

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 12, 2023 REPORT NO. HRB-23-005

HEARING DATE: January 26, 2023

SUBJECT: ITEM #5 - CARL AND ETHEL MAE SHARP SPEC HOUSE #1

RESOURCE INFO: <u>California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link</u>

APPLICANT: Jesse and Kelly Gross; represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 4971 Kensington Drive, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9

APN 440-373-02-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Carl and Ethel Mae Sharp Spec House #1

located at 4971 Kensington Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Carl and Ethel Mae Sharp Spec House #1 located at 4971 Kensington Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 2010 rear master bedroom addition constructed outside the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Colonial Revival style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1929 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a cross gabled roof with red tiles and little eave overhang, asymmetrical façade, stucco exterior, wood front door, tapered stucco chimney, wood lintels, fenestration of multi-lite and single-lite wood windows, and an arched focal window.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is a single-story residence with a detached garage in the Kensington-Talmadge Community.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Carl and Ethel Mae Sharp Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Carl and Ethel Mae Sharp, who constructed the property as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject resource is a one-story, single-family residence with a detached garage constructed in 1929 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style architecture. The asymmetrical house has a cross gabled roof with red tiles, little eave overhang, and stucco exterior. On the primary façade to the left features a pair of multi-lite casement windows and tripartite window, with heavy decorative wood lintels; and on the right gabled front there is a large arched focal window The south facade features an original tapered stucco chimney, and original multi-lite wood casement windows. The north elevation has several original casement windows, as well as three wood windows. Unique features of house include the focal window, low walled front courtyard, and side facing wood front door with iron detailing.

There have been several modifications to the property since its 1929 construction date. These include a rear master bedroom addition in 2010 and the addition of a pair of French doors and two metal framed double hung windows at the rear in 2011. The 2010 and 2011 additions were approved by staff as consistent with the Secretary of Interior Standards. Between 2014 and 2015 the driveway was replaced and altered; a black metal gate was also installed at the driveway. Solar Panels and a car charging station were added in 2020. In addition to the above modifications the house was restuccoed, and an A/C unit was placed on the roof at an unknown date. These modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling and the building retains integrity as it relates to architectural significance.

The Spanish Colonial Revival style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. Its vocabulary is influenced by Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic or Renaissance precedents. The style became popular after the Panama-California Exposition of 1915 and reached its height in the 1920's and early 1930's before rapidly declining in the 1940's. Identifying features include a low-pitched roof with little or no eave overhang, red tile roof covering, stucco exterior wall finishes, an asymmetrical façade and arches above doors and principle windows. Common decorative details are patterned tiles, carved stonework, large focal windows, wooden or iron window grilles, decorative vents and balconies.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Colonial Revival style architecture by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style. Including a cross gabled roof with red tiles and little eave overhang, asymmetrical façade, stucco exterior, wood front door, tapered stucco chimney, wood lintels, fenestration of multi-lite and single-

lite wood windows, and an arched focal window. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The applicant's request for designation for the property located at 4971 Kensington Drive did not include information to support a determination under HRB Criterion D; therefore, staff has not made a determination regarding eligibility under Criterion D at this time. Eligibility under this criterion may can be reevaluated at a future date pending submittal of additional information and analysis.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that Carl and Ethel Mae Sharp Spec House #1 located at 4971 Kensington Drive be designated as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Colonial Revival style architecture and retains integrity. The designation excludes the 2010 rear master bedroom addition constructed outside the period of significance.

Megan Walker

Associate Planner

Suzanne Segur

Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison

Development Services Department

MW/sa/ss

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 1/26/2023

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/26/2023, to consider the historical designation of the **Carl and Ethel Mae Sharp Spec House #1** (owned by Jessie andd Kelly Gross, 4971 Kensington Drive, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **4971 Kensington Drive**, **San Diego**, **CA 92116**, APN: **440-373-02-00**, further described as BLK 7 LOT 13 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the **Carl and Ethel Mae Sharp Spec House #1** on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Colonial Revival style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1929 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a cross gabled roof with red tiles and little eave overhang, asymmetrical façade, stucco exterior, wood front door, tapered stucco chimney, wood lintels, fenestration of multi-lite and single-lite wood windows, and an arched focal window. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.**

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 2010 rear master bedroom addition constructed outside the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:	BY:
	TIM HUTTER, Chair
	Historical Resources Board
APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,	
APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY	BY:
	LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
	Deputy City Attorney

RECORDING REQUESTED BY CITY OF SAN DIEGO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD ATTN: HRB SECRETARY 1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

4971 Kensington Drive, San Diego, CA 92116

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER 440-373-02-00

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER 0