

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: June 7, 2023 REPORT NO. HRB-23-019

HEARING DATE: June 22, 2023

SUBJECT: ITEM #6 – Earnest Hausen and James Hutchins Spec House #1

RESOURCE INFO: California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link

APPLICANT: McLoughlin Revocable Family Trust; represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 4240 Trias Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3

APN: 443-340-0300

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Earnest Hausen and James Hutchins Spec

House #1 located at 4240 Trias Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Earnest Hausen and James Hutchins Spec House #1 located at 4240 Trias Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1997 rear addition and deck constructed outside the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Tudor Revival Style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1925 period of significance. Specifically, the resource has a steeply pitched roof with front facing gable, asymmetrical façade, stucco cladding with exposed brick veneer, decorative brick work, a front porch with arches, stucco chimney, and fenestration consists of a tripart picture window, several leaded diamond pane casement windows, and wood windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is a two-story, single-family residence located on the northwest side of Trias Street Mission Hills neighborhood within the Uptown Community.

The property was identified in the <u>2016 Uptown Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey</u> and given a Status Code of 5D3, "Appears to be a contributor to a district that appears eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the Earnest Hausen and James Hutchins Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Earnest Hausen and James Hutchins, who constructed the house as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C; and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject resource is a two-story, single-family residence constructed in 1925 in the Tudor Revival architectural style. The house features a steeply pitched roof with a front facing gable, and asymmetrical façade. Stucco cladding with decorative patches of exposed brick veneer ties in with the original brick lintels, windowsills and trim surround on the front porch arches. A raised concrete path leads to a covered porch with double arches and a recessed wooden front door. A large tripartite window with leaded diamond pane sidelights and an elongated arched attic vent are located on the front gable. Fenestration consists of leaded diamond pane casement and wood frame and sash windows in various operations. A tapered stucco chimney on the southwest elevation and the garage sits below grade on the southeast elevation within the front facing gable.

There have been several modifications to the structure since its 1925 date of construction. In 1997 a permit shows changes to the northwest elevation which include enclosing the rear covered concrete porch, expanding the second story, with the addition of a rear deck. A permit for in kind repair to a bathroom and electrical work was obtained in 1998. In 2016 solar panels were added to the roof, and the leaded diamond pane windows were restored in 2022, neither were reviewed by historical staff; however they don't impact the resource's ability to convey it's historic significance. Other modifications include replacement of the roof, addition of front retaining walls, and decorative ironwork added to the front gable at unknown dates. These modifications do not impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

Popular in the 1920s and 1930s, Tudor Revival architecture is loosely based on a variety of late Medieval English styles and influences, but unlike some English prototypes, Tudor Revival style houses exhibit steeply pitched gable roofs that dominate the facades. Other character defining features include decorative half-timbering; tall, narrow windows, usually appearing in multiple groups and with multi-pane glazing; massive chimneys, sometimes with decorative chimney pots; entry porches with round or Tudor arches; and gable dormers. Relatively uncommon before World War I, widespread adoption of masonry veneering techniques in the 1920s accompanied a dramatic rise in the style's popularity as even the most modest examples began to closely mimic the brick and

stone veneers of their English prototypes. Tudor Revival style houses usually include the use of stucco as well as wood cladding and brick or stone veneer, depending upon the subtype.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Tudor Revival architectural style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a steeply pitched roof with front facing gable, asymmetrical façade, stucco cladding with exposed brick veneer, decorative brick work, a front porch with arches, stucco chimney, and fenestration consists of a tripart picture window, several leaded diamond pane casement windows, and wood windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Earnest Hausen and James Hutchins Spec House #1 located at 4240 Trias Street be designated with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Tudor Revival Style of architecture. The designation excludes the 1997 rear addition and deck constructed outside the period of significance.

Megan Walker Associate Planner

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison Development Services Department

MW/sa/ss

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 6/22/2023

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 6/22/2023, to consider the historical designation of the **Earnest Hausen and James Hutchins Spec House #1** (owned by McLoughlin Revocable Family Trust 09-17-90, 4240 Trias Street, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **4240 Trias Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92103**, APN: **443-340-03-00**, further described as LOT 3 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and **Earnest Hausen and James Hutchins Spec House #1**

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the **Earnest Hausen and James Hutchins Spec House #1** on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of the Tudor Revival Style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1925 period of significance. Specifically, the resource has a steeply pitched roof with front facing gable, asymmetrical façade, stucco cladding with exposed brick veneer, decorative brick work, a front porch with arches, stucco chimney, and fenestration consists of a tripart picture window, several leaded diamond pane casement windows, and wood windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.**

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1997 rear addition and deck constructed outside the period of significance

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:	BY:	
		TIM HUTTER, Chair Historical Resources Board
APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,		
CITY ATTORNEY	BY:	
		LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney

RECORDING REQUESTED BY CITY OF SAN DIEGO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD ATTN: HRB SECRETARY 1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

4240 Trias Street, San Diego, CA 92103

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER 443-340-03-00

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER 0