



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

## Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: June 11, 2020 REPORT NO. HRB-20-023

HEARING DATE: June 25, 2020

SUBJECT: **ITEM #13 – Caroline Reynolds House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Charles and Kathryn Ferraro; represented by Legacy 106, Inc

LOCATION: 4680 West Talmadge, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9  
APN 465-352-03-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Caroline Reynolds House located at 4680 West Talmadge as a historical resource.

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Caroline Reynolds House located at 4680 West Talmadge as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource maintains the street side entrances it possessed as its original use as a mixed used building; features a stucco asymmetrical exterior; moderate pitch hipped roof with gable and shed roof extensions that are sheathed in clay pan style tile with minimal eave overhang that is rolled with ionic volute detailing; the original iron rails and decorative grilles along the balconies and most the first-floor wood framed windows.

### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is a two-story single-family residence that originally was used dually as a home and a doctor's office.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Caroline Reynolds House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Caroline Reynolds, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

## ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

*CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject resource is a Spanish Eclectic two-story single-family residence with a detached garage. It was constructed in 1927 as multi use building that served both as a family home and doctor's office for Dr. James and Caroline Reynolds. With a stucco exterior, the house has an irregular form and a varied roof line along all elevations. A hipped roof covers most of the house. Gable roofs cover the front porch and the wings extending from the main house. A shed roof covers the porch on the north elevation. The roof is covered with clay pan style tile with a minimal eave overhang that is rolled with ionic volute detailing along the gable ends. Every elevation has wood framed windows in varying sizes and lite patterns.

The east side is the primary residential entrance, which faces West Talmage Drive. The roof covered porch has a rounded square entrance on both the east and south sides. To north is a single-story wing that projects from the front of the resource. This elevation contains a stucco fire place which is flanked by casement windows with decorative metal grilles. To the left is a front patio with metal railing and French doors to enter the house. The windows flanking the French doors are multi-light wood casement windows. To the left of the patio is a bay window with red tile roof above it. The window on the wing coming out from the side is dual casement. On the second floor above the front porch is a balcony with rounded square openings and metal railing on the east and north elevations. To the left is a three-part rectangular window that utilizes a fixed central window that is flanked by double hung windows and a singular double hung window.

The north side is the original doctor's office entrance, and it faces Adams Avenue. A set of stairs lead up to the covered porch, which extends out to the right to allow for a double hung window next to the door. Metal railing sits in the rounded openings along the porch. To the left is three double casement windows with decorative metal railing covering the bottom third of these windows

The west elevation is flat, except for a first-floor bay window next to covered porch that sits underneath the second floor. There is a three-part rectangular window with a fixed center window flanked by double hung windows above the bay window. All other windows on both floors are double hung, and are in a set of two or situated individually. On the side wing tiled stairs lead up to a set of French doors. The detached garage is also on this side, and its entrance faces Adams Avenue.

On the south elevation's 2<sup>nd</sup> story there are four double hung windows. In the side wing there is a nine-lite pane window, and two double casement windows. A small window sits to left of the French doors on the west elevation.

Several modifications have been made to the property since it's 1927 date of construction. These modifications include the addition of brick to the front porch, walkway and driveway, the addition of awnings and a brick fence around the property in 2004. The resource was re-stuccoed in 2018 to restore the finish to its original texture. This work was approved by Historical Resources staff as consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. On the West elevation the lower level three-part window opening has been replaced with a bay window at an unknown date. Changes to the detached garage include modern replacements for both garage doors, and an aluminum window on

the back elevation. The stucco covering the garage is the non-original stucco that matched the home prior to its restoration. These modifications do not impair integrity of design, materials workmanship or feeling as it relates to Criterion C.

The Spanish Eclectic style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. Its vocabulary is influenced by Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic or Renaissance precedents. The style became popular after the Panama-California Exposition of 1915 and reached its height in the 1920's and early 1930's before rapidly declining in the 1940's. Identifying features include a low-pitched roof with little or no eave overhang, red tile roof covering, stucco exterior wall finishes, an asymmetrical façade and arches above doors and principle windows. Common decorative details are patterned tiles, carved stonework, large focal windows, wooden or iron window grilles, decorative vents and balconies.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including an asymmetrical façade; stucco exterior; decorative metal work; hipped and gable tile roofs with minimal eave overhang; a side entry porch with arched; a stucco chimney; and wood frame.

#### OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

#### CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Caroline Reynolds House located at 4680 West Talmadge Drive be designated with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Spanish Eclectic style.



Megan Bacik  
Junior Planner

MB/ss



Suzanne Segur  
Senior Planner  
Development Services Department

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A  
ADOPTED ON 6/25/2020

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 6/25/2020, to consider the historical designation of the **Caroline Reynolds House** (owned by Charles and Kathryn Ferraro, 4680 W Talmadge Drive, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **4680 W Talmadge Drive, San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **465-352-03-00**, further described as LOTS 5 & 6 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 1269**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Caroline Reynolds House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, resource exhibits a stucco asymmetrical exterior; moderate pitch hipped roof with gable and shed roof extensions that are sheathed in clay pan style tile with minimal eave overhang that is rolled with ionic volute detailing; the original iron rails and decorative grilles along the balconies and most the first-floor wood framed windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 1269**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair  
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,  
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,  
Deputy City Attorney