



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: February 11, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-15-008

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of February 25, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #5 – 4318 Louisiana Street**

APPLICANT: HP Investors represented by Scott A. Moomjian

OWNER: Peter Andersen

LOCATION: 4318 Louisiana Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 4318 Louisiana Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 4318 Louisiana Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application to determine whether or not the building is historically significant as part of a constraints analysis for future development. The subject property is a one-story Craftsman style single-family residence built in 1922 on the west side of Louisiana Street, just north of El Cajon Boulevard in the University Heights subdivision of the Greater North Park Community.

The building is located on APN 445-332-18-00. The property was identified in the 2004 Draft North Park Historic Survey and the 1996 Mid-City Survey and given a Status Code of 5S3, "Appears to be individually eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation." The property was not identified in the Draft 2011 North Park Historic Resources Survey.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria and staff concurs. This determination

is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 4318 Louisiana Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or North Park's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 4318 Louisiana Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property is a modest, one-story Craftsman style single-family residence constructed in 1922 of standard wood frame construction on a concrete foundation. The building's plan form is rectangular with a partial width, modified central front porch. The moderate pitched, side gabled, jerkinhead roof is sheathed in composition shingle and exhibits wide eave overhang with exposed rafters. The building is clad in alternating wide and narrow horizontal wood lap siding. Decorative features are generally limited – rafter tails, fascia boards, and window trim are all modestly executed, with the small exception of the simple round porch columns and arched porch cover. A painted brick chimney is located on the south (side) elevation. Fenestration consists primarily of wood double hung and fixed windows, some with multi-pane transoms. An awkwardly arranged set of three windows and an adjacent window on the small pop-out at the rear of the south side of the building suggests a possible window alteration or replacement, however this could not be verified.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frames and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Modifications are few, with one having considerable impact on the building's character defining features and historic integrity. A rear addition clad in vertical wood siding was built along the west elevation sometime between 1956 and 1962, and is not of great concern to staff. Of the modifications noted in the report, the most critical impact to the resource occurred with the alteration of the front porch in 2006. This modification resulted in the replacement of the deck, balustrade and stairs of the front porch, thereby enlarging the porch's overall footprint. Comparison to transitional photos of the property taken prior to this work and provided in the applicant's report shows this alteration at the primary elevation resulted in a significant impact to the porch's size relative to the rest of the house, extending it to nearly the full width of the front façade. This modification falls within improvements allowed without a permit.

The front porch alteration has drastically impacted a character defining feature of the front façade that is critical to the building's conveyance of the historic significance of the Craftsman style. Specifically, the modification has altered the original form and massing of the front porch, affected its spatial relationship to the home and the primary façade's overall composition. The building's integrity of materials, workmanship, feeling and most notably, design have been significantly undermined.

Due to a significant loss of integrity, the property does not embody the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style sufficient to convey the historic significance of that style. The building is not a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials nor does it exemplify high craftsmanship and design. The property does not embody the distinctive characteristics of a rare or unique building type or method of construction. Finally, the building's age and physical features do not exemplify or reflect the era when its style, type or method of construction became popular. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Research into the construction of the property at 4318 Louisiana Street failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 4318 Louisiana Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 4318 Louisiana Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is not recommended that the property located at 4318 Louisiana Street be designated under any HRB Criteria. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Associate Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

CP/ks

Attachment:

1. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover