

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JULY 25, 2019
CIVIC SAN DIEGO BOARDROOM
401 B STREET, SUITE 400, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair McCullough at 1:02 PM

Chairperson	David McCullough	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Tim Hutter	Present
2 nd Vice-Chairperson	Courtney Ann Coyle	Present
Boardmember	Andrew Bowen	Present
Boardmember	Charlie Colvin	Absent
Boardmember	Diana Cordileone	Present <i>arrived at 1:05PM</i>
Boardmember	Amy Harleman	Present
Boardmember	Todd Pitman	Absent
Boardmember	Cindy Stankowski	Present
Boardmember	Mathew Winter	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Sheila Santos, Board Secretary
Kelley Stanco, Project Manager, Planning
Suzanne Segur, Senior Planner, Board Liaison
Shannon Anthony, Junior Planner
Emma Haggerty, Assistant Planner
Lea Kolesky, Management Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Lindsey Sebastian, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR JUNE 27, 2019

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR HUTTER TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR JUNE 27, 2019 AS WRITTEN.

Seconded by Boardmember Bowen

Vote: 7-0-1
(Coyle)

Motion Passes

ITEM 2 - NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• GENERAL INFORMATION

- Correspondence for Item 5 from SOHO
- Correspondence for Item 8 from Scott Moomjian
- HRB Criteria Guidelines
- Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

• GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

• CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Boardmembers Harleman and Winter had a conflict of interest for Item 8 – Coliseum Athletic Club and recused themselves from any discussion and vote.

Boardmember Coyle knows the owners of item 8 – Coliseum Athletic Club, but does not have a conflict on this item and it will not have any impact on her vote.

• EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

• FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

• HISTORICAL RESOURCES SECTION, DSD

None

• HISTORIC PRESERVATION PLANNING SECTION, PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Kelley Stanco, Planning Department Representative

- The City Council considered the first phase of the 12th update at its meeting on Tuesday. You may recall the 12th update included an amendment to allow withdraw of Historic Designation appeals and the Council did approve the 12th update. There will be a second reading on August 6 after which time the update will be effective outside the coastal zone and then we are anticipating submittal to the Coastal Commission for approval in September of this year. That's good news. The amendment does apply retroactively, so existing appeals that wish to withdraw will be able to do so. Thank you.

D. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT OUT

- **POLICY**

Report out by Shannon Anthony

The next regularly scheduled Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held Monday, August 12, 2019 at 3:00pm in the Training Room of the 4th Floor of Development Services.

- **DESIGN ASSISTANCE**

Report out by Suzanne Segur

The August 7th DAS meeting will be cancelled due to lack of items, but the next regularly scheduled meeting will be held Wednesday, September 4, 2019, at 4:00pm in Conference Room 5C on the 5th floor of Development Services.

- **ARCHAEOLOGICAL AND TRIBAL CULTURAL RESOURCES**

Report out by Emma Haggerty

The next regularly scheduled Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, August 12, 2019, at 4:00pm in the Training Room on the 4th Floor of Development Services.

E. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The applicant for Item 8 – 1485 E Street is requesting a 90-day continuance to the October 24 agenda.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR MCCULLOUGH TO CONTINUE ITEM 8 – 1485 E STREET TO THE OCTOBER 24, 2019 AGENDA.

Seconded by Vice-Chair Hutter

Vote: 7-0-2

Motion Passes

(Harleman, Winter)

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 6 – THOMAS SHARPE / JOEL BROWN SPEC HOUSE #1 *located at 1020 West Montecito Way*

ITEM 7 – FRANK AND ISABEL YOUNG HOUSE *located at 3065 Ivy Street*

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARLEMAN TO APPROVED ITEMS 6 AND 7 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMNDATIONS.

Seconded by Boardmember Winter

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – ASARO APARTMENTS

Continued from May 2019

Applicant: Trestle Development LLC represented by Marie Burke Lia

Owner: Franks Daughter LLC

Location: 2027 – 2045 India Street, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (**1288 1-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2027 – 2045 India Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Asaro Apartments located at 2027-2033 and 2043-2045 India Street as historical resources with a period of significance of circa 1908 under HRB Criteria C.

Report Number: Staff memo dated July 11, 2019 and HRB 19-019

Staff Report by Emma Haggerty

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Amie Hayes, Alexandra Wallace, Kiley Wallace, James Bregante

In Opposition: Jennifer Ayala, Amanda Daghaly, Marie Lia, Margaret Terzoli, Jennie Asaro, Carmella Giacalone, Zaheen Chowdhury, Cody Charfauros, Sharon Gehl

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – ASARO APARTMENTS PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Cordileone

Vote: 5-4-0

Motion Fails

(McCullough, Hutter, Harleman, Winter)

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – ASARO APARTMENTS UNDER HRB CRITERIA A AS A RESOURCE THAT EXEMPLIFIES OR REFLECTS A SPECIAL ELEMENT OF LITTLE ITALY'S CULTURAL DEVELOPMENT WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1948-1970. MORE SPECIFICALLY THE RESOURCES MOVED FROM ELSEWHERE IN DOWNTOWN TO LITTLE ITALY IN 1948. RECYCLED THE BUILDING AND SUPPORTED THE ITALIAN AMERICAN IMMIGRANT COMMUNITY AND NOTING THAT THE TENANTS OF THESE RESOURCES WERE PREDOMINANTLY OF ITALIAN DESCENT SHARING SIMILAR VALUE SYSTEM AND RELIGIOUS BELIEFS WHICH WAS A KEY COMPONENT TO THE CONTINUED CULTURAL DEVELOPMENT OF LITTLE ITALY, WHICH WAS ITALIANS WORKING AND LIVING TOGETHER INCLUDING WORK FORCE HOUSING.

Seconded by Boardmember Stankowski

Vote: 4-5-0

Motion Fails

(McCullough, Hutter, Bowen, Harleman, Winter)

ITEM 6 – THOMAS SHARPE / JOEL BROWN SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Rafael Nunez and Elizabeth Beringer represented by Allen Hazard and Janet O’Dea

Location: 1020 West Montecito Way, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 5-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1020 West Montecito Way as a historical resource.

Today’s Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Thomas Sharpe/Joel Brown Spec House #1 located at 1020 West Montecito Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1910 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the 2012 detached playroom structure and the 1980 and 2017 rear additions constructed outside the period of significance.

Report Number: HRB 19-028

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 7 – FRANK AND ISABEL YOUNG HOUSE

Applicant: Matthew and Kristin Kirk represented by Legacy 106, Inc

Location: 3065 Ivy Street, 92104, Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 (**1289 1-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3065 Ivy Street as a historical resource.

Today’s Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Frank and Isabel Young House located at 3065 Ivy Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1911 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear 55 square foot porch enclosure and the detached garage which were constructed outside the 1911 period of significance.

Report Number: HRB 19-029

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 8 – COLISEUM ATHLETIC CLUB

Applicant: SD Coliseum MQ, LLC represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Owner: Navarra 1401-85 E Street-LP

Location: 1485 E Street, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (**1289 3-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1485 E Street as a historical resource.

Today’s Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Coliseum Athletic Club located at 1485 E Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1924 to 1979 under HRB Criterion A.

Report Number: Staff memo dated July 11, 2019 and HRB 17-071

ITEM WAS CONTINUED TO THE OCTOBER 2019 AGENDA AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:

Thursday, August 22, 2019

LOCATION:

Civic San Diego Board Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 2:23 PM