



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 10, 2020 REPORT NO. HRB-20-045

HEARING DATE: September 24, 2020

SUBJECT: **ITEM #10 – Arthur and Catherine Welcome House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Sean Anstead and Cherie Carter; represented by Johnson & Johnson Architecture

LOCATION: 3204 Felton Street, North Park Community, Council District 3
APN 453-573-22-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of Arthur and Catherine Welcome House located at 3204 Felton Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Arthur and Catherine Welcome House located at 3204 Felton Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1922 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the laundry closet addition on the south façade constructed outside of the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1922 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low-pitched cross gabled roof with unenclosed eaves; exposed painted wood gable beams and rafter tails; decorative porch brackets; lattice gable attic vents; wood windows and doors with muntins; and wood clapboard siding.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a single-family Craftsman style residence located in North Park in a predominantly single-family neighborhood.

The property was located within the boundary of the 2016 North Park Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey but was not identified in the survey because it was not evaluated.

The historic name of the resource, the Arthur and Catherine Welcome House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Arthur and Catherine Welcome, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by Johnson & Johnson Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource, 3204 Felton Street, is a one-story single-family residence constructed in 1922 in the Craftsman Bungalow style. The house features green painted wood clapboard siding, wood windows painted red with white painted trim, and low pitched, cross-gable and double gabled roofs with an unenclosed wide eave overhang that shows off the exposed beams and extended rafter ends. Facing Felton street, the east façade features a large, most uncovered, raised porch covered in red tile and with decorative brick porch roof supports on either side of the three stairs leading up to the entry. Extending above the door is small gable roof with an enclosed eave made of white painted wood soffit and fascia. Large, decoratively carved, painted white and light green porch brackets hold up the roof extension. Flanking both sides of the entry are tall double casement windows featuring low sills, muttins and eared trim. To the left a gable end wing comes out from the main body of the residence. Facing the street are three casement windows grouped together matching the look and design of those at the entry. Above the windows are two beams on either side of the gable that connect to the roof under the rafters.

On top of the south façade is a cross gable roof with an unenclosed wide eave overhang that shows off two exposed beams. Under the top corner of the southern gable end is a light green lattice attic vent with white trim. Nearest to the street is a medium sized double casement windows featuring low sills, muttins and eared trim. Further in is an aluminum framed slider window with a white painted trim. A laundry closet extends out from the house with hipped roof feature unenclosed wide eave overhang that shows off the exposed beams, siding wider than that on the resource, and a pair of painted white doors with a wide white trim. Immediately next to the closet is a set of three concrete steps leading up to a white painted wood door with a full lite pattern that includes muntins and a white painted steel security door.

The west façade faces the backyard and is topped by the side of a gable roof featuring an unenclosed wide eave overhang that shows off the exposed beams. On the right end is a wooden slider window with undivided lights and a screen over top of it. In the center is a tri-window with a large fixed window flanked by smaller dual casement windows, all with muntins. The windows are surrounded by a white painted wood trim featuring high sills and eared trim. To the left is a wooden double hung window with single lites. A small raised, concrete porch with three steps painted red leads to a pop-out with a white painted wood half-light door.

The north façade features a double gable end with an unenclosed wide eave overhang. Beneath the lower gable roof extension is the pop out from the rear facade wrapping around. On either side of the gable's point is a white wooden beam that extends from the siding and meets the roof underneath the rafter. Closest to the rear is an aluminum framed slider with undivided lites situated in a white painted wood trim with no sill. To it's left is single lite double hung wooden window with a short sill, painted white and red. Meeting at the corner of the main part of the house and the pop-out are two separate windows. A single lite double hung wooden window with a short sill, painted white and red, faces the chimney and has one roof beam above it. A small double casement window with muntins and eared trim faces north and is a part of a pair that flank the chimney. A red painted brick chimney that cuts through the roof and has a simple cap with a two brick height.

The detached, two car garage sits behind the house on its south-west side. The garage is covered in green siding that matches the house and is topped with a low pitch gable roof with unenclosed eave that is short on the east and west facades and wide on the south and north facades. Just below the gable on the front and rear are small, two lite awning windows painted red. The front features a one car interior sliding door with white trim and vertical siding on it's left side. The north facade has a white door with white trim on its left corner and wide fixed window with a high sill divided by a three lite pattern.

Modifications include the addition of a laundry closet on the south façade, an aluminum window replacement within the original window opening on the south facade, and added window opening on the back part of the north facade with an aluminum window, and tile on the front porch; all added on unknown dates, but before 2008. Gutters were added sometime between 2009 through 2011 on the front and rear facades, and the extended rafter tails were shortened to accommodate them. These modifications do not impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling as it relates to Criterion C.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; multiple roof planes; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; decorative attic vents; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1922 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low-pitched cross gabled roof with unenclosed eaves; exposed painted wood gable beams and rafter tails; decorative porch brackets; lattice gable attic vents; wood windows and doors with muntins; and wood clapboard siding.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Arthur and Catherine Welcome House located at 3204 Felton Street be designated with a period of significance of 1922 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Craftsman Bungalow style. The designation excludes the laundry closet addition on the south façade.



Megan Bacik
Junior Planner

MB/ss



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner
Development Services Department

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 9/24/2020

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 9/24/2020, to consider the historical designation of the Arthur and Catherine Welcome House (owned by Sean Ansted and Cherie Carter, 3204 Felton Street, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **3204 Felton Street, San Diego, CA 92104**, APN: **453-573-22-00**, further described as BLK J LOT 19 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance Specifically, the resource features a low-pitched cross gabled roof with unenclosed eaves; exposed painted wood gable beams and rafter tails; decorative porch brackets; lattice gable attic vents; wood windows and doors with muntins; and wood clapboard siding. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the laundry closet addition on the south façade constructed

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney