



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 14, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-061

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of September 20, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM 10 – Park + Market (1127-1137 G Street) – Centre City Planned Development Permit/Site Development Permit No. 2016-15**

APPLICANT: Holland Partner Group represented by Heritage Architecture & Planning

OWNER: City of San Diego

LOCATION: 1127-1137 G Street, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit as presented or recommend inclusion of additional permit conditions related to a designated historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the permit findings and mitigation measures associated with the Site Development Permit for the relocation of the designated historical resource located at 1127-1137 G Street (HRB Site #426, the Remmen Building) as presented.

BACKGROUND

The City's Land Development Code Section 126.0503(b)(2) requires a recommendation from the Historical Resources Board prior to the Planning Commission decision on a Site Development Permit when a historical district or designated historical resource is present. The HRB has adopted the following procedure for making recommendations to decision-makers (Historical Resources Board Procedures, Section II.B):

When the Historical Resources Board is taking action on a recommendation to a decision-maker, the Board shall make a recommendation on only those aspects of the matter that relate to the historical aspects of the project. The Board's recommendation action(s) shall relate to the cultural resources section, recommendations, findings and mitigation measures of the final environmental document, the Site Development Permit findings for historical purposes, and/or the project's compliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for

Treatment of Historic Properties. If the Board desires to recommend the inclusion of additional conditions, the motion should include a request for staff to incorporate permit conditions to capture the Board's recommendations when the project moves forward to the decision maker.

The Remmen Building is located at 1127-1137 G Street in the Downtown Community Planning area. The building was originally constructed in 1907 in the Craftsman style with Neoclassical influences. On June 6, 2000, the property was designated by the Historical Resources Board under HRB Criterion C as a good example of a Craftsman two story apartment building with Neoclassical influences.

The applicant proposes construction of a mixed-use project with a thirty-four story tower containing approximately 427 residential units; 51,260SF of office space; and 22,641SF of retail space. The project will also include 5,465 SF of open space, a 3,198SF amphitheater and a 5,000SF upper terrace overlooking the public plaza. Below grade, the project will feature a 613 parking space garage in four levels (Attachments 1, 2 and 6). As part of the overall project, the applicant is proposing to temporarily relocate the designated resource to a vacant parcel at southeast corner of Market and 13th Street for approximately one year. The temporary relocation allows the excavation of the subterranean garage and reduces the potential for damage to the historic resource. Once the garage is complete, the historic resource will be returned to the parcel, shifted and reoriented to the east to front on to Park Boulevard. The space to the west and south of the relocated building will be utilized as open space. Once rehabilitated, the designated resource will be utilized as commercial space.

The proposed project would require the historic building to be moved in one piece to the temporary site and back again to the new location at the northeast corner of Park Boulevard and G Street. The relocation would require removal of the exterior plumbing pipes, the exterior concrete steps, the historic chimney and the ashlar blocks at the foundation. The brick chimney and the ashlar block foundation would be documented and catalogued prior to their removal. The brick and the block will be stored along with the house at the 1301 Market Street in a locked in a weather-tight steel container. The front steps will be documented and demolished prior to the move. Portions of the steps will be maintained for reconstruction purposes. The windows and the doors on the building would be boarded with plywood in a manner that does not damage the trim or the window. The rear deck and stairs will be removed prior to relocation. The front porch, including the porch floor, balustrade, columns, roof, trim and decorative elements will be protected in place and securely shored for the move. While at the temporary site, the house will be monitored on a weekly basis to ensure that the house is secure.

Once the subterranean parking garage is complete, the house will be returned to the original parcel at Park Boulevard and G Street and rotated 90 degrees. The rotation will orient the house towards Park Boulevard rather than G Street. At the new permanent location, the house will be lowered so the finish floor is approximately 30" above the adjacent sidewalk. Once installed at its new height, the exterior of the building will be restored consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The restoration would include reconstruction of the existing chimney and the two non extant chimneys; reconstruction of the front stairs; re-installation of the ashlar block; repair and painting of the exterior siding; window repair; and replacement of the roofing material. A tenant for the building has not been identified at this time, so the interior will not be modified until a lease is signed for the property. In an effort to ready the building for a future tenant, a wood deck will be added to the south side of the house and a pair of double hung windows on the same side will be

cut down to convert to doors to access the site. As summarized above and provided in Attachment 5, the proposed rehabilitation of the structure at the new site would be consistent with the Standards.

ANALYSIS

The proposed relocation of the designated building is by definition a substantial alteration requiring a site development permit, consistent with Municipal Code Section 143.0251. Impacts related to the proposed alteration and relocation would be reduced through implementation of the required mitigation measures found in the Downtown Final Environmental Impact Report (Downtown FEIR) Draft Consistency Evaluation for the Park + Market Project (Attachment 3). Findings for the relocation of a designated historical resource are required for approval of the permit, consistent with Municipal Code Section 126.0504(h).

The three required Supplemental Findings and supporting information are provided in Attachment 4 and are summarized below.

1. There are no feasible measures, including maintaining the resource on site, that can further minimize the potential adverse effects on historical resources.

The project proposes relocation, rehabilitation and reuse of the Remmen Building, from its current location at 1127-1137 G Street in the Centre City Planned District to 1301 Market Street temporarily and returning to the northeast corner of the site with an orientation to the east. Relocation of the building would allow development of underground parking, in addition to the above grade development discussed earlier. The developer evaluated maintaining the resource at its current site. Retention at the site would limit overall development and require an additional level of subterranean garage to provide adequate parking. Each additional parking space would cost approximately \$60,000 resulting in a cost of nine million dollars for the additional floor making this alternative infeasible. The Findings also note that the relocation of the resource would allow for the protection of the building during the construction of the parking garage and associated features. The proposed relocation and rehabilitation will result in reduced impacts to the overall integrity of the resource while keeping it in close proximity to its original location with increased public visibility.

2. The proposed relocation will not destroy the historical, cultural or architectural values of the historical resource and the relocation is part of a definitive series of actions that will assure the preservation of the designated historical resource.

The developer has agreed to implement measures identified in the FEIR Mitigation, Monitoring and Reporting Program pertaining to the relocation, rehabilitation and reuse of designated historical resource #426, the Remmen Building. Further, the developer has identified a relocation site. The relocation site meets the requirements of the National Park Service's Criterion Consideration B for Moved Properties and the City's Historical Resources Regulations on the same subject. After relocation and stabilization of the resource, it will be rehabilitated in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. A qualified historical architect monitor will supervise the relocation and rehabilitation project. The property's status as a designated historical resource will be maintained and the property will remain a designated resource under the jurisdiction of the San Diego Historical Resources Board. These measures ensure that the proposed relocation,

rehabilitation and reuse will not destroy the historical, cultural, or architectural values of the historical resource and the relocation will be part of a definitive series of actions to assure the preservation of the designated historical resource.

3. There are special circumstances or conditions apart from the existence of the historical resource, applying to the land that are peculiar to the land and are not of the applicant's making, whereby the strict application of the provisions of the historical resources regulations would deprive the property owner of reasonable use of the land.

The Downtown Community Plan's goals for the surrounding neighborhood call for greater development, especially on vacant land and underdeveloped sites. Consistent with these goals, the area surrounding the site has seen an increase in density and larger scale development in the last several years. Included in this growth are multi-story development projects which are located directly east, south and northwest from the Remmen Building. The existing site constraints which include the city dedication of 28' of the block to right of way purposes to facilitate the Park to Bay Link (Balboa Park to the San Diego bay); the location of the historical resource which occupies a lot zoned for higher density; and the overall setting and context of the neighborhood constitute special circumstances and conditions which exist apart from the presence of the historical resource. These special circumstances applying to the land are peculiar to the land and are not of the developer's making. Therefore the strict application of the provisions of the Historical Resources Regulations would deprive the developer, as the property owner, of reasonable use of the land.

CONCLUSION

Staff concurs that the proposed mitigation measures and permit conditions provided to the HRB are sufficient to reduce the identified impacts to the Remmen Building. Therefore, staff recommends that the Historical Resources Board recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the findings and mitigation measures associated with Planned Development/Site Development Permit No. 2016-15 for the relocation of the designated historical resource located at 1127-1137 G Street (HRB Site #426, the Remmen Building) as presented.



Jodie Brown, AICP
Senior Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

JB/cw

Attachments:

1. Civic San Diego's Staff Report dated July 5, 2016
2. Draft Centre City Development Permit/Neighborhood Use Permit/Site Development Permit 2016-15 (under separate cover)
3. Downtown Final Environmental Impact Report (Downtown FEIR) Draft Consistency Evaluation for the Park + Market Project dated September 7, 2016 (under separate cover)
4. Findings (under separate cover)
5. Treatment Plan (under separate cover)
6. Park + Market Project Plans (under separate cover)