

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	January 9, 2020	REPORT NO. HRB-20-004
HEARING DATE:	January 23, 2020	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #12 – Ida Kuhn Spec House #1	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Invento	ory Database (CHRID) link
APPLICANT:	Joseph Gary Beagin and Mary P. Beagi	n; represented by Legacy 106, Inc.
LOCATION:	3450 Kite Street, 92103, Uptown Comr APN 451-342-07-00	nunity, Council District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Ida Ku Street as a historical resource.	uhn Spec House #1 located at 3450 Kite

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Ida Kuhn Spec House #1 located at 3450 Kite Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C. The original California art tile fireplace shall be included in the designation, while the rear second floor addition, detached garage, detached laundry/storage room, and detached rear garden shed shall be excluded. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of characterdefining features of the Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1926 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical façade with a complex roof form covered in red clay Mission tiles; eaves with little to no overhang; a distinctive stucco exterior; decorative clay tile vents; a covered porch with arched entryway; inset arches above windows; and decorative ironwork.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is a two-story single-family residence located in Mission Hills. The home is situated on a hilltop lot and the primary façade faces Kite Street.

The property was identified in the 2016 Uptown Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey Report and given a Status Code of 5S3, "Appears to be individually eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the Ida Kuhn Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Ida Kuhn, who constructed the house as a speculation house in 1926.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The resource is a two-story single-family home constructed in 1926 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The home has an asymmetrical massing and is clad in a decorative pebble dash style stucco. The home's complex roof forms are covered in half-barrel, Mission-style red clay tile. The primary façade features a hipped-roof covered porch with a stepped shoulder arch entryway. The recessed entry has a solid wooden front door which retains its original brass hardware.

Round clay tile attic vents are found on both the first and second stories, while hooded rectangular vents are seen on the second story only. Fenestration varies throughout but consists primarily of double-hung wood windows. Window openings are topped by decorative inset arches with rounded soft reveals on all elevations. Wrought iron window box holders with decorative stanchions are visible on the first and second levels of the east elevation. The subject resource also retains its original California art tile fireplace. Located in the living room, the fireplace and hearth feature five scenic relief tiles. This interior element retains architectural significance and is included in the designation.

One modification to the property includes a second-story rear addition which was built after the 1926 period of significance and is excluded from the designation. The property also features three detached structures that are all excluded from the designation. The home's original detached garage has been heavily modified with an addition on its east side and is thus excluded from designation. A non-original garden shed located in the rear yard is excluded from designation as it was constructed at an unknown date. Also excluded from the designation is a detached laundry/storage room located to the north of the home. The structure does not appear in a historic photo from 1939 but is visible in an aerial photo from 1958; based on the materials and methods used, it is estimated that the structure was built in 1952 which is outside the period of significance. The non-historic structure is separated from the main house and is sufficiently differentiated through its use of simple painted masonry rather than decorative stucco. Although the laundry/storage room is situated on the lot in a visible location along Walnut Avenue, it does not detract from the resource's primary façade which is located on Kite Street.

In 2016, the current owners began a project to rebuild the second story addition in a manner that would differentiate it from the historic structure. In 2017, the homeowners replaced non-original composite windows that were located on the front and side elevations with historically-accurate double-hung wood windows in order to match the extant original windows. Both projects were approved by Historical Resources staff as being consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The modifications to the property do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship, or feeling, and the building retains integrity as it relates to architectural significance.

The Spanish Colonial Revival style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. Its vocabulary is influenced by Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic or Renaissance precedents. The style became popular after the Panama-California Exposition of 1915 and reached its height in the 1920's and early 1930's before rapidly declining in the 1940's. Identifying features include a low-pitched roof with little or no eave overhang, red tile roof covering, stucco exterior wall finishes, an asymmetrical façade, wing walls, and arches above doors and principle windows. Common decorative details are patterned tiles, carved stonework, large focal windows, wooden or iron window grilles, decorative vents and balconies.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Colonial Revival style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style including an asymmetrical façade with a complex roof form covered in red clay Mission tiles; eaves with little to no overhang; a distinctive stucco exterior; decorative clay tile vents; a covered porch with arched entryway; inset arches above windows; and decorative ironwork. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Ida Kuhn Spec House #1 located at 3450 Kite Street be designated with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that exhibits the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The designation excludes the modified detached garage and the rear second-floor addition, detached laundry/storage room, and detached garden shed which were constructed outside the period of significance. The designation includes the interior living room fireplace.

ag

Jamie Kennedy Senior Planner

ss/y[//yl

:(ɛ)ナnቃmdวธナナA

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Interiors proposed for designation
- 3. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

Development Services Department

Senior Planner

เทชิอุร อินนุยุรกร

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 1/23/2020

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/23/2020, to consider the historical designation of the Ida Kuhn Spec House #1 (owned by Beagin Trust 04-05-18, 3450 Kite Street, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **3450 Kite Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92103**, APN: **451-342-07-00**, further described as BLK 403 LOTS 31 THRU 34 ST CLSD ADJ& in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Ida Kuhn Spec House #1 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1926 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical façade with a complex roof form covered in red clay Mission tiles, eaves with little to no overhang, a distinctive stucco exterior, decorative clay tile vent, a covered porch with arched entryway, inset arches above windows, and decorative ironwork. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall include the interior fireplace.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the modified detached garage and the rear second floor addition, detached laundry/storage room, and detached garden shed which were constructed outside the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,

BY: ____

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney

Site Plan with Footprint

Fireplace Included in Proposed Designation

