



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 8, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-058

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of September 20, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #14 – Edgar and Carrie Coleman Residence**

APPLICANT: Steve and Audrey Ross represented by IS Architecture

LOCATION: 7510–7516½ Draper Avenue, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of Edgar and Carrie Coleman Residence as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Edgar and Carrie Coleman Residence located at 7510–7516½ Draper Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1946-1957 under HRB Criterion A. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource reflects a special element of La Jolla's historical, cultural, social and economic development and retains integrity to the circa 1946-1957 period of significance, the time period in which the structures were relocated or constructed on the site. Specifically, the structures represent the entrepreneurial efforts of La Jolla Black Pioneer Edgar Coleman and retain integrity for an association with La Jolla's Black community.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board by the owner as part of a constraints analysis for future sale of the property. The subject resource consists of three residential buildings: two one-story vernacular beach cottages, which were constructed circa 1906 and 1905 and moved from other sites, and a Minimal Traditional Duplex constructed in 1957. The property is located on APN 350-442-14 in the La Jolla Park subdivision of the La Jolla Community.

The historic name of the resource, the Edgar and Carrie Coleman Residence, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Edgar and Carrie Coleman who compiled the buildings on the site and resided in one of the cottages.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by IS Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion A and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The village of La Jolla began in the 1880s during the "boom" period of San Diego's history as a small coastal community. One of the first land tracts in the area was La Jolla Park, which was developed in 1887 by Frank Botsford and was the first subdivision to have identified lots and streets. The first permanent residence in La Jolla was constructed that same year. Historian Patricia Schaechlin described La Jolla's early history as follows: "In 1888, the land collapse left a scraggly collection of cottages, few residents, no improvements and little hope.... La Jolla experienced a steady growth in the first two decades of the twentieth century, a time when the community became a village. It grew from a 350 population, some one hundred houses, to a village and a popular resort with a commercial base of tourism large enough to support its permanent residents."

Beach Cottages were the dominant housing type in La Jolla during this early period through the 1930's. The Beach Cottage style was ideal for use as a summer or winter retreat or, even though lacking in many modern conveniences, they could be and were used as permanent residences. Early beach cottages were characterized (in part) as smaller dwellings, typically one story, with a low pitched roof and exposed rafters; wood siding; a small front porch and garden area; and an orientation toward any available beach or coastal view. Originally known by name, the cottages were not given proper addresses until 1913. By the 1920s, the population had increased to over 2,500 people and the tourism industry was firmly established. Hotels were constructed in increasing numbers, and as the famous and wealthy began to vacation there, the cottages were no longer seen as suitable accommodations. Increased population, tourism and wealth, coupled with shifting architectural preferences, caused Beach Cottages to fall out of favor through the late 1920s and 1930s. In the following decades, many of these early cottages were relocated to less desirable inland lots.

Both 7510 Draper and 7512-7514 Draper were moved from unknown locations to the subject property in 1946-47. Although it is likely that they were located from elsewhere in La Jolla, that cannot be clearly documented in the historical record. Additionally, while they fit some of the characteristics of a typical La Jolla beach cottage they have been altered over time, as discussed in detail under Criterion C. Therefore, because their original location cannot be verified and the buildings have undergone significant alteration since their original construction, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A for the property's association with early 20th century La Jolla beach cottages.

As La Jolla developed in the late 19th century the Black community began to form with several members purchasing lots in the La Jolla Park subdivision. Many members of the Black community moved to La Jolla from the South and East coast to find employment in local domestic service or to start their own family businesses. La Jolla Black Pioneer Edgar Coleman, his wife Carrie and their

children moved to the area from Batesville, Arkansas around 1919. It is known that Coleman was hired to move cottages from the site of the La Valencia Hotel in 1926 and that he owned several lots on Draper Avenue. Eventually, he began to maximize the use of his lots by relocating some of the early beach cottages to the site and constructing new duplexes or apartments. Coleman would rent these units out to other members of the Black community.

In 1946-47, Coleman purchased two cottages from unknown sites and relocated them to the subject property. The Coleman Family moved into the cottage situated at the front of the property, 7510 Draper Avenue. In 1957, Coleman constructed the Minimal Traditional duplex and detached two-car garage on the site. The subject property is a good example of the development pattern of Coleman's lots on Draper Avenue as well as the seasonal and permanent housing trends of La Jolla's Black Community in the early to mid-20th century.

Significance Statement: The resource reflects a special element of La Jolla's historical, cultural, social and economic development and retains integrity to the circa 1946-1957 period of significance, the time period in which the structures were relocated or constructed on the site. Specifically, the structures represent the entrepreneurial efforts of La Jolla Black Pioneer Edgar Coleman and retain integrity for an association with La Jolla's Black community. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 7510-7515½ Draper Avenue did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B. However, if more information about Edgar Coleman and his involvement in La Jolla's Black community becomes available in the future designation under Criterion B may be considered.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The cottage located at 7510 Draper Avenue was constructed at an unknown location circa 1906. Edgar Coleman relocated the house to the present site in 1946 and situated it on the eastern edge of the parcel facing Draper Avenue. The one-story stucco clad Craftsman influenced cottage has a hipped roof with open eaves and exposed rafters. A full-width porch supported by chamfered wood posts covers the east elevation. The porch's floor is painted and scored concrete accented by plain wooden handrails on the stairs. Modifications include the replacement of most of the original wood sash windows in 2005 with the existing aluminum windows.

The second cottage, 7512-7514 Draper Avenue was also constructed at an unknown location circa 1905 and moved to the site by Coleman in 1946-47. The structure is located behind 7510 Draper Avenue. The rectangular one-story duplex is also Craftsman influenced and features wood clapboard siding, a hipped roof with exposed rafters and a partial width porch. A gable projects from the main façade over the two primary entrances and wooden front porch. Modifications include the replacement of most of the original wood sash windows in 2005 with the existing aluminum windows.

The third structure on the property is a Minimal Traditional duplex, 7516 and 7516½ Draper Avenue, constructed in 1957 by Coleman. The main façade of the duplex faces the interior of the lot and the building features an L shaped plan, hipped roof and stucco clad exterior. The metal framed fixed and casement windows appear to be original. A pent roof shelters one of the entrances and the other features a small stoop. The detached garage located in front of this building was constructed on-site during the same period.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

The cottages located at 7510-7514 Draper Avenue would be considered vernacular expressions of the Craftsman style, and exhibit few of the character defining features, including a low-pitch roof, exposed rafters, wood siding (on 7512-7514 Draper), and front porches. The buildings do not, however, reflect any of the other many features of the Craftsman style; and embody the style in a minimal, insignificant way. Additionally, the loss of the original wood windows and installation of aluminum replacements detracts from the architectural integrity of the structures. Furthermore, the Minimal Traditional duplex at 7516 and 7516½ Draper Avenue does not exhibit enough architectural character to be considered significant. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Research into the construction of the property at 7510-7515½ Draper Avenue failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 7510-7515½ Draper Avenue has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character,

historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 7510-7515½ Draper Avenue is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Edgar and Carrie Coleman Residence located at 7510-7516½ Draper Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1945-1957 under HRB Criterion A as a resource that reflects a special element of La Jolla's historical, cultural, social and economic development. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Suzanne Segur
Assistant Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

SS/ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 9/20/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 9/20/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **Edgar and Carrie Coleman Residence** (owned by Steve and Audrey Ross, 5837 W. 74th Street, Westchester, CA 90045) located at **7510-7516½ Draper Avenue, San Diego, CA 92037**, APN: **350-442-14-00**, further described as BLK 12 LOTS 24 & 25 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Edgar and Carrie Coleman Residence on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION A as a special element of La Jolla's historical, cultural, social and economic development and retains integrity to the circa 1946-1957 period of significance, the time period in which the structures were relocated or constructed on the site. Specifically, the structures represent the efforts of La Jolla Black Pioneer Edgar Coleman and retain integrity for an association with La Jolla's Black community. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
COURTNEY ANN COYLE, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney