

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	August 13, 2020	REPORT NO. HRB-20-037
HEARING DATE:	August 27, 2020	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #9 – Dorothy and Harriet Cottages	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Data	<u>base (CHRID) link</u>
APPLICANT:	800 Coast LLC; represented by Brian F. Smith a	and Associates, Inc.
LOCATION:	825-827 Coast Boulevard South, La Jolla Comn APN 350-070-1000	nunity, Council District 1
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Dorothy and and 827 Coast Boulevard South as historical r	0

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Dorothy Cottage located at 827 Coast Boulevard South with a period of significance of 1904-1909 and the Harriet Cottage located at 825 Coast Boulevard South with a period of significance of 1921-1926 as historical resources under HRB Criterion A. The designation excludes the 1972 rear addition to 825 Coast Boulevard South and the 1949-1952 shed addition on 827 Coast Boulevard South which are both constructed outside of the periods of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resources are special elements of La Jolla's historical, cultural, social, economic, aesthetic, and architectural development and retains integrity to the 1904-1909 and 1921-1926 periods of significance. Specifically, the resources, which embody the character defining features of Beach Cottage architecture, are two of a finite and limited number of beach cottages remaining which reflect the early development history of La Jolla and retain integrity for that association.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application to determine whether or not the building is historically significant as part of a constraints analysis for future development. The subject parcel contains two residential structures; 827 Coast Boulevard South which is at the rear of the property and 825 Coast Boulevard South which is located at the front. Both structures are oriented towards the coastline.

The subject property was located within the boundary of the 1977 La Jolla Historical Survey and the buildings were identified as "Dorothy" and "Harriet" cottages. The property was also within the boundary of the 2004 Draft La Jolla Historical Survey and was photographed but not evaluated.

The historic name of the resources, the Dorothy and Harriet Cottages, have been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflect the names historically associated with the property.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Brian F. Smith and Associates, Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion A and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The village of La Jolla began in the 1880s during the "boom" period of San Diego's history as a small coastal community. One of the first land tracts in the area was La Jolla Park, which was developed in 1887 by Frank Botsford and was the first subdivision to have identified lots and streets. The first permanent residence in La Jolla was constructed that same year. Historian Patricia Schaechlin described La Jolla's early history as follows: *"In 1888, the land collapse left a scraggly collection of cottages, few residents, no improvements and little hope.... La Jolla experienced a steady growth in the first two decades of the twentieth century, a time when the community became a village. It grew from a 350 population, some one hundred houses, to a village and a popular resort with a commercial base of tourism large enough to support its permanent residents."¹*

Beach Cottages were the dominant housing type in La Jolla during this early period through the 1930's. The Beach Cottage style was ideal for use as a summer or winter retreat or, even though lacking in many modern conveniences, they could be and were used as permanent residences. Early beach cottages were characterized (in part) as smaller dwellings, typically one story, with a low pitched roof and exposed rafters; wood siding; a small front porch and garden area; and an orientation toward any available beach or coastal view. Originally known by name, the cottages were not given proper addresses until 1913. By the 1920s, the population had increased to over 2,500 people and the tourism industry was firmly established. Hotels were constructed in increasing numbers, and as the famous and wealthy began to vacation there, the cottages were no longer seen as suitable accommodations. Increased population, tourism and wealth, coupled with shifting architectural preferences, caused Beach Cottages to fall out of favor through the late 1920s and 1930s. In the following decades, many of these early cottages were relocated to less desirable inland lots.

¹ Patricia Schaelchlin, *La Jolla: The Story of a Community 1897-1987* (San Diego: Friends of the La Jolla Library, 1988).

The structures located at 825 and 827 Coast Boulevard South were identified as "Dorothy" and "Harriet" cottages in Howard S.F. Randolph's *La Jolla Year by Year*. The "Dorothy" and "Harriet" cottages exhibit the primary characteristics typical of La Jolla beach cottages; one story, small dwelling, low pitched roof, wood siding and orientation toward an available costal view. The resources have been modified since the period of significance for La Jolla beach cottages (see discussion under HRB Criterion C); however, they retain integrity of location, setting, feeling and association which are the fundamental aspects of integrity related to historical, cultural, social and economic development.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The Dorothy and Harriet cottages are special elements of La Jolla's historical, cultural, social, economic, aesthetic, and architectural development and retain integrity 1904-1909 and 1921-1926 periods of significance. Specifically, the resources, which embody the character defining features of Beach Cottage architecture, are two of a finite and limited number of beach cottages remaining which reflect the early development history of La Jolla and retain integrity for that association. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

827 Coast Boulevard South

The resource located at 827 Coast Boulevard South, Dorothy Cottage, was constructed in 1904 in the Queen Anne Free Classic style at the rear of the subject property. The one-story structure features a hipped roof with boxed eaves, a wide frieze board and simple molding at the cornice line. A dominant front facing gable is located on the primary façade which also features a partial width enclosed porch. Exterior cladding consists of both horizontal and wood siding and fenestration includes wood windows with diamond pane upper lites.

Several modifications have been made to the Dorothy Cottage since its 1904 date of construction. These alterations consist of a front porch extension and enclosure prior to 1909, as well as a shed roof addition on the east façade constructed prior to 1909 and a smaller shed addition on the same façade constructed sometime between 1949 and 1952.

The Queen Anne style of architecture was a late Victorian style popular in America from about 1880 to 1910 and borrowed heavily from late Medieval English precedents. The style sought to minimize smooth-walled appearances, and was typically characterized by steeply pitched irregular roofs, dominant front-facing gables, patterned shingles, bay windows, and asymmetrical façades with full or partial-width porches. Among the four principal subtypes of the style, Queen Anne Free Classic generally represents an early 20th century transition from traditional Queen Anne to Colonial Revival. The Free Classic subtype exhibits classical columns, typically in pairs, Palladian windows, cornice-line dentils, and other classical details.

The resource located at 827 Coast Boulevard South was originally constructed in the Queen Anne Free Classic style and today exhibits few of the character defining features, including a steeply pitched irregular roof with dominant front facing gable, wood siding and diamond pane wood windows. The building does not, however, reflect any of the other many features of the Queen Anne Free Classic style; and embodies the style in a minimal, insignificant way. Furthermore, the modifications to the front porch detract from the architectural integrity of the structure. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation of 827 Coast Blvd South under HRB Criterion C.

825 Coast Boulevard South

The resource located at 825 Coast Boulevard South, Harriet Cottage, was constructed in 1921 in the Craftsman style. The one-story residence is elevated above a garage and features a gable roof with wide, unenclosed eaves and notched rafter tails. A small porch on the north façade provides access to the house's primary entrance. Exterior cladding consists of wood shingles on the main level and horizontal wood siding below. A small rear addition clad in board and batten siding is located at the northwest corner of the building. The residence also features wood windows and decorative attic vents.

Several modifications have been made to the Harriet Cottage since its 1921 date of construction Alterations include the enclosure of the front porch and addition of the garage in 1926, a small rear porch enclosure in 1972 and an addition at the northern corner of the rear façade in 1972. The 1926 modifications also resulted in the relocation of the primary entrance and the removal of the original front staircase and distinctive porch columns.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

The resource located at 825 Coast Boulevard South was originally constructed in the Craftsman style and exhibits several character defining features of the style, including a gable roof with wide, unenclosed eaves and exposed rafter tails, wood shingle siding, wood windows, and decorative attic vents; however, modifications to the front porch and the addition of the garage significantly impair integrity of design, materials and workmanship. Additionally, these modifications have resulted in a resource that reflects the Craftsman style in a minimal way. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation of 825 Coast Blvd South under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Dorothy and Harriet Cottages located at 825 and 827 Coast Boulevard South be designated with periods of significance of 1904-1909 and 1921-1926 under HRB Criterion A as special elements of the development of the La Jolla community.

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner Development Services Department

SS/ss

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 8/27/2020

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 8/27/2020, to consider the historical designation of the (owned by 800 Coast LLC, 1302 Camino Del Mar, Del Mar, CA 92014) located at **825-827 Coast Boulevard**, **La Jolla, CA 92037**, APN: **350-070-10-00**, further described as BLK 55 LOT 9 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION A as resources that are special elements of La Jolla's historical, cultural, social, economic, aesthetic, and architectural development and retain integrity to the 1904-1909 and 1921-1926 periods of significance. Specifically, the resources, which embody the character defining features of Beach Cottage architecture, are two of a finite and limited number of beach cottages remaining which reflect the early development history of La Jolla and retain integrity for that association. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1972 rear addition to 825 Coast Boulevard South and the 1949-1952 shed addition on 827 Coast Boulevard South which are both constructed outside of the periods of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY:

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: ___

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney