

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

| DATE ISSUED: | August 11, 2022 | REPORT NO. HRB-22-029 |
|----------------|--|-----------------------|
| HEARING DATE: | August 25, 2022 | |
| SUBJECT: | ITEM #03 – Allie A. Knox Speculation House | |
| RESOURCE INFO: | California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link | |
| APPLICANT: | Marie K & Michael Huff; represented by Vonn Marie May | |
| LOCATION: | 3353 Goldsmith Street, Peninsula Community APN 450-131-18-00 | , Council District 2 |
| DESCRIPTION: | Consider the designation of the Allie A. Knox Speculation House located at 3353 Goldsmith Street as a historical resource. | |

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Allie A. Knox Speculation House located at 3353 Goldsmith Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1914 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the detached garage/guest house, which was constructed and altered outside the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of characterdefining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1914 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a cross-gable roof form, wood roof shingles, exposed roof rafters, exposed beams, shed dormers, stucco and wood shingle cladding, and various fixed and casement windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a two-story residential building with a detached garage in the Loma Portal neighborhood, near the intersection of Chatsworth Boulevard and Goldsmith Street.

The property was identified by the Quieter Homes Program and was determined to be a contributor to the National Register eligible Loma Portal Historic District.

The historic name of the resource, the Allie A. Knox Speculation House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Allie A. Knox, who constructed the house as a speculation house.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Landmark Historic Preservation, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not HRB Criterion B. This determination is consistent with the <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u>, as follows.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, State or national history.

Charles H. Forward (1886-1981) was the primary resident of the subject property from 1916 to 1977, totaling 62 years. Forward attended San Diego High School and later obtained a law degree from the Hastings School of Law in San Francisco. His career included high-stakes court cases involving railroad companies, corporations, and property and probate law. Forward's military service included serving the Port of San Diego as a Captain, serving in the Merchant Marines, and serving in the Coast Guard Reserve. During World War II, Forward supervised the loading of explosives on Navy Merchant ships. The *San Diego Union* credits Charles Forward in helping to obtain city land next to Lindbergh Field for the Coast Guard. His civic associations include membership at the Cuyama Club and the American Legion's Downtown Post. In 1955, the California Tidelands Protective Association appointed Charles Forward as the acting Chairman.

While Charles H. Forward has served as a prominent lawyer in high-profile cases, insufficient information and analysis have been offered in the Historical Resources Research Report at this time to determine the significance of this individual. More information is required to detail Forward's significant achievements and contributions. Forward's contributions to the California Tidelands Protective Association are unknown at this time. The *San Francisco Chronicle* reported in 1955 that the California Tidelands Protective Association was involved in charges and counter-charges of illegal lobbying; the organization's work appeared to have been centered on the Allen bill, a proposal that the State take over the oil and gas revenues from the Long Beach tidelands.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 3353 Goldsmith Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, State or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, State or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B at this time. More information may be provided at a later date to substantiate the historical significance of Charles H. Forward.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

Constructed in 1914, the subject property features a two-story, cross-gable form. The lower half of the residence is primarily clad in stucco, while the upper half of the structure is clad in sawn wood shingles. Likely constructed of fire-resistant blocks along the ground floor, this wood-framed

building features a shingle roof, which also exhibits shingles bent around the roof edges. Rafter tails are present along the east and west elevations. In general, windows on the ground floor are inset into the stucco, whereas windows on wood shingle walls were installed with simple rectangular moldings.

The north elevation, the street-facing elevation, features a covered partial-width front porch. The porch cover consists of brackets, fascia, and unenclosed rafters. The front door features three glazed openings and two panels. Fenestration on this elevation includes a horizontal ribbon grouping of five casement windows on the ground floor and two pairs of casement windows on the second floor. Exposed beams are also present along this gable, situated below the fascia board. The east elevation includes a gable and a shed dormer on the second floor. The ground floor features a shingle-clad bay below the fable. A pair of French doors is on the ground floor, and fenestration along this elevation includes fixed windows (some with operable transoms) and a casement/fixed window grouping. The west elevation contains a one-story gabled wing and concrete steps that lead to a basement. This one-story wing has casement windows and French doors. A larger shed dormer is present in the second story. Casement windows dominate fenestration along this elevation. The south elevation mirrors the north elevation regarding gable form, roof pitch, and exposed beam details. This elevation contains a French door, casement windows, and fixed windows with transom.

The site also contains a garage/guest house which was constructed in 1922 and later modified. This cross-gable assessor structure features similar design elements as the primary residence, such as wood shingle and stucco cladding. A brick-paved terraced garden is also present. Brick is also present on the front porch leading to the sidewalk. The side yard hardscape consists of concrete and is accessible through a Hollywood-style sandstone paver driveway, past a pair of motorcourt doors.

Modifications to the property include the enclosure of a screened-in porch along the east elevation at an unknown date; alterations to the detached garage at an unknown date; and the post-2015 addition of sandstone pavers to the existing driveway. In 2003, City staff approved the in-kind replacement of windows through the Quieter Homes Program as consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. These modifications do not significantly impair the integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

The subject property, although lacking the typical front porch columns/piers, retains characteristics attributable to the Craftsman style, such as wood roof shingles, exposed roof rafters, exposed beams, a cross-gable form, shed dormers, stucco and wood shingle cladding, and a variety of wood windows.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a cross-gable roof form, wood roof shingles, exposed roof rafters, exposed beams, shed dormers, stucco and wood shingle cladding, and various fixed and casement windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The applicant's request for designation for the property located at 3353 Goldsmith Street did not include information to support a determination under HRB Criterion D; therefore, staff has not made a determination regarding eligibility under Criterion D at this time. Eligibility under this criterion may can be reevaluated at a future date pending submittal of additional information and analysis.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Allie A. Knox Speculation House located at 3353 Goldsmith Street be designated with a period of significance of 1914 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the detached garage/guesthouse, which was constructed and altered outside the period of significance.

Alvin Lin Assistant Planner

Al/SS

Attachment(s):

hal

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison Development Services Department

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 8/25/2022

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 8/25/2022, to consider the historical designation of the **Allie A. Knox Speculation House** (owned by Huff 2004 Trust 09-24-04, 3353 Goldsmith Street, San Diego, CA 92106) located at **3353 Goldsmith Street**, **San Diego, CA 92106**, APN: **450-131-18-00**, further described as BLK 20 LOT 5 NWLY H OF LOT 6&ALL OF in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Allie A. Knox Speculation House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C through the retention of characterdefining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1914 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a cross-gable roof form, wood roof shingles, exposed roof rafters, exposed beams, shed dormers, stucco and wood shingle cladding, and various fixed and casement windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the detached garage/guest house, which was constructed and altered outside the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

| Vote: |
|-------|
| |

BY:

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY:

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney

RECORDING REQUESTED BY CITY OF SAN DIEGO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD ATTN: HRB SECRETARY 1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

3353 Goldsmith Street, San Diego, CA 92106

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER 450-131-18-00

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER 0

THIS PAGE ADDED TO PROVIDE ADEQUATE SPACE FOR RECORDING INFORMATION (Additional recording fee applies)