

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	October 10, 2019	REPORT NO. HRB-19-040
HEARING DATE:	October 24, 2019	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #7 – The Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/Dodge Construction Company Spec House #2	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link	
APPLICANT:	Henderson Family Trust; represented by Vonn Marie May	
LOCATION:	4624 Granger Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 APN 530-040-19-00	
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Lewis and Ar Dodge Construction Company Spec House # as a historical resource.	0
STAFF RECOMMENDATION		

Designate the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/ Dodge Construction Company Spec House #2 located at 4624 Granger Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the modified detached garage. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

- 1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a stuccoed exterior on an asymmetrical façade, clay tile roofing, large multi and single lite wood windows, and decorative clay attic vents.
- 2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Architect, Charles H. Salyers, and Master Builder, Lewis H. Dodge of the Dodge Construction Company. The property retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource features one of the earliest examples of their one and two-story, T shaped design with a corner rounded entrance.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject parcel is located in the Peninsula community near Sunset Cliffs and contains a single-family residence with a detached garage.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/ Dodge Construction Company Spec House #2, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Lewis and Annie Dodge who constructed the house as a speculation house and the name of Charles H. Salyers, a Master Architect and Lewis H. Dodge of the Dodge Construction Company, a Master Builder.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Vonn Marie May which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

Constructed in 1927, the one and two-story house features a gable roof with clay tile and shallow eaves. The exterior of the house is sheathed with stucco and features fenestration consisting of multi and single lite casement, double hung, and fixed wooden windows. The southern portion of the house is one story and is perpendicular to the two-story section. The one-story portion features a tripartite window comprised of a large fixed window flanked by casement windows.

Modifications to the property are minimal and include the replacement of the front walkway with flagstone as well as changes to the entryway staircase between 2015-2017. Additional modifications include the newer stucco which although it is more modern, is likely close to the original texture, which was completed at an unknown date. Permitted modifications reviewed and deemed consistent with the U.S Secretary of Interior's Standards by Historical Resources staff in 2018 include the addition of French doors on the rear and the open balcony conversion to transparent habitable space with windows in the existing archways. These modifications do not impair the overall integrity of the property's location, design, materials, workmanship, feeling and association.

Photographic documentation of the original window frame within the report provides evidence that the windows on the first floor were likely always single lite and did not have divided lites as depicted in the provided elevation renderings within the report as to not obstruct the property's views of the Pacific Ocean.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the

predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, and unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a stuccoed exterior on an asymmetrical façade, clay tile roofing, large multi and single lite wood windows, and decorative clay attic vents. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property was designed by Charles Salyers and constructed by Lewis H. Dodge of the Dodge Construction Company in 1927. The house is representative of an early example of the collaboration between the two partners.

Born in 1900, Charles Salyers first arrived in San Diego at the age of nine. As a young man, he actively engaged in the local building industry, at which time he became skilled in the design and construction of private homes. In 1927, Salyers was hired as the development architectural designer for Gibson City, prior to becoming a licensed architect. This important commission provides insight into the early phase of his career, and demonstrates that he was already viewed as a skilled architectural designer. Seeking to advance his profession, he was granted an architect's license in 1932, and was thereafter recognized as a prolific residential designer. In 1935, he was selected to design the home of businessman Paul E. Stake which, to this day, serves as a rare and intriguing domestic interpretation of the Streamline Moderne style. It is for this home, HRB Site #356, that Salyers was established as a Master Architect.

Already an accomplished builder and architect, Salyers further expanded his repertoire through the pursuit of a career in public administration. In 1941, he was recruited by officials at the newly founded County Surveyor's Office to serve as their first Chief Building Inspector. He relinquished his position in 1948, though, when Governor Earl Warren appointed him Chief of the State Division of Housing. After serving in this capacity for two years, he returned to his home in San Diego, where he proceeded to design and construct single-family homes.

Salyers retired from practice in 1966 – after a career that spanned nearly forty years – and spent his later years managing apartment complexes throughout the city. While he was no longer at the forefront of public affairs, he did earn a considerable degree of notoriety when, in an unprecedented move, he successfully relocated an entire apartment building from Point Loma to Golden Hill. He remained in San Diego until his death in 1974.

Master Builder Lewis Henry Dodge was a third generation learned carpenter and builder, first apprenticing with his father then later working as a professional builder from 1891 until his death in

1934. Arriving in San Diego in 1923 with his son Edward Lewis Dodge, they established their construction company that would produce over 42 residences in the Tudor, Dutch Colonial, English, Mission, and Spanish Colonial Revival styles. The designation of the Lewis and Annie Dodge /Dodge Construction Company House (HRB Site #1192) established Lewis Dodge/Dodge Construction Company as a Master Builder.

Dodge Construction Company was recognized as a building company of high quality and craftsmanship in the San Diego Union and Evening Tribune newspapers as well as by developer John P. Mills Organization. His company was chosen to represent the newly developed Sunset Cliffs subdivision, by building a showcase home for W.S. Mills, the sales manager for the John P. Mills Organization. Lewis's showcase home was featured in the 1926 celebration of "Better Homes" week in the newspapers. The "Better Homes" section of the newspaper was inspired by the Better Homes Movement, a national drive to build better quality affordable homes with progressive design features. It was driven by the ideology of providing good design and quality construction for all social and economic levels. On May 10, 1925, Kensington Park put an advertisement of the newly designed homes to be expected within the neighborhood. Three of the five homes within the article were built by the Dodge Construction Company; two Spanish styled and one Dutch Colonial home, all located on Biona Drive. Dodge Construction Company was cited many times in the "Better Homes" section of the newspaper for his work in Kensington and Sunset Cliffs.

<u>Significance Statement:</u> The subject resource showcases the collaboration between Master Architect Charles Salyers and Master Builder Lewis H. Dodge of the Dodge Construction Company and the house continues to retain a good level of integrity of their original design. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion D as a notable work of Master Architect Charles Salyers and Master Builder Lewis H. Dodge of the Dodge Construction Company.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/ Dodge Construction Company Spec House #2 located at 4624 Granger Street be designated with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Spanish Eclectic style and Criterion D as a notable example of the work of Master Architect Charles Salyers and Master Builder Lewis H. Dodge of the Dodge Construction Company. The designation excludes the modified detached garage.

mma

Emma Haggerty Assistant Planner

EH/ss

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

Suzanne Segur

Senior Planner

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 10/24/2019

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 10/24/2019, to consider the historical designation of the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/ Dodge Construction Company Spec House #2 (owned by Henderson Family Trust 05-30-18, 4624 Granger Street, San Diego, CA 92107) located at **4624 Granger Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92107**, APN: **530-040-19-00**, further described as BLK 10 LOT 19 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/ Dodge Construction Company Spec House #2 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a stuccoed exterior on an asymmetrical façade, clay tile roofing, large multi and single lite wood windows, and decorative clay attic vents. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Architect, Charles H. Salyers, and Master Builder, Lewis H. Dodge of the Dodge Construction Company. The property retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource features one of the earliest examples of their one and two-story, T shaped design with a corner rounded entrance. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the modified detached garage

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY:

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney