

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

## Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	August 13, 2020	REPORT NO. HRB-20-038
HEARING DATE:	August 27, 2020	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #10 – Dr. Francis and Florence	Mead House
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Invent	ory Database (CHRID) link
APPLICANT:	6 <sup>th</sup> and Thorn LLC; represented by Ma	rie Burke Lia
LOCATION:	3330 6 <sup>th</sup> Avenue, Uptown Community, APN 452-555-2100	, Council District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Dr. Fill located at 3330 6 <sup>th</sup> Avenue as a histor	

#### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Dr. Francis and Florence Mead House located at 3330 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1911-1949 under HRB Criterion B. The designation excludes the rear building addressed as 3328 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource is identified with Dr. Francis and Florence Mead, who are historically significant individuals and retains integrity for their association. Specifically, the resource was their primary residence from 1911-1949 while they advocated for the public health and safety of San Diegans and tuberculosis patients from around the country; and were instrumental in the successful operation of the Rest Haven Preventorium and various free health clinics throughout the city.

#### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed building modification or demolition of a structure of 45 years or more, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212. The property faces towards the east overlooking Balboa Park and is located in a mixed-use neighborhood, featuring both residential and commercial structures. The parcel features a single-family residence along with a rear unit addressed as 3328 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue that was previously cleared from historic review and cannot be included in this designation.

The property was located within the boundaries of the *2016 Uptown Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey Report,* but was not included in the survey as the building was not evaluated

The historic name of the resource, the Dr. Francis and Florence Mead House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Dr. Francis and Florence Mead, who are historically significant individuals.

#### Prior HRB Review

The property was previously brought before the Historical Resources Board in 2007 and in 2008. In 2007, a report prepared by Heritage Architecture and Planning concluded that the resource was significant under HRB Criterion B and HRB Criterion C, however staff was recommending designation only under HRB Criterion B for its association with Dr. Francis and Florence Mead and not under HRB Criterion C due to exterior modifications. In 2008 another report was submitted that was prepared by Kathleen Crawford of the office of Marie Burke Lia, which concluded that the resource was significant only under HRB Criterion B and staff concurred with this finding. In both instances the item was indefinitely continued by the applicant at the hearing before the Historical Resources Board had the opportunity to discuss and vote on a motion. Prior to any restoration efforts, staff was recommending the property for historic designation under HRB Criterion B for its association with Dr. Francis and Florence Mead.

#### <u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Marie Burke Lia which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion B and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 3330 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Uptown's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

#### CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

The subject property is significant for its association with Dr. Francis Mead and his wife, Florence "Ma" Mead who are historically significant individuals who resided in the property from 1911-1949. Dr. Mead was head of the City's Health Department from 1908-1915 and during his time he worked to improve the overall well-being and sanitation of the Stingaree District in San Diego. Along with his role as head of the City's Health Department, he also wrote an article titled "Climates and Roads in San Diego" that was published in Volume I of *San Diego County California* which aimed to attract those suffering from tuberculosis to relocate to San Diego for the abundant sunshine and fresh air. This

article along with Dr. Mead's understanding of San Diego's climate and the positive impacts it had on tuberculosis patients allowed him and his wife, Florence, to successfully operate the Rest Haven Preventorium and various other free clinics as a response to the influx of tuberculosis patients. Rest Haven was an outdoor camp which served adults, then later soldiers during WWI, and lastly focused its efforts on providing children with a healthy, clean environment full of sunshine and fresh air. Dr. Mead and Florence did not have any children of their own, however Florence served as motherly role to the camp's children who affectionately referred to her as "Ma". Florence became the Financial Chairman and later the official Chairman of Rest Haven where she played a vital role in helping Rest Haven remain open when funding was low. She even hosted the Rest Haven Ball which allowed her to use her social connections in downtown San Diego to raise funds for the camp for future operations. This ball became an annual event that was held up until 1941. The Meads owned and occupied the subject property for 38 years and remained important public health advocates for San Diego's residents throughout their legacy in the house.

In its current condition, the subject property has undergone exterior modifications at unknown dates (discussed in greater detail under HRB Criterion C) and no longer retains integrity of design, materials, or workmanship. Although there have been substantial modifications, staff finds that the subject property continues to retain integrity of location, setting, feeling, and association which are the most relevant aspects of integrity related to HRB Criterion B.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The subject resource was the primary residence of Dr. Francis and Florence Mead from 1911-1949 while they advocated for the public health and safety of San Diegans and tuberculosis patients from around the country, and were instrumental in the successful operation of the Rest Haven Preventorium and various free health clinics throughout the city. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the resource located at 3330 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue under HRB Criterion B.

## CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject property was constructed in 1911 in the Craftsman style and features a two-story square form clad in modern stucco with a large, stuccoed chimney located on a concrete foundation. The hipped roof features wide, overhanging eaves with exposed rafter ends and includes three hipped dormers and one shed dormer with multi-lite windows clad in shingles. The south elevation faces towards the corner of 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue and Thorn Street and features a one story, rectangular shaped enclosed entry porch with a flat roof and belt course detailing. The main entrance located on the south façade faces towards the east and includes a pair of wood framed multi-lite French doors. The east elevation of the property faces towards Sixth Avenue and features a wide, centralized bay window flanked by multi-lite casement windows on the first floor with a pair of double hung windows located on the large stuccoed chimney. The west elevation features the rear shed dormer, divided lite windows in both casement and double hung operations, a small bump out with a divided lite transom window, and a rear door.

Modifications to the property which were completed at unknown dates include the removal of the original wood shingle siding for the replacement of stucco, the possible removal of the southeast corner's second story enclosed porch, and the removal of a bay window on the south façade east of the front elevation with a flushed window and the possible enclosure of the front entrance porch.

During 2018-2019, the property underwent a substantial rehabilitation project that included the restoration of all existing windows and doors, restoration of all rotten wood details, stucco repair and replacement. This restoration project was review by Historical Resources staff and deemed consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The restoration project did not include the restoration of the property to its configuration in the historic imagery, such as shingle siding or bay window replacement, as the historic postcard does not provide a clear depiction of the entire property and it is unclear when those modifications occurred, specifically whether or not they were executed by the Meads.

While the property retains its original footprint, general form, and some original materials, such as the multi-light divided windows, the removal of the siding and replacement with stucco and the modification to a front facade window opening, have cumulatively impacted the design, workmanship, and materials which are the significance aspects of integrity related to HRB Criterion C. Therefore, due to substantial alterations the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 3330 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue was designed by an unknown architect and built by contractor Charles Gaines. Charles Gaines has not been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architect, Designer or Builder, and there is insufficient information to designate him as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 3330 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 3330 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

#### **OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

#### **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Dr. Francis and Florence Mead House located at 3330 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1911-1949 under HRB Criterion B. This designation excludes the rear building addressed as 3328 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue.

mma

Emma Haggerty Associate Planner

EH/ss

Attachment(s):

hyle

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner Development Services Department

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover
- 3. Staff Report from 2007
- 4. Staff Memo from 2008

#### RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 8/27/2020

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 8/27/2020, to consider the historical designation of the Dr. Francis and Florence Mead (owned by 6th & Thorn LLC, 3565 7th Avenue, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **3330 6th Avenue**, **San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **452-555-21-00**, further described as BLK 387 LOT I in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

#### NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Dr. Francis and Florence Mead House on the following finding:

The property is historically significant under CRITERION B for its association with Dr. Francis and Florence Mead, who are historically significant individuals and retains integrity for their association. Specifically, the resource was their primary residence from 1911-1949 while they advocated for the public health and safety of San Diegans and tuberculosis patients from around the country; and were instrumental in the successful operation of the Rest Haven Preventorium and various free health clinics throughout the city. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the rear building addressed as 3328  $6^{\rm th}$  Avenue.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: \_\_\_

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney



### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	July 12, 2007	REPORT NO. HRB-07-040
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of July 26, 2007	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #9 – Dr. Francis and Florence Mead House	
APPLICANT:	CHEL Holdings, Ltd, owner (referra	ll from Development Services)
LOCATION:	3330 Sixth Avenue, Uptown Comm	unity, Council District 2
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Dr. located at 3330 Sixth Avenue as a h	

#### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Dr. Francis and Florence Mead House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion B for its association with historically significant individuals Dr. Francis and Florence Mead.

#### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's constraints assessment for a potential project at this location involving one or more buildings of 45 years more under SDMC Section 143.0212. The house is a two story, square Craftsman style home with stucco walls and a concrete foundation constructed in 1911 by Charles Gaines for Dr. Francis and Florence Mead.



**City Planning & Community Investment** 202 C Street, MS 4A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865 Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

#### ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Eileen Magno of Heritage Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria B and C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion B, but not Criterion C, as follows.

#### CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

The research report states that the house at 3330 Sixth Avenue is significant for its association with historically significant individuals Dr. Francis Mead and his wife, Florence "Ma" Mead. Dr. Mead, a physician, was head of the City's Health Department from 1908-1915. As head of the Health Department, he oversaw the raids of the downtown Stingaree District from 1910-1915 in order to improve the sanitation and overall health of the district. In 1913, Dr. Mead published an article in Volume I of *San Diego County California* published by the S.J. Clarke Publishing Company entitled "Climate and Roads in San Diego", encouraging those suffering from tuberculosis to come to San Diego where "sunshine is so perpetual that the treatment for surgical tuberculosis which has so successfully been carried out at Lyysin in the Valasian Alps, could easily be followed here." Such advertising was successful, drawing people from all over the country.

Together with his wife Florence, Dr. Mead worked with the Rest Haven Preventorium, one of several Preventoriums and free clinics to open in response to the influx of tuberculosis patients. Rest Haven, an outdoor camp, served primarily adults in its early years, and then soldiers during WWI. The camp was closed briefly for a year in from the fall of 1919 to the fall of 1920. When it reopened, Rest Haven changed its patient source to children, providing sunshine, fresh air, exercise, rest and a balanced diet in hope of facilitating recovery through convalescence. Florence, who had no children of her own, became known as "Ma" to the children recovering at Rest Haven. She served as the Financial Chairman in 1912 and was elected as a director of the board in 1917 before being named Chairman of Rest Haven. She actively guided the camp and repeatedly thwarted the efforts of others to close it due to funding issues. In March of 1921 she hosted the first Rest Haven Ball, drawing on her contacts in San Diego's cultural and social circles to raise money for the camp. The balls would continue through 1941 until the onset of WWII. A few years later Florence passed away in 1949. Dr. Mead had preceded her 18 years prior. Through their 38 year ownership and occupation of the house at 3330 Sixth Avenue, Dr. and Mrs. Mead worked tirelessly for the health of tuberculosis patients and were instrumental in the creation and successful operation of the Rest Haven Preventorium.

Therefore, staff recommends that the Board designate the Dr. Francis and Florence Mead House, located at 3330 Sixth Avenue, under HRB Criterion B for its association with Dr. Francis Mead and Florence "Ma" Mead.

# CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The house at 3330 Sixth Avenue was built in 1911 by Charles Gaines in the Craftsman style and features a hipped roof with asphalt shingles and clay tile ridges; exposed rafter tails; small hipped-roof dormers; a two-story square frame with stucco walls; and a concrete foundation. The street façade has two 8-over-1 double-hung wood frame and sash windows on the second floor and a

projecting tri-partite window with a single-pane fixed window flanked by single-pane casement window under multi-light awning transoms. The entry to the house is accessed from the southern façade, which features a projecting porch element which has been enclosed with multi-lite wood frame windows. Fenestration on this façade consists of a tri-partite window to the right of the porch similar to the one on the street façade, as well as 8-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows and other divided-lite windows on the second floor.

The research report indicates that the stucco appears to be non-historic, and that the house was likely originally clad with horizontal wood siding and wood shingles, as evidenced by the wood siding on the interior side of the main entry porch and the wood shingles on the dormers. The Residential Building Record prepared in the 1950's, states that the building's exterior is stucco, which indicates that this modification is at least 50 years old. The thickness of the stucco suggests that it may have been applied over the original wood siding. Other documented modifications to the property include the addition of a guest house at the rear of the property and the demolition of the original garage.

While the house maintains its form and many of the original historic materials, including the original windows, the modification of the exterior siding adversely impacts the architectural integrity of the structure to such an extent that it no longer conveys its significance as a good example of Craftsman architecture. If the owner were to restore the siding in the future, staff would recommend designation under HRB Criterion C at that time. Therefore, staff recommends that the Board not designate the Dr. Francis and Florence Mead House, located at 3330 Sixth Avenue, under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Craftsman architecture, due to modification of the original siding.

#### CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Dr. Francis and Florence Mead House be designated under HRB Criterion B for its association with historically significant individuals Dr. Francis and Florence Mead. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Kelley Saunders Senior Planner

atten Furternol

Cathy Winterrowd Program Coordinator

KS/cw

Attachment(s): Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

#### CITY OF SAN DIEGO M E M O R A N D U M

SUBJECT:	Item #10 – Dr. Francis and Florence Mead House – 3330 Sixth Avenue
FROM:	Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner, Historical Resources
TO:	Historical Resources Board
DATE:	April 10, 2008

This item was continued from the July 26, 2007 Historical Resources Board meeting at the request of the applicant. Heritage Architecture & Planning prepared a historical assessment report and found the building eligible as a San Diego Historical Site under HRB Criterion B for its association with Dr. Francis and Florence Mead and HRB Criterion C for its representation of Craftsman architecture. The original HRB Staff report dated July 12, 2007 recommended the building eligible under Criterion B for its association with Dr. Francis and Florence Mead, but not under Criterion C due to a lack of integrity. A second consultant's report prepared by Kathleen Crawford with Maria Burke Lia's office disagreed with the conclusions of the Heritage Architecture & Planning report and found the property significant only under Criterion B for its association with Dr. Francis and Florence Mead.

Staff's recommendation to designate the building located at 3330 Sixth Avenue under HRB Criterion B for its association with Dr. Francis and Florence Mead remains unchanged, as outlined in the original staff report dated July 12, 2007.

Kelley Saunders Senior Planner

Attachment: Staff Report No. HRB-07-040