wood siding, cedar shingles, and fenestration consisting primarily of wood double hung and fixed windows.

This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the rear 55 square foot porch enclosure and the detached garage which were constructed outside the 1911 period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair  
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,  
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,  
Deputy City Attorney