



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 7, 2019 REPORT NO. HRB 19-044

HEARING DATE: November 21, 2019

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – 1025 Devonshire Drive**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Edward C Voss III and Gabrielle Voss represented by Urbana Preservation & Planning, LLC.

LOCATION: 1025 Devonshire Drive, Peninsula Community, Council District 2
APN 531-030-10-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 1025 Devonshire Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 1025 Devonshire Drive under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is a single-story single-family home with a detached garage located on APN 531-030-10-00 in the Sunset Cliffs subdivision of the Peninsula community. The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Urbana Preservation & Planning, LLC., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A and C. Staff disagrees, and finds that the building is not eligible under any HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity. This determination is consistent with the [Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria](#), as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The applicant asserts that the subject resource reflects a special element of the early development of the Sunset Cliffs tract, however, staff disagrees. 1025 Devonshire Drive was the eleventh home constructed in the Sunset Cliffs subdivision. The subject resource appears to only reflect early development in the subdivision, and does not do so to any greater extent than other early homes. There is no documentation to show that this home was intended to serve as a model for the tract or to stimulate development. It was not commissioned by the tract developers, nor was it featured in ads or articles promoting the Sunset Cliffs subdivision. Genevieve Howard commissioned Glen Funcheon to design and build the subject property as her personal residence. This is not sufficient for eligibility under Criterion A, which requires that a property reflect a special element of a community's development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 1025 Devonshire Drive did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The resource is a single-story single-family home with a detached garage constructed in 1927 in the Spanish Eclectic style and features gable roofs with clay tile, overhanging eaves and exposed rafter tails, moderately textured stucco over wood frame construction; and a concrete foundation. The building's floor plan is "U" shaped around a central courtyard, set in a west-east orientation. The main entry faces southwest and is marked by a round turret element with a recessed arched entry door. Features include: gable vents in sets of three, decorative stucco vents, decorative window grill and a stucco chimney with decorative brickwork at the top. Fenestration is primarily of multi-lite and single-lite wood casement and double hung windows. The original garage is located at the rear of the property. A second story guest house was added to the existing garage in 2015.

Modifications include the installation of brick pavers and the removal of the original fountain in the courtyard circa 1970. Between 2011 and 2015, the following modifications occurred on the front façade (west elevation): installation of a wooden deck; installation of a retaining wall below the front deck; the front focal window was replaced with metal framed French doors and side lites in the original arched opening; replacement of the original decorative wood paneled front entry door with a glass door in the original arched opening and installation of a decorative wrought-iron door over the glass door; and new steps, walkway and block retaining wall. Additional work completed between 2011 and 2015 includes: replacement of the original divided lite glazing to single lite glazing on the French doors at the east elevation in the interior courtyard; and a new second story Guest Quarters, over the existing garage, terrace and balcony with a masonry fence were approved by Staff as Consistent with the Secretary of Interior Standards. In 2019, the block retaining wall was reduced in height and a new secondary retaining wall was added behind at the west elevation.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

As originally constructed, the subject resource exhibited the significant features of Spanish Eclectic architecture and continues to retain many of those features. However, the cumulative effect of the overall modifications and the prominent nature of several of these modifications including: the addition of a front deck; the retaining wall beneath the front deck; replacement of the front focal window with new metal French doors and side lites; replacement of the original decorative wood arched front entry door with a new glass front door and new decorative wrought-iron door; and new front entry steps and walkway, have significantly impaired the building's integrity of design, materials, workmanship and feeling to the point that the building is no longer eligible under HRB Criterion C. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The Historical Resources Research Report asserts that the subject resource would be significant under Criterion D should Glen Funcheon be designated as a Master Builder by the HRB. The current report does not include sufficient information to designate Funcheon as a Master Builder at this time. In order to establish a Master, there must be a thorough understanding and analysis of their overall body of work. More information regarding the properties constructed by Funcheon would be needed to evaluate the significance of his work. Therefore, staff cannot recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 1025 Devonshire Drive has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 1025 Devonshire Drive is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the property located at 1025 Devonshire Dive not be designated under any HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.


Shannon Anthony
Junior Planner


Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison

SA/ss

Attachments:

1. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover