



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

## Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: March 17, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB 16-020

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board  
Agenda of March 24, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #12 – W.G. Reinhardt Apartments**

APPLICANT: Episcopal Community Services represented by Maria Burke Lia

LOCATION: 1425 and 1431 C Street, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the W.G. Reinhardt Apartments located at 1425 and 1431 C Street as a historical resource.

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the W.G. Reinhardt Apartments located at 1425 and 1431 C Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1908 and 1912, respectively, under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resources embody the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Prairie style and retain a good level of architectural integrity from their respective periods of significance. Specifically, the resource at 1425 C Street retains the low pitched hipped roof, wide overhanging eaves, horizontal emphasis, wood fixed and double hung windows, wood lap siding, and corner oriel windows. The resource at 1431 C Street retains the low pitched hipped roof, wide overhanging eaves, horizontal emphasis, wood fixed and double hung windows, wood lap siding, and bay windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of both buildings under HRB Criterion C.

### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application to determine whether or not the buildings are historically significant as part of a constraints analysis for future development. The buildings are located in the downtown core and directly across from City College. In addition to the institutional buildings adjacent to the subject buildings, there are a number of commercial and multifamily buildings in close proximity.

The buildings are located on APN 534-210-12. The property was identified in the 2003 Historic Site Inventory of Centre City East and given a Status Code of 5S2, "Individual property that is eligible for local listing or designation." The property was also listed in the 2005 Centre City East Combined Historical Survey and given the same status code as the previous survey.

The historic name of the resource, the W. G. Reinhardt Apartments has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the person who constructed the buildings as apartments.

## ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Marie Lia, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and Staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

*CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.*

Research into the history of the property at 1425 and 1431 C Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Downtown's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

*CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.*

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 1425 and 1431 C Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

*CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

### 1425 C Street

Constructed in 1908 in the Prairie style, the exterior of the three story building is sheathed with wood lap siding. The resource features a low pitched hipped roof with a northern and southern dormer. The roof is sheathed with asphalt shingles and features decorative, exposed rafter ends. The main (south) façade is dominated by the centrally located front porch at the second floor. The porch is slightly inset and features four wood and glass doors that access the units. The porch proper protrudes from the face of the building several feet and has low walls with support columns. The corner support columns are sheathed with lap siding with inset Ionic columns. The porch is accessed via a set of wide steps with wood rails. The second floor of the porch is a balcony with simple wood posts accessed via two wood and glass doors flanked by two casement windows. Each corner of the building features a two story squared oriel window with leaded fixed glass windows at each corner flanked by 1/1 double hung windows. The east and west facades feature symmetrically placed windows on the first and second floors with the exception of the west side first floor. This location also features an oriel window. The rear of the building features an enclosed porch that protrudes off of the face of the building. The enclosed porch features evenly spaced windows and is accessed via stairs that lead to the second and third floors.

## 1431 C Street

Constructed in 1912, the subject building is a one story duplex located at the rear of the lot. Similar to the main building, the exterior is sheathed with wood lap siding and features wood double hung and fixed windows. The building features a hipped roof with a flat roofed wing at the south façade. The north façade features a small concrete front porch that provides access to two entrance doors. The porch has a flat roof and is supported by square columns. The north façade also features a bay window with a fixed window flanked by 1/1 double hung windows. The rear of this building features a non-historic wood deck and a squared off oriel window.

Modifications to both buildings are limited, the rear of 1425 C Street is noted as an open porch in the Sanborn maps, the steps at the front porch appear to have been replaced with Trex, and a metal railing has been added to the inside of the front porch railing. The front porch is not shown on the Sanborn maps, but the siding matches the existing and the design is consistent with the style of the building. Staff believes that the porch is original to the house. At 1431 C Street, an ADA ramp was added to the front façade, a wood deck was added to the rear and it appears that a few of the windows have been replaced in the existing openings. The limited modifications do not detract from the character-defining features.

The Prairie style originated in Chicago and was popular primarily in the Midwest for the early part of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. An indigenous American style, the Prairie School shared the ideals of the British Arts and Crafts movement and was popularized by architects including Frank Lloyd Wright, George Maher and others. Character defining features of Prairie style architecture include low-pitched, usually hipped roofs, wide overhanging eaves, and façade detailing emphasizing horizontal lines. Pattern books and popular magazines spread vernacular examples widely to suburbs throughout the country, with most being built between 1905 and 1915.

Significance Statement: The building at 1425 C Street continues to convey the historic significance of the Prairie style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including low pitched hipped roof, wide overhanging eaves, horizontal emphasis, wood fixed and double hung windows, wood lap siding, and corner oriel windows. The building at 1431 C Street continues to convey the historic significance of the Prairie style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including low pitched hipped roof, wide overhanging eaves, horizontal emphasis, wood fixed and double hung windows, wood lap siding, and bay windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of both buildings under HRB Criterion C.

*CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.*

Research into the construction of the property at 1425 and 1431 C Street failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

*CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.*

The property at 1425 and 1431 C Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

*CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.*

The property at 1425 and 1431 C Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

#### OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

#### CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the W.G. Reinhardt Apartments located at 1425 and 1431 C Street be designated with a period of significance of 1908 and 1912, respectively, under HRB Criterion C as good examples of Prairie style architecture. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



\_\_\_\_\_  
Jodie Brown, AICP  
Senior Planner



\_\_\_\_\_  
Kelley Stanco  
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

JB/ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A  
ADOPTED ON 3/24/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 3/24/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **W.G. Reinhardt Apartments** (owned by Episcopal Community Services, 4305 University Avenue #400, San Diego, CA 92105) located at **1425 and 1431 C Street, San Diego, CA 92101**, APN: **534-210-12-00**, further described as BLK 179 LOTS K & L W 1/2 OF N 40 FT LOT J & W 1/2 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the W.G. Reinhardt Apartments on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Prairie style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1908 and 1912 periods of significance. Specifically, the resource at 1425 C Street retains the low pitched hipped roof, wide overhanging eaves, horizontal emphasis, wood fixed and double hung windows, wood lap siding, and corner oriel windows. The resource at 1431 C Street retains the low pitched hipped roof, wide overhanging eaves, horizontal emphasis, wood fixed and double hung windows, wood lap siding, and bay windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
JOHN LEMMO, Chair  
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,  
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
CORRINE NEUFFER,  
Deputy City Attorney