



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

## Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 9, 2020 REPORT NO. HRB-20-002

HEARING DATE: January 23, 2020

SUBJECT: **ITEM #11 – Asa and Ora Casady House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Parkcrest Properties, LLC, represented by Vonn Marie May

LOCATION: 3933-3939 Georgia Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3  
APN 445-671-10-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Asa E. Casady House located at 3935 Georgia Street as a historical resource.

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Asa and Ora Casady House located at 3935 Georgia Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C. The other structures on the parcel, 3933 and 3939 Georgia Street and the centered protruding addition on the east elevation shall be excluded. The detached garage built in 1925 shall be included in the designation. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of the Mission Revival style with Spanish Colonial Revival influence and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1925 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a shaped Mission revival style roof parapet, red clay Mission tiles, porch roof supported by square piers, stucco exterior, double hung wood windows, curved raised stucco border detail above focal windows, a recessed entry porch with segmental arch, and clay tile vents.

### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed building modification or demolition of a structure of 45 years or more, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212. 3935 Georgia Street was previously reviewed by City HRB staff in accordance with SDMC Section 143.0212 under Project# 638586 on May 28, 2019 and it was determined that a site-specific historic research report was required. Two other homes at 3933 and 3939 Georgia St have been previously reviewed by HRB staff and were deemed not to be historically significant, and are not the subject of this staff report.

The property was located within the boundary of the 2016 Uptown Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey Report but was not identified in the survey because the property was not evaluated. This does not preclude the property from being individually eligible for designation. The property is a one-story single-family residence located in North Park. The primary façade faces Georgia Street.

The historic name of the resource, the Asa and Ora Casady House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Asa and Ora Casady, who constructed the house as their personal residence in 1925.

## ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Vonn Marie May, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

*CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The resource is a modest one-story simple square form, single-family residence constructed in 1925 in the Mission Revival style with Spanish Eclectic influence. In the Consultant report, the property is identified as being Mission Revival, a variation of Spanish Colonial Revival. Staff believes the property is a transitional example that shares elements of the distinct Mission Revival and Spanish Colonial Revival styles. The exterior finish is the original medium pebble dash stucco finish and texture. The house features a flat composition shingle roof with a Mission Revival style parapet on the front elevation only, and a small red tile shed roof at a segmental arched entry porch. All windows, sashes and sills are original wood, either double-hung or casement, except for a single vinyl window on the garage. On the South Elevation is an exterior dominant stucco chimney. A detached, single-car, simple rectangular form stucco garage was built at the same time as the home and is included in the designation. A low stucco retaining wall borders the front yard of the property.

In *A Field Guide to American Houses* (2017), McAlester indicates that California was the birthplace of the Mission style. By 1900 houses in the Mission style were spreading eastward under the influence of fashionable architects and national builders' magazines [...] Mission Revival received further impetus when the Santa Fe and Southern Pacific railways adopted the style for stations and resort hotels. The shape of the roof parapet on the primary facade is illustrated in McAlester as a "revival" example, rather than a replica of an original Mission parapet style.

Before 1920, houses of Hispanic precedent were based on simple early Spanish missions. The Spanish Revival style became popularized after the Panama-California Exposition of 1915 and reached its height in the 1920's and early 1930's. Features of the style that are reflected in the subject property include red tile roof covering, stucco exterior, an arched entryway, arched brows over principle windows, and decorative clay vents. With elements of both styles, this home exemplifies the transition between the Mission Revival and Spanish Colonial Revival styles.

On the East Elevation is a centered protruding rectangular room, which is likely an unpermitted addition. While the addition was added prior to 1950 and presumed to have been added by A. E. Casady and features, original windows, it was constructed after 1925 outside of the period of significance and its construction date is unknown. The door is facing a different position than what

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

Attachment(s):

JK/ss

Jamie Kennedy  
Senior Planner

Suzanne Segur  
Senior Planner  
Development Services Department

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Asa and Ora Casady House located at 3935 Georgia Street be designated with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that exhibits the distinctive characteristics of the Mission Revival style with Spanish Colonial Revival influence. The designation excludes, the other structures on the parcel, 3933 and 3939 Georgia Street and the centered protruding addition on the east elevation which was constructed outside the period of significance. The designation includes the detached garage built in 1925.

CONCLUSION

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

an original rear door would have been facing. The addition is excluded from this designation because it was constructed outside of the period of significance. Fabric awnings have been added to over the windows on the west elevation. Contemporary security bars have been added to the entry porch. The tile floor and entry stairs are a contemporary paving scheme. Contemporary tall ornamental iron fencing surrounds the front yard, access to the rear yard from the driveway and garage, and along the South Elevation. The modifications to the property do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship, or feeling, and the building retains integrity as it relates to architectural significance.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Mission Revival style with Spanish Colonial Revival influence by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style including a shaped Mission revival style roof parapet, red clay Mission tiles, porch roof supported by square piers, stucco exterior, double hung wood windows, curved raised stucco border detail above focal windows, a recessed entry porch with segmental arch, and clay tile vents. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A  
ADOPTED ON 1/23/2020

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/23/2020, to consider the historical designation of the **Asa and Ora Casady House** (owned by Parkcrest Properties, LLC) located at **3935 Georgia Street, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **445-671-10-I00**, further described as Lots 15 and 16, in Block 195 of University Heights, in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Asa and Ora Casady House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Mission Revival style with Spanish Colonial Revival influence and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1925 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a shaped Mission revival style roof parapet, red clay Mission tiles, porch roof supported by square piers, stucco exterior, double hung wood windows, curved raised stucco border detail above focal windows, a recessed entry porch with segmental arch, and clay tile vents. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall include the detached garage built in 1925.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude 3933 and 3939 Georgia Street and the centered protruding addition on the east elevation constructed outside the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair  
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,

CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,  
Deputy City Attorney

DRAFT