



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: February 11, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-012

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of February 25, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – Frank and Frances Young House**

APPLICANT: Martin Oliver; represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 4476 Granger Street, 92107, Sunset Cliffs Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Frank and Frances Young House located at 4476 Granger Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Frank and Frances Young House located at 4476 Granger Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criteria C and D. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a cross gabled red clay tile roof with little eave overhang; stucco wall cladding; decorative privacy grille on its partial width side entry porch with square support columns; decorative triangular attic vents; wood beamed ceiling; divided light wood casement windows; and unique “beehive” chimney.
2. The subject resource retains excellent integrity and continues to reflect Frank E. Young’s original design, intent and aesthetic. Specifically, the house is notable as a unique example of Master Builder Frank E. Young’s early work in the Spanish Eclectic architectural style, which he lived in during his career in San Diego before designing larger buildings.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. This property sits on a sloped lot facing Granger Street, and is located in Sunset Cliffs Neighborhood of the Peninsula Community Plan Area.

The building is located on APN 530-430-1600. The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, Frank and Frances Young House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Master Builder Frank E. Young, who built the house in 1927 as a personal residence for he and his wife Frances.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Legacy 106 Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criteria C and D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The resource is a one-story single family Spanish Eclectic style home with a cross gabled clay tile roof and asymmetrical façade that sits on a slope that rises to the southeast. Its roof consists of flat and shed roof types at different elevations of the home. The front gable is topped with decorative ridge tile with three round clay tile vents in triangular formation. The front facing gable features rectangular central double window openings with two three part divided light casement windows. Wooden plank style shutters that used to be adjacent to this were removed. Its partial width covered porch is supported by simple square columns, decorative corbels, and support beams, with a recessed doorway entry to the northwest. To the right of the front-facing gable end, the side gable portion features six square stucco openings as a privacy grille.

The home exhibits unique Spanish Eclectic features, including a circular “beehive” stucco chimney topped off with a miniature clay tile roof on its Southeast elevation. Original double three light casement windows flank either side of this chimney. Another raised concrete patio area with a stepped back private patio area resides on this side of the home, with a later added wood framed pergola to shade the area.

The residence features a detached double car garage with original stucco and clay tile roofing from its 1927 date of construction. The garage door has been replaced to a modern metal folding door. In 1964 a west side laundry room addition was added to the garage, out of view from the street. The owners wish to exclude the rear garage addition all together, however staff does not find enough basis for this request as the garage retains integrity to the building’s period of significance. Therefore designation should include the detached garage, but exclude its 1964 laundry room addition.

The applicant’s report states that the owners wish to designate the property’s interior architectural features, specifically its beamed ceiling and fireplace. However the owner no longer wishes to include these elements.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the

predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style including its cross gabled red clay tile roof with little eave overhang; stucco wall cladding; decorative privacy grille on its partial width side entry porch with square support columns; decorative triangular attic vents; wood beamed ceiling; divided light wood casement windows; and unique “beehive” chimney. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Francis “Frank” E. Young was born in Pennsylvania on July 8, 1896. He graduated with a civil engineering degree from the Carnegie Institute of Technology and later went on to become a chief draftsman for the Aetna Chemical Company as well as a general manager for a large contracting firm. Frank’s second wife, Frances Ogle, and he moved to San Diego in 1925 as he founded the F.E. Young Construction Company. After this he worked as a consultant on real estate issues for civic and business organizations and estates. He was chairman of the F.E. Young Foundation and gave out numerous scholarships to Fathers Association of Culver Military Academy and Stanford University.

In September 1927, the F.E. Young Company purchased lot 16 in block 8 of Sunset Cliffs and completed construction of the subject residence December 9, 1927. Frank built and lived in the home with his wife until her death in 1937, and then continued to own the residence until 1941. The subject property would be an example of Frank’s early work is primarily in the Spanish Eclectic architectural style.

In 2000, The Historical Resources Board established him as a Master Builder with the designation of the Veterans’ War Memorial Building in Balboa Park (HRB Site # 412). After this construction, Frank went on to build many homes in the popular Spanish Eclectic and Colonial Revival style. He remained active in designing churches and commercial buildings through the Great Depression of the 1930s until World War II. His obituary in the *San Diego Union* indicates that his company also built The Union-Tribune building, San Diego Public Library, and many public schools within San Diego.

Significance Statement: The subject resource retains excellent integrity and continues to reflect Frank E. Young’s original design, intent and aesthetic. The house is notable as a unique example of Master Builder Frank E. Young’s early work in the Spanish Eclectic architectural style, which

he lived in during his career in San Diego before designing larger buildings. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion D as a resource representative of the notable work of Master Builder Frank E. Young.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staffs field check, it is recommended that the Frank and Frances Young House located at 4476 Granger Street be designated with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that exhibits the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style; and HRB Criterion D as a resource that is representative of the notable work of Master Builder Frank E. Young. Designation shall exclude the 1964 laundry room addition to the detached garage. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jane Kang
Planning Intern



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

JK./ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 2/25/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 2/25/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **Frank and Frances Young House** (owned by Oliver Martin, 4476 Granger Street, San Diego, CA 92107) located at **4476 Granger Street, San Diego, CA 92107**, APN: **530-430-16-00**, further described as BLK 8 LOT 16 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. o**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Frank and Frances House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics in the Spanish Eclectic Style, and retains integrity to its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a cross gabled red clay tile roof with little eave overhang; stucco wall cladding; decorative privacy grille on its partial width side entry porch with square support columns; decorative triangular attic vents; wood beamed ceiling; divided light wood casement windows; and unique "beehive" chimney. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Builder Frank E. Young. Specifically, the house is notable as a unique example of Master Builder Frank E. Young's early work in the Spanish Eclectic architectural style, which he lived in during his career in San Diego before designing larger buildings. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. o**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1964 laundry room addition to the detached garage.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney