



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: March 17, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-018

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of March 24, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #14 – Lawrence and Dorothy Michel Spec House #1**

APPLICANT: Angela Rock & Megan Humpal Revocable Trust represented by IS Architecture

LOCATION: 4842 Biona Drive, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Lawrence and Dorothy Michel Spec House #1 located at 4842 Biona Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Lawrence and Dorothy Michel Spec House #1 located at 4842 Biona Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1931 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the approximately 400 square foot rear addition constructed in 2014. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a predominantly flat roof with parapet; tiled gable roof at the front; clay vents in the gable ends; generally smooth stucco over wood framing; a centered, recessed entry porch accessed via concrete steps; and fenestration consisting of single pane fixed and 1-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is located on APN 465-261-08-00 in the residential subdivision of Kensington Park Extension. The property was located within the boundary of the 1996 Mid-City Survey, but was not identified in the survey for unknown reasons.

The historic name of the resource, the Lawrence and Dorothy Michel Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the individuals who built the property as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by IS Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria B and C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not HRB Criterion B. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 4842 Biona Drive did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Kensington's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 4842 Biona Drive did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. The applicant's report concludes that the building is significant for its association with owners Frank and Eleanor Lantry, who were associated with the house from 1933-2014. The Lantrys were very civically engaged; however, there is no information to suggest that they were historically significant. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property located at 4842 Biona Drive is a one story single family home constructed in 1931 in the Spanish Eclectic style and features a predominantly flat roof with parapet; tiled gable roof at the front; clay vents in the gable ends; and generally smooth stucco over wood framing. The recessed entry porch is generally centered and accessed via concrete steps. A tripartite window is centered at the porch and the entry door is set to the right, perpendicular to the street. To the left and right of the entry porch are larger single-lite fixed windows with small decorative shutters. Windows are generally 1-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows.

Modifications include removal of a non-historic bay window on the south side elevation, which was replaced with a 1-over-1 double hung wood window; a rear extension of the garage; and minor modifications in 2014/2015 consisting of a rear addition and minor window modifications on the north and south elevations. The modifications are minor and do not significantly impair the building's integrity. The 2014/2015 modifications were reviewed and approved by historic resources staff as consistent with the US Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the

architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a predominantly flat roof with parapet; tiled gable roof at the front; clay vents in the gable ends; generally smooth stucco over wood framing; a centered, recessed entry porch accessed via concrete steps; and fenestration consisting of single pane fixed and 1-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C. The approximately 400 square foot rear addition constructed in 2014 shall be excluded from the designation.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The Notice of Completion states that Lawrence Michel constructed the property at 4842 Biona Drive for himself. The Board has not established Michel as a Master Builder, and there is insufficient information to establish him as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 4842 Biona Drive has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 4842 Biona Drive is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Lawrence and Dorothy Michel Spec House #1 located at 4842 Biona Drive be designated with a period of significance of 1931 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains integrity. The approximately 400 square foot rear addition constructed in 2014 shall be excluded from the designation. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

KS

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 3/24/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 3/24/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **Lawrence and Dorothy Michel Spec House #1** (owned by Angela Rock & Megan Humpal Revocable Trust 2015, 4842 Biona Drive, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **4842 Biona Drive, San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **465-261-08-00**, further described as BLK B LOT 8 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Lawrence and Dorothy Michel Spec House #1 on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains integrity to its 1931 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a predominantly flat roof with parapet; tiled gable roof at the front; clay vents in the gable ends; generally smooth stucco over wood framing; a centered, recessed entry porch accessed via concrete steps; and fenestration consisting of single pane fixed and 1-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the approximately 400 square foot rear addition constructed in 2014.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney