



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 21, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-005

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of January 28, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #10 – Justin and Anastasia Evenson/Ralph L. Frank House**

APPLICANT: Dr. Donald Molenaar & Joy Molenaar; represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 1041 Cypress Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Justin and Anastasia Evenson/Ralph L. Frank House located at 1041 Cypress Avenue as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Justin and Anastasia Evenson/Ralph L. Frank House located at 1041 Cypress Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1934 under HRB Criteria C and D. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of a Neoclassical style home as a full-facade porch subtype, and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1934 period of significance. Specifically, the two story single-family residence features a low-pitched side gabled roof with a shed roof covering the full height porch; symmetrical brick facade with centered entry door and broken pediment; simple square columns; rectangular double hung six-over-nine windows and six-over-six windows with painted shutters on the upper level; side gabled wings with white wood siding and front facing roof dormers; two symmetrical large brick chimneys on both sides of the main brick facade; and a detached rear three-car garage.
2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Architect Ralph L. Frank and retains integrity as it relates to the original 1934 design. Specifically, the subject resource retains excellent integrity and continues to reflect Frank's original design, intent and aesthetic. The house is notable as a unique example of Frank's work in the Neoclassical style, a departure from his other designed homes in San Diego.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. This property sits on a rectangular lot

facing Cypress Avenue, and is located in Marston Hills Neighborhood of the Uptown Community, above the Northwest corner of Balboa Park.

The building is located on APN 452-310-04-00. The property was identified in the 1995 Mid-City Historical Survey, where Marston Hills was identified as a potential historic district; however the property was not given any status code.

The historic name of the resource, the Justin and Anastasia/Ralph L. Frank House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Master Architect Ralph L. Frank, who designed the house in 1934 as a residence for its first owners, Justin Evenson and his wife Anastasia.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Legacy 106 Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criteria C and D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a two-story single family residence built in 1934 in the Neoclassical style. The residence sits on a rectangular lot facing Cypress Avenue and features a low-pitched side gabled roof, extending as a shed roof to cover a full height porch supported by simple square columns. The design classifies the residence as a full-facade porch subtype within Neoclassical architecture, which was popular during the time of the resource's construction. The main symmetrical brick facade features a centered entry door with a broken pediment and two large symmetrical brick chimneys that protrude from either end of the main facade. It has divided light, rectangular double hung six-over-nine windows and six-over-six windows with green-painted shutters on the upper level. The resource features secondary side gabled white wings with front facing roof dormers and a detached rear three-car garage that matches the overall architectural style and retains integrity from the property's 1934 construction.

A majority of the resource's materials are dated from its original 1934 construction, with the exception of some in-kind repairs at the front entry. A small rear balcony addition, away from public view, was also made on the upper level of the home. These alterations neither negatively impact nor detract from the resource's architectural style.

The Neoclassical style was an architectural trend from the late 1800s to mid-1900s. Its identifying features include a facade dominated by a full-height porch with a roof supported by classical columns and symmetrically balanced windows and centered door. The style's principal subtypes consist of porch and roof variants. The subject property is a full-facade porch subtype, in which a colonnaded porch occupies the full width and height of the facade. The residence's porch is not covered by a traditional pediment gable, but instead by a shed extension of the primary side gabled roof. Neoclassical was a dominant style for domestic building in America during the first half of the 20th century, and it had two waves of prominence. The subject

property belongs to its second wave (1925-1950), where side-gabled roofs and simple, slender columns were particularly popular. The subject property, 1041 Cypress Avenue, embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Neoclassical style full-facade porch variant as interpreted in San Diego.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Neoclassical style full-facade porch subtype by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style including a low-pitched side gabled roof with a shed roof covering the full height porch; symmetrical brick facade with centered entry door and broken pediment; simple square columns; rectangular double hung six-over-nine windows and six-over-six windows with painted shutters on the upper level; side gabled wings with white wood siding and front facing roof dormers; two symmetrical large brick chimneys on both sides of the main brick facade; and a detached rear three-car garage. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Ralph Loren Frank was born in Kansas in 1898. He moved to San Diego in 1920 after serving in World War I. As early as 1923 he was designing houses and working with Ralph E. Hurlburt. In 1925, he was referenced as a designer working for Hurlburt and Tifal, a well-known design-build firm. By the mid-1930s he was a partner and primary architectural designer with the firm Hurlburt, Frank and Slaughter, which went on to produce several houses throughout San Diego for high-end clients including: Reuben H. Fleet, Percy J. Benbough, mayor of San Diego from 1935-1942 and C. Arnholt Smith. They were also responsible for planning of the Wonder House of Stone (HRB #464), though credit was given to Hurlburt. While with Hurlburt, Frank and Slaughter, Frank was responsible for the design of the five houses in the small subdivision of Brookes Terrace in Marston Hills. He also designed the interiors of 20 Southern California branches of the U.S. National Bank. It is unknown if Frank actually had an architect's license, though he did list himself in the City directory as an architect. Licensed or not, Frank produced high-quality artistic designs equal to and surpassing his peers, being particularly adroit in the Colonial Revival and Monterey Revival styles. In July 2005, the Historical Resources Board established Frank as a Master Architect with the designation of HRB Site #722.

The property at 1041 Cypress Avenue is a representative example of the notable work of Master Architect Frank L. Hope. Frank's other designed homes consist mainly of stucco and horizontal shingle. His primary architectural style include Colonial Revival and Monterey Revival; therefore, the subject resource is of unique value as a Neoclassical style full-facade porch subtype that was popular during the subject resource's construction.

Significance Statement: The subject resource retains excellent integrity and continues to reflect Frank's original design, intent and aesthetic. The house is notable as a unique example of Frank's work in the Neoclassical style, a departure from his other designed homes in San Diego. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion D as a resource representative of the notable work of Master Architect Ralph L. Frank.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staffs field check, it is recommended that the Justin and Anastasia Evenson/Ralph L. Frank House located at 1041 Cypress Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1934 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that exhibits the distinctive characteristics of the Neoclassical style, full-facade porch subtype; and HRB Criterion D as a resource that is representative of the notable work of Master Architect Ralph L. Frank. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jane Kang
Planning Intern



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

JK./ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 1/28/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/28/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **Justin and Anastasia Evenson/Ralph L. Frank House** (owned by Donald M. Molenaar, 1041 Cypress Avenue, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **1041 Cypress Avenue, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **452-310-04-00**, further described as LOT 2 0.52 AC M/L IN in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Justin and Anastasia Evenson/Ralph L. Frank House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of a Neoclassical style home as a full-facade porch subtype, and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1934 period of significance. Specifically, the two story single-family residence features a low-pitched side gabled roof with a shed roof covering the full height porch; symmetrical brick facade with centered entry door and broken pediment; simple square columns; rectangular double hung six-over-nine windows and six-over-six windows with painted shutters on the upper level; side gabled wings with white wood siding and front facing roof dormers; two symmetrical large brick chimneys on both sides of the main brick facade; and a detached rear three-car garage. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a resource that is representative of a notable work of Master Architect Ralph L. Frank and retains integrity as it relates to the original 1934 design. Specifically, the subject resource retains excellent integrity and continues to reflect Frank's original design, intent and aesthetic. The house is notable as a unique example of Frank's work in the Neoclassical style, a departure from his other designed homes in San Diego. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney