



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: February 13, 2020 REPORT NO. HRB-20-007

HEARING DATE: February 27, 2020

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 – Margarett Meyers/ William Lumpkins House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Christopher and Genevieve Wood Family Trust; represented by Heritage Architecture & Planning

LOCATION: 9565 La Jolla Farms Road, La Jolla Community, Council District 1
APN 342-072-0800

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Margarett Meyers/ William Lumpkins House located at 9565 La Jolla Farms Road as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Margarett Meyers/ William Lumpkins House located at 9565 La Jolla Farms Road as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1961 under HRB Criteria C and D. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Custom Ranch style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1961 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits horizontal massing; consists of a single story; low sloped gabled roof with deep overhangs and wood shingles; custom details such as wood shutters and paneled doors; large, divided lite wood windows; and attached garage.
2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Architect William Lumpkins and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is significant as a residential example of Lumpkins' work in the Custom Ranch style during the phase of his career in which he worked in La Jolla.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a one-story, single family residence located on a large parcel in the La Jolla Farms neighborhood.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

In 2018 the property was previously reviewed for significance by historical resources staff in conjunction with a proposed building modification or demolition of a structure of 45 years or more, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212. Staff determined that the property was not significant under any HRB Criteria and did not review the project or any subsequent projects for consistency with the Standards. This determination is good for five years unless new information is provided that speaks to the historicity of the property. The Historical Resources Research Report provided by the property owner through the voluntary designation process constitutes new information and staff now has enough factual evidence to reverse the previous determination.

The historic name of the resource, the Margarette Meyers/ William Lumpkins House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Margarette Meyers, who constructed the house as her personal residence and the name of William Lumpkins, a Master Architect.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Heritage Architecture and Planning, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a one-story, single family residence constructed in 1961 in the Custom Ranch style. Located on a large lot, the resource features a deep street setback and substantial front yard. The structure's rectangular main massing is wide to the street with an attached garage at the eastern end. The house features a low-pitched gable roof with deep overhanging eaves that emphasize the structure's horizontal massing. The exterior of the house is clad in vertical board and batten siding and concrete block. Fenestration consists of large wood, divided lite, double hung windows. Custom details include shutters surrounding the windows on the front and west facades as well as paneled exterior doors.

Several modifications have been made to the property since its 1961 date of construction. At an unknown date a door with side lites was added to the breezeway between the main structure and the garage. Also, an internal chimney was added at an unknown date. In 2018, the wood shingle roof was replaced in kind with new wood shingles and the non-historic chimney was removed. This work was not reviewed by historical resources staff; however, it was done consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. These modifications do not impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling.

The Custom Ranch style of architecture was popular between 1950 and 1975 and is differentiated from Tract Ranch homes because they were typically custom-designed with a specific client in mind.

The Ranch style became the era's most prevalent type of residential construction in San Diego. Custom Ranch homes are generally more lavish than their tract counterparts, but like Tract Ranch housing, materials and detailing are generally traditional. Primary character defining features include horizontal massing, wide to the street; usually single story; custom details; and prominent low-sloped gabled or hipped roofs with deep overhangs. Secondary character defining features include a sprawling floor plan frequently "L" or "U" shaped around a central courtyard; large attached carports or garages; and expensive building materials such as wood shingle roofing, wood siding, brick, stone, and adobe which are usually much more generous in materials and craftsmanship than tract homes.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Custom Ranch style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including horizontal massing; consists of a single story; low sloped gabled roof with deep overhangs and wood shingles; custom details such as wood shutters and paneled doors; large, divided lite wood windows; and attached garage. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property is a known work of Master Architect William Lumpkins. Lumpkins was a prolific artist and architect who is believed to have designed more than 2,000 buildings throughout New Mexico and La Jolla over the course of his career. Lumpkins was born in 1909 on a ranch near Clayton, New Mexico. During the mid-1920's he began his first career as a painter producing landscape paintings of southeastern New Mexico. In 1929 he enrolled in the University of New Mexico in Albuquerque where he began to study architecture. Lumpkins eventually transferred to the University of Southern California to continue his architectural studies but he never earned a degree.

Lumpkins moved to Santa Fe and in 1935 was hired as an artist for the New Deal Art Program, a Civil Works Administration program that employed artists during the Depression. During World War II he briefly joined the service but returned to Santa Fe where he began to design residential buildings, mostly in the Pueblo Revival style. In 1946 Lumpkins published his first book, *Modern Spanish-Pueblo Homes*, and in 1949 was hired to design the Pueblo Revival style home of William and Ruth Black in La Jolla. He eventually moved to La Jolla and established a successful architectural firm.

Lumpkins worked in California from 1946 to 1967. After designing the Black's residence, he abandoned the Pueblo Revival and began working mostly in the Ranch style on residential properties. His public and commercial work in La Jolla varied in style ranging from Spanish Eclectic to Modern. In 1967 Lumpkins returned to Santa Fe and began to focus on designing and promoting passive solar homes.

William Lumpkins was established as a Master Architect by the City of San Diego Historical Resources Board with the designation of the John and Betty Mabee/ William Lumpkins House, HRB #1323. Another of Lumpkins works on the San Diego Register is The Athenaem, HRB #229, located at 1008 Wall Street in La Jolla. The William Black Residence (Audrey Geisel University House), 9630 La Jolla Farms Road, is not locally designated; however, it is listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

Margarette Meyers hired Lumpkins to design her residence in the Custom Ranch style in 1961. The house is representative of Lumpkins custom residential buildings designed while he worked in La Jolla from 1946 to 1967. During this phase of his career he worked almost exclusively outside of the Pueblo Revival style that he was well known for in New Mexico.

Significance Statement: The subject resource retains excellent integrity and continues to reflect Lumpkins' original design, intent and aesthetic. The house is significant as a residential example of Lumpkins' work in the Custom Ranch style during the phase of his career in which he worked in La Jolla. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion D as a notable work of Master Architect William Lumpkins.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Margarette Meyers/ William Lumpkins House located at 9565 La Jolla Farms Road be designated with a period of significance of 1961 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Custom Ranch style and HRB Criterion D as a resource that is representative of a notable work of Master Architect William Lumpkins.



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner / HRB Liaison

SS/ss

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 2/27/2020

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 2/27/2020, to consider the historical designation of the Margarett Meyers/William Lumpkins House (owned by Christopher and Genevieve Wood Family Trust, 9565 La Jolla Farms Road, La Jolla, CA 92037) located at **9565 La Jolla Farms Road, La Jolla, CA 92037**, APN: **342-072-08-00**, further described as LOT 50 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Margarett Meyers/William Lumpkins House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Custom Ranch style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1961 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits horizontal massing; consists of a single story; low sloped gabled roof with deep overhangs and wood shingles; custom details such as wood shutters and paneled doors; large, divided lite wood windows; and attached garage. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Architect William Lumpkins and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is significant as a residential example of Lumpkins' work in the Custom Ranch style during the phase of his career in which he worked in La Jolla. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney