



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: October 10, 2019 REPORT NO. HRB-19-041

HEARING DATE: October 29, 2019

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 – H.B. and Helen Silvey House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Matthew and Kerri Stucky

LOCATION: 2506 33rd Street, North Park Community, Council District 3
APN 539-052-0700

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the H.B. and Helen Silvey House located at 2506 33rd Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the H.B. and Helen Silvey House located at 2506 33rd Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear second story addition constructed outside of the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Tudor Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1926 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a steeply pitched gable roof with a prominent front facing gable, gable dormers, stucco and brick veneer exterior, diamond pane wood windows, arched focal window, massive brick chimney and Tudor arch entry door and wing wall.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a single family residence and garage located on a corner lot in Burlingame Manor.

The property was located within the boundary of the 2016 North Park Community Plan Update, but was not identified in the survey because it was not evaluated.

The historic name of the resource, the H.B. and Helen Silvey House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of H.B. and Helen Silvey, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Matthew Stucky, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A, C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not HRB Criterion A and D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The applicant asserts that the subject resource reflects a special element of the development of Burlingame Manor's development; however, staff disagrees. The house located at 2506 33rd Street was the third property constructed in Burlingame Manor and the Historical Resources Research Report (HRRR) argues that it is the oldest house with historic integrity in the tract. The second property constructed in the tract is 2405 32nd Street which is historically designated as HRB #608 making the 2405 33rd Street property the oldest in the tract with historic integrity. The HRRR also asserts that the property is significant under Criterion A for exemplifying and reflecting Burlingame Manor's architectural development through the use of eclectic styles. The use of eclectic styles is not unique to Burlingame Manor and the property is not the only example of the Tudor Revival style in the tract. The subject resource does not exemplify or reflect a special element of North Park or Burlingame Manor's development; therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 2506 33rd Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a two story, single family residence constructed in the Tudor Revival style in 1926. The primary façade is dominated by a steeply pitched, front facing gable roof connecting to a secondary side gabled roof with dormers. The structure exhibits a stucco exterior with a brick veneer in a running bond pattern below. Fenestration includes double hung wood diamond pane windows and an arched focal window with decorative quoining that dominates the front façade. The main entrance consists of a wooden door in the shape of a Tudor arch with a brick surround. A wing wall with another Tudor arch serves as an entrance to the rear yard and a massive brick

chimney with decorative chimney pots is located on the south façade. At the rear of the lot is a garage also constructed in 1926.

Several modifications have been made to the subject resource since its construction in 1926. An addition completed in 1966 created a full second story at the rear of the house. During the construction of this addition a deck ledger and exterior door were added; however, a deck was never constructed. In 2016 historical resources staff approved the modification of rear window openings as consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. These modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling.

Popular in the 1920s and 1930s, Tudor Revival architecture is loosely based on a variety of late Medieval English styles and influences, but unlike some English prototypes, Tudor Revival style houses exhibit steeply pitched gable roofs that dominate the facades. Other character defining features include decorative half-timbering; tall, narrow windows, usually appearing in multiple groups and with multi-pane glazing; massive chimneys, sometimes with decorative chimney pots; entry porches with round or Tudor arches; and gable dormers. Relatively uncommon before World War I, widespread adoption of masonry veneering techniques in the 1920s accompanied a dramatic rise in the style's popularity as even the most modest examples began to closely mimic the brick and stone veneers of their English prototypes. Tudor Revival style houses usually include the use of stucco as well as wood cladding and brick or stone veneer, depending upon the subtype.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Tudor Revival style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a steeply pitched gable roof with a prominent front facing gable, gable dormers, stucco and brick veneer exterior, diamond pane wood windows, arched focal window, massive brick chimney and Tudor arch entry door and wing wall. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The Historical Resources Research Report asserts that Richard Ruplinger constructed the subject resource in 1926. The 2016 North Park Community Plan update erroneously lists Ruplinger as a Master Builder; however, he has never been formally established as a Master through the process outlined in the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*.

The current report does not contain sufficient information to designate Ruplinger as a Master Builder at this time. In order to establish a Master, there must be a thorough understanding and analysis of their overall body of work. More information regarding the properties constructed by Ruplinger would be needed to evaluate the significance of his work. Additionally, Ruplinger was associated with the Mutual Construction Company and it is hard to distinguish which properties he was associated with during his duration at the company. The Mutual Construction Company may be a better candidate for Master Builder than Ruplinger as an individual. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 2506 33rd Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 2506 33rd Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the H.B. and Helen Silvey House located at 2506 33rd Street be designated with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Tudor Revival style. The designation excludes the rear second story addition constructed outside of the period of significance.



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner

SS:ss

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 10/24/2019

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 10/24/2019, to consider the historical designation of the H.B. and Helen Silvey House (owned by Matthew and Kerri Strucky, 2506 33rd Street, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **2506 33rd Street, San Diego, CA 92104**, APN: **539-052-07-00**, further described as BLK 16 LOT 12 S 45 FT in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the H.B. and Helen Silvey House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Tudor Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1926 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a steeply pitched gable roof with a prominent front facing gable, gable dormers, stucco and brick veneer exterior, diamond pane wood windows, arched focal window, massive brick chimney and Tudor arch entry door and wing wall. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the rear second story addition constructed outside of the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney