



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 2, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-062

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of September 14, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #2 – Golden Hill Community Plan Update**

APPLICANT: City of San Diego

LOCATION: Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Review and consider the Golden Hill Community Plan Update as it relates to historical and cultural resources for the purposes of making a recommendation to the City Council.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Recommend to the City Council adoption of the Golden Hill Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey (Historic Survey); the Historic Preservation Element of the Golden Hill Community Plan update (HPE); and the final Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) related to Historical Resources.

BACKGROUND

A Historic Survey consisting of a historic context statement and a detailed reconnaissance survey identifying potential historic districts and individual resources was prepared in support of the Golden Hill Community Plan Update (GHCPU). The information in these documents, along with the Cultural Resources Report (AECOM 2015) was used to identify locations in Golden Hill that may contain significant historical resources. In addition, these documents were used to shape the historic preservation element of the GHCPU, and inform the Land Use and Urban Design elements of the plan.

DISCUSSION

The Golden Hill community is one of the older areas of the City, characterized by its hilly topography and strict street grid interspersed with relatively undeveloped steep canyons to the southwest and southeast, which were probably used prehistorically by Kumeyaay inhabitants and their ancestors as travel routes in to the valley areas, much as they are today. Golden Hill is primarily developed with one- and two-story single-family residences dating from the last quarter of the 19th century through the 1920s, reflecting the popular architectural styles of the day. Many of the area's larger two-story homes have since been converted into multi-unit buildings. Multifamily residential development includes apartment buildings and residential courts from the teens through the 1920s, with occasional postwar infill. Commercial development is primarily clustered along historical streetcar

routes, including 25th, 30th and B Streets; and at well-traveled intersections. The community plan area is composed of two distinct neighborhoods, Golden Hill and South Park. The Golden Hill neighborhood developed somewhat earlier and was populated by some of the City's most affluent residents during the late 19th and early 20th centuries. South Park's development followed, with more modest homes designed to cater to the middle class during the early 20th century.

In support of the GHCPU, a records search revealed eleven cultural resources within Golden Hill that have been recorded by the South Coastal Information Center – one prehistoric lithic and shell scatter, one prehistoric habitation area, and nine historic refuse deposits. As of the completion of the most recent Historic Survey draft in May 2016, Golden Hill is home to one historic resource listed in the National Register of Historic Places – the Alfred Haines House located at 2470 E Street. Additionally, Golden Hill also claims 77 individually designated properties listed in the City of San Diego Register of Historic Resources, and the designated Golden Hill Historic District, which contains 58 contributing resources.

Golden Hill Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey

The Historic Survey prepared by Historic Resources Group (HRG) and the City of San Diego (Attachment 1) provides a project overview; discusses the project methods, including the survey approach, evaluation criteria, and public outreach efforts; provides a historic context addressing the themes significant to development of the plan area and the property types that reflect those significant themes; and identifies potential individual resources and potential historic districts which may be eligible for designation based upon the historic context.

Historic Context

The Historic Context Statement presents an overview of the history of Golden Hill, with a specific emphasis on describing the historic themes and patterns that have contributed to the community's physical development. It presents the history of Golden Hill's built environment from pre-history to the present in order to support and guide identification and evaluation of historic properties throughout the community, as well as to inform future planning decisions. The following themes were identified in the Historic Context:

- Prehistory
- The Early History of Greater Golden Hill: 1769-1885
- An Elite Residential District: 1885-1905
- Streetcar Development: 1905-1930
- An Era of Transitions: 1930-1990

Detailed Reconnaissance Survey

A reconnaissance-level survey, as defined by the National Park Service, is a "once over lightly" inspection of an area. In contrast, an intensive-level survey includes a detailed inspection of the survey area in order to identify "precisely and completely" all historic resources in an area. The historic resources survey for the Golden Hill Community Plan Update is substantially more detailed than a reconnaissance-level survey, but without the degree of documentation required for an intensive-level survey. The purpose of this survey is to identify potentially historic properties within the community plan area for consideration in the community plan update process and for possible future designation. This includes the verification of previously-identified potential historic districts and individual resources, as well as the identification of new historic districts and individual resources.

Fieldwork for the Golden Hill survey began in early 2010 and was completed by HRG, with oversight from the City's historical resources staff. HRG conducted a detailed, property-by-property inspection of the entire community plan area, evaluating all built resources constructed prior to 1970 for potential eligibility to the National, State and local registers. All properties identified as potentially significant – either as an individual site or as a feature of a potential historic district, were documented, and a California Historic Resource Status Code was assigned to each property.

Based upon the historic context statement and the reconnaissance-level survey, HRG and the City of San Diego identified one potential historic district (which also appears eligible for listing on the National and State registers); one Multiple Property Listing (MPL); and 52 properties that appear eligible for individual listing (40 of which appear eligible for listing on the National and State registers). The potential historic district identified is the South Park Residential Historic District, bounded roughly by 28th Street to the west, Date and Cedar streets to the north, the properties in the east side of 29th Street to the east, and A Street to the south. This district reflects a smaller portion of a potential South Park Historic District which was first identified in the 1996 Mid-City Survey.

In addition, the Golden Hill Community Plan Area Historic Survey identified the Residential Court MPL, a discontinuous grouping of approximately eleven residential courts located throughout the plan area. A MPL is a group of related significant properties with shared themes, trends and patterns of history. Such properties are typically grouped within a general geographic area, but not necessarily in a sufficient concentration to form a historic district. A MPL may be used to nominate and register thematically related historic properties simultaneously or to establish the registration requirements for properties that may be nominated individually or in groups in the future. The City does not have a process in place for establishing MPLs, and such procedures are not being proposed in conjunction with the CPU.

The Historic Survey also identified 52 properties as potentially significant individual resources. These include 24 single family homes, 21 multifamily properties, 4 commercial buildings, and 3 civic and institutional buildings. Most of these 52 resources relate to the themes "An Elite Residential District: 1885-190" (20) and "Streetcar Development: 1905-1930" (27), with an additional five resources related to the theme "An Era of Transitions: 1930-1990." No resources retaining sufficient integrity for designation could be dated to the earliest development theme in Golden Hill.

Substantial public outreach with the Golden Hill Planning Group, regional and local preservation groups, and members of the community occurred throughout the development of the Historic Context and completion of the survey. This information was considered and often incorporated as appropriate into the results and recommendations of the survey.

Following distribution of the Draft Survey Report, City staff conducted additional outreach with these groups to identify any resources not previously included in the survey by the consultant which the community believed to be historically significant. Based on the results of this outreach and review by qualified City staff, additional resources were identified as potentially significant, requiring further site-specific evaluation. These resources, which are documented in Section 4 of the Historic Survey, included one additional individual resource; five residential courts; and two potential historic districts, including an expanded South Park District that reflects the boundary identified in 1996, and the Culverwell and Taggart's Addition District on the western edge of the planning area west of the Golden Hill District.

While the survey work conducted by HRG did not identify these areas as potential historic districts, both were identified in the 1996 Mid-City survey. In addition, qualified City staff reviewed these potential historic districts and conducted a windshield survey on foot to confirm that these areas appear to contain a sufficient concentration of resources and the physical integrity required to be eligible for local listing. In order to bring these districts forward for designation, additional, intensive-level research will be required to evaluate the district and define a precise boundary, period of significance, significance criteria, and contributing and non-contributing resources.

Included with the CPU package is a draft work program that includes a schedule for the processing of all 34 potential historic districts identified across the North Park, Golden Hill, and Uptown planning areas over the next 11 years (Attachment 2). This work program was developed using prioritization factors that included input from the various Community Planning Groups. The work program envisions processing of the South Park and Culverwell and Taggart's Addition potential historic districts within the first two years of the program.

Historic Preservation Element

The Historic Preservation Element (HPE) of the GHCPU (Attachment 3) guides the preservation, protection and restoration of historical and cultural resources within the community plan area. The element includes goals and recommendations for addressing the history and historic resources unique to Golden Hill in order to encourage appreciation of the community's history and culture. These recommendations along with the General Plan policies provide a comprehensive historic preservation strategy for Golden Hill. The policies within the HPE fall within two general categories, 1) identification and preservation of historical resources, and 2) educational opportunities and incentives related to historical resources. Broadly, the goals and policies of the HPE include protection of potential historic districts; future intensive level survey of potential historic districts; implementation of the identified MPL; outreach to the community and property owners; identification and protection of archaeological and tribal cultural resources; and promotion of educational and interpretive programs and heritage tourism opportunities. The policies were informed by the results of the Historic Survey and developed in collaboration with the community.

Amendments to Historical Resources Regulations

Amendments to the Historical Resources Regulations are proposed to provide additional protections for specified potential historic districts, as described in Staff Report No HRB-16-063 for the North Park Community Plan Update. The Land Development Code (LDC) amendments that are associated with the plan updates for North Park and Golden Hill are part of the package for the North Park Planning Area, which will be considered first during the hearing process. Because the LDC amendments are included in the North Park CPU package, they are not discussed here or included in the Board's recommendation on the Golden Hill CPU. However, if the amendments are adopted by the City Council, they would also apply to potential historic districts within the Golden Hill CPU that are specified by the City Council during the action on the CPU.

Environmental Analysis of Historical Resources

A Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) was prepared and includes a CEQA-level analysis of potentially significant impacts to Historical Resources (prehistoric, historic archaeological, tribal cultural and built environment resources) and is detailed in Section 7.7 Historical Resources section of the PEIR (Attachment 4). Although the proposed Golden Hill CPU and associated discretionary

actions do not propose specific development, future development could result in the alteration of historical resources as defined in the Land Development Code (e.g. historic building, structure, object, or site.) The mitigation framework provided in the PEIR (HIST-7.7-1 and HIST 7.7-2) would be required of all development projects with the potential to impact significant historical resources. A complete copy of the Final PEIR, that includes responses to comments on historical issues, is provided on the City's website through the link at the end of this report.

Public Input

The City has received input from the public on the Historic Survey and the Historic Preservation Element. Wherever appropriate, the City has worked to incorporate public comment and feedback into the various documents. Attachment 6 includes staff responses to several issues which were repeated in one form or another during public review of the documents.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the information provided in the historic context and survey report has been incorporated into the planning process for the Golden Hill CPU and is reflected in the goals and policies of the Historic Preservation Element. In addition, the EIR includes a mitigation framework for cultural and historical resources that would reduce impacts anticipated from future projects, although not below a level of significance. Therefore, staff recommends that the HRB recommend to the City Council adoption of the Golden Hill Community Plan Update Historic Resources Survey (Historic Survey); the Historic Preservation Element of the Golden Hill Community Plan update (HPE); and the Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) related to Historical Resources analysis and mitigation.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

KS

Attachments:

1. Golden Hill Community Plan Historic Resources Survey (under separate cover)
2. Draft Work Program for Processing Potential Historic Districts (under separate cover)
3. Golden Hill CPU Historic Preservation Element (under separate cover)
4. Golden Hill Program Environmental Impact Report (available online at: <https://www.sandiego.gov/planning/programs/ceqa>)
5. Golden Hill PEIR Section 7.7, Historical Resources (under separate cover)
6. Planning Department Responses to Historic Resources Issues (under separate cover)
7. Golden Hill PEIR Response to Comments (under separate cover)