

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	August 13, 2020	REPORT NO. HRB-20-039
HEARING DATE:	August 27, 2020	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #11 – John and Sarah Sinks House	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Data	<u>abase (CHRID) link</u>
APPLICANT:	6 th and Thorn LLC; represented by Marie Burk	ke Lia
LOCATION:	3340 6 th Avenue, Uptown Community, Counci APN 452-555-2200	il District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the John and Sar 6 th Avenue as a historical resource.	ah Sinks House located at 3340

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the John and Sarah Sinks House located at 3340 6th Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1906 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear, one story addition and rear detached apartment, addressed as 3336-3338 6th Avenue, which were constructed outside the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1906 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical front façade, stucco sheathed exterior, multiple open gabled roof planes with decorative fascia detailing supported by wooden knee braces, divided lite wooden windows, a partial width uncovered entry porch and a large clinker brick chimney.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed building modification or demolition of a structure of 45 years or more, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212. The property faces towards the east overlooking Balboa Park and is located in a mixed-use neighborhood, featuring both residential and commercial structures. This particular parcel features a single-family residence along with a rear two-story unit that was constructed in 1958 addressed as 3336-3338 6th Avenue. This unit was previously cleared from historic review by staff in a prior review and cannot be included in this designation.

The property was located within the boundaries of the 2016 Uptown Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey Report, but was not included in the survey as the building was not evaluated.

The historic name of the resource, the John and Sarah Sinks House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of John and Sarah Sinks, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

Prior HRB Review

The property was previously brought before the Historical Resources Board in 2007 and in 2008. In 2007, a report prepared by Heritage Architecture and Planning concluded that the resource was significant under HRB Criterion C for its Craftsman style and staff supported this finding. In 2008 another report was submitted that was prepared by Kathleen Crawford of the office of Marie Burke Lia, which concluded that the resource was significant under HRB Criterion C for its Craftsman style and staff continued to support this finding. In both instances the item was indefinitely withdrawn before the Historical Resources Board had the opportunity to discuss and vote on a motion. In 2007 and 2008, prior to any restoration efforts, staff was recommending the property for historic designation under HRB Criterion C for its retention of character-defining features of the Craftsman style.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Marie Burke Lia, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 3340 6th Avenue did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Uptown's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 3340 6th Avenue did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject property is a two-story Craftsman style structure that was constructed in 1906. The property features a rectangular floor plan with an asymmetrical front façade clad in stucco on a raised concrete foundation with a medium pitch gable roof. The primary façade features a partial width porch with a restored wooden trellis and a modern door which leads to a multi-lite windowed sunroom. The second story features a recently restored enclosed balcony with the same divided lite windows with a centralized casement window above. The south façade features exposed rafter ends, divided lite casement and transom windows.

Modifications to the property prior to 2018 at unknown dates included the infill of the centralized bay on the second story porch, the removal of the second story corbelled beam ends, the addition of two aluminum windows on the south elevation and removal of the original trellis. During 2018-2019, the property underwent a substantial restoration project which included the replacement of non-original windows, restoration of the original wood windows, removal of the enclosed bay on the second story front balcony, addition of the second story corbelled beam ends, stucco repairs and trellis restoration. As part of this restoration project the second story balcony central bay was opened and new windows were constructed to match the existing windows which helped restore a sense of openness to this elevation, while still maintaining livable square footage. The restoration project also included driveway, walkway, and hardscape modifications. This project was reviewed and approved by Historical Resources staff and deemed consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards. Overall these modifications do not impact integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling as it relates to Criterion C.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; multiple roof planes; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; decorative attic vents; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including an asymmetrical front façade, stucco sheathed exterior, multiple open gabled roof planes with decorative fascia detailing supported by wooden knee braces, divided lite wooden windows, a partial width uncovered entry porch and a large clinker brick chimney. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Research into the construction of the property at 3340 6th Avenue failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 3340 6th Avenue has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 3340 6th Avenue is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the John and Sarah Sinks House located at 3340 6th Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1906 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear, one story addition and rear detached apartment, addressed as 3336-3338 6th Avenue, which were constructed outside the period of significance.

Emma Haggerty Associate Planner

EH/ss

Attachment(s):

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner Development Services Department

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover
- 3. Staff Report from 2007
- 4. Staff Memo from 2008

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 8/27/2020

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 8/27/2020, to consider the historical designation of the John and Sarah Sinks House (owned by 6th & Thorn LLC, 3565 7th Avenue, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **3340 6th Avenue**, **San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **452-555-22-00**, further described as BLK 387 LOT J in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the John and Sarah Sinks House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1906 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical front façade, stucco sheathed exterior, multiple open gabled roof planes with decorative fascia detailing supported by wooden knee braces, divided lite wooden windows, a partial width uncovered entry porch and a large clinker brick chimney. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the rear, one story addition and rear detached apartment which were both constructed outside the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: ___

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	July 12, 2007	REPORT NO. HRB-07-043
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of July 26, 2007	
SUBJECT:	ITEM # 12 - John Sinks House	
APPLICANT:	CHEL Holdings Ltd, owner (referral from Development Services)	
LOCATION:	3340 Sixth Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2	
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the John Avenue as a historic resource.	n Sinks House located at 3340 Sixth

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the John Sinks House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C due to the house's primarily intact original historic form and fabric evidencing characteristics of the Craftsman style, exclusive of the separate two-story residential structure at the rear of the lot.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's constraints assessment for a project at this location involving one or more buildings of 45 years or more, under San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212. Located at 3340 Sixth Avenue in Bankers Hill, the two and a half-story stucco over wood frame residence is a Craftsman style structure constructed in 1906 and rests on a concrete foundation.



City Planning & Community Investment 202 C Street, MS 4A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865 Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by historian Eileen Magno of Heritage Architecture which concludes the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship.

Located in the northerly area of Bankers Hill, the subject single-family Craftsman style residence was constructed adjacent to Balboa Park for Mr. John F. Sinks in 1906 during a wave of upscale residential construction prior to the 1915 Panama California Exposition. Mr. Sinks passed away shortly after the construction of his house and the ownership and tenancy of the structure changed many times thereafter. No historic person appears to have been associated with the structure. Nor is there an architect/designer associated with the structure, although staff believes that it likely that a master builder and/or architect would have been employed.

The structure is identified on the Draft Uptown Historical Survey with a code of 7N1, which means "Needs to be reevaluated (Formerly NR SC4) - may become eligible for NR (National Register) w/ restoration or when meets other specific conditions." The structure is noted as "Minimally Altered". Staff agrees that with minimal changes, the house could be eligible for the National Register.

The subject structure was built in 1906 in the Craftsman style with many of the characteristics of the style. The primary portion of the two and a half-story open-end gable roof house is a simple rectangular shape in plan, with a flat roof two-story projection at both the front and rear of the structure, and a single-story gable roof projection closest to Sixth Avenue. A garage, originally located at the northwest corner of the lot and accessed via a driveway on the south side of the house, has been demolished.

Among the characteristics of the Craftsman style exhibited by the subject house include:

- A street-facing medium pitch gable roof with exposed wood rafters and sheathing at the two and a half-story element and the single story element; wood brackets at all sides of the roof including the gable ends that support an end beam and purlins.
- A raised (three steps) scored concrete-floor entry porch, defined by a low stucco wall and screened by landscaping. There is a large fixed window, flanked by narrow single pane double casement windows facing the porch to the right of the entry. This window has three multi-pane wood-framed transom windows.
- A central non-historic but complementary wood-panel entry door with two glass viewing windows at eye level. Adjacent to the entry door on each side there are wood-framed multi-pane mitered cut-glass sidelights.
- A large clinker brick chimney at the south side of the primary structure.
- A heavy dash stucco texture that appears to be mostly original.
- A central wood bay window at the attic level with paired wood-framed multi-pane windows.

- An interesting two-story flat roof element with four wood-capped stucco piers that frame two large window compositions on either side of a non-historic stucco-faced infill at the porch form at the upper level. At these large windows, multi-pane wood framed 2 over 3 multi-pane casement windows on the sides and flanking a center 4 over 3 fixed wood frame window.
- The single-story gable roof element, situated to the left side of the front elevation adjacent to the entry door. At this single-story element, wood-framed multi-pane casement windows with multi-pane transoms above exist at the front and left side elevations. A fixed pair of wood-framed multi-pane casement doors faces the entry porch at this element.

The wood doors and windows at the residence are primarily intact and in good condition.

Regarding changes to the original historic fabric, the alterations are relatively minor. Among the non-historic changes are: the infill porch at the second level in the center facing the street at the two-story flat roof element; the removal of the corbelled beam ends at the two-story element's flat-roof facing the street (see photo 4 of a similar condition at the rear of the structure); the additions of two small aluminum bays at windows at the south side of the structure near the rear; and the addition of a metal fence at the original driveway, in alignment with the front of the house.

At the rear of the lot, not visible from the street, a smaller non-historic two-story flat roof stucco residential structure was added in 1956. This structure is approximately five feet from the rear of the subject structure and does not physically impact it. This structure is recommended to be excluded from the designation.

Due to the subject house's primarily intact original historic form and fabric evidencing characteristics of the Craftsman style, staff recommends that the Board designate the John Sinks House, located at 3340 Sixth Avenue, exclusive of the separate two-story residential structure at the rear of the lot, under HRB Criterion C.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the John Sinks House at 3340 Sixth Avenue, not including the separate two-story structure at the rear of the lot, be designated under HRB Criterion C. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other

regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

milia nam

Michael Tudury Senior Planner/Architect

Caten Suitench

Cathy Winterrowd Senior Planner/Program Coordinator

MT/cw

Attachment: Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

CITY OF SAN DIEGO M E M O R A N D U M

SUBJECT:	ITEM #13 – John Sinks House—3340 Sixth Avenue
FROM:	Jodie Brown, Senior Planner, Historical Resources
TO:	Historical Resources Board
DATE:	April 10, 2008

This item was continued from the July 26, 2007 meeting of the Historical Resources Board at the request of the applicant. The original consultant's report, completed by Heritage Architecture, concluded that the resource was eligible under HRB Criteria C, as a good example of the Craftsman style architecture. The July 26, 2007 staff report (attached), by Michael Tudury, concurred with the consultant's report. More recently a second consultant's report prepared by Kathleen Crawford with Marie Burke Lia's office also concurred that the property is significant under Criterion C as a good example of Craftsman style architecture.

Staff's recommendation to designate the John Sinks House located at 3340 Sixth Avenue under HRB Criterion C as a good example of a Craftsman style, exclusive of the separate two-story residential structure at the rear of the lot, remains unchanged, as outlined in the original staff report dated July 12, 2007.

Attachment: Staff Report HRB 07-043