



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 12, 2019 REPORT NO. HRB-19-035

HEARING DATE: September 26, 2019

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – John Cordrey Spec House #1**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Park Pacifica LLC; represented by Brian F. Smith and Associates, Inc.

LOCATION: 3925-3927 Illinois Street, North Park Community, Council District 3
APN 446-431-13-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the John Cordrey Spec House #1 located at 3925-3927 Illinois Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the John Cordrey Spec House #1 located at 3927 Illinois Street as a historical resource with a 1916 period of significance under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the c. 1926 apartment building at 3925-3925 ½ Illinois Street located in the rear of the parcel. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1916 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a medium pitched gable roof with wide, overhanging eaves; multiple roof planes; a partial width porch with tapered wood columns on stuccoed piers; horizontal wood siding; wood shingles; decorative beams and attic vents; and fenestration consisting of double hung, wood windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application to determine whether or not the building is historically significant as part of a constraints analysis for future development. The subject resource is a single-family Craftsman style residence located near the commercial district of University Avenue within North Park.

The property was located within the boundary of the 2016 North Park Community Plan Update, but was not identified in the survey because it was not evaluated.

The historic name of the resource, the John Cordrey Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of John Cordrey, who constructed the house as a speculation house

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Brian F. Smith and Associates, which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff concurs that the rear structure, 3925-3925 ½ Illinois Street is not significant under any HRB Criteria; however, staff finds that the resource located at 3927 Illinois Street is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 3925-3927 Illinois Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or North Park's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 3925-3927 Illinois Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource, 3927 Illinois Street, is a one-story single-family residence constructed in 1916 in the Craftsman style. The house features medium pitched, gable roofs with a wide eave overhang on both the main massing and porch. The partial width front porch is supported by tapered wood columns on stucco piers and is elaborated by a decorative attic vent. The house features a number of original double hung wood windows. The subject resource is covered in horizontal wood along the first floor and wood shingles in the gable ends of the roof.

Modifications are minor and include the unpermitted window modification on the north elevation completed between 2011-2015, the unpermitted chimney removal completed in 2017 on the south elevation, and non-original tile and banister added to the front porch. Overall, these modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling.

While the rear c. 1926 structure located at 3925-3925 ½ Illinois Street features Craftsman details such as decorative attic vents and beams, horizontal wood siding, and fenestration including double

hung and fixed wood windows, it does not rise to the level of significance to be individual eligible for historic designation and is therefore excluded from the designation.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; multiple roof planes; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; decorative attic vents; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1916 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a medium pitched gable roof with wide, overhanging eaves; multiple roof planes; a partial width porch with tapered wood columns on stuccoed piers; horizontal wood siding; wood shingles; decorative beams, cornice bands, and attic vents; and fenestration consisting of double hung, wood windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Research into the construction of the property at 3925-3927 Illinois Street failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 3925-3927 Illinois Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 3925-3927 Illinois Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the John Cordrey Spec House #1 located at 3927 Illinois Street be designated with a period of significance of 1916 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Craftsman style. The designation excludes the c. 1926 apartment building at 3925-3925 ½ Illinois Street located in the rear of the parcel.



Emma Haggerty
Assistant Planner



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner
Development Services Department

EH/ss

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 9/26/2019

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 9/26/2019, to consider the historical designation of the John Cordrey Spec House #1 (owned by Park Pacifica LLC, 3625 Del Mar Heights Road #274, San Diego, CA 92130) located at **3925 - 3927 Illinois Street, San Diego, CA 92104**, APN: **446-431-13-00**, further described as BLK 209 LOT 19 LOT 18 & N 1/2 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the John Cordrey Spec House #1 on the following findings:

The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1916 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a medium pitched gable roof with wide, overhanging eaves; multiple roof planes; a partial width porch with tapered wood columns on stuccoed piers; horizontal wood siding; wood shingles; decorative beams and attic vents; and fenestration consisting of double hung, wood windows.

This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the c. 1926 apartment building at 3925-3925 1/2 Illinois Street located in the rear of the parcel.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney