



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

## Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: June 16, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-034

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board  
Agenda of June 23, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 – A.F. Cornell House**

APPLICANT: James A Freeman Separate Property Trust represented by Archaeos

LOCATION: 140 Quince Street, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the A.F. Cornell House located at 140 Quince Street as a historical resource.

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the A.F. Cornell House as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1905 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The house conveys the characteristics of a transitional period between the Colonial Revival and Craftsman styles by embodying historic characteristics associated with both. Specifically, the structure's central pedimented gable; symmetrical primary façade and triple windows with multi-pane upper sashes are typical of the Colonial Revival. Craftsman influences are found in the house's decorative beams; half walled porch; overhanging eaves and wide windows. The stucco and wood shingle wall treatment are also indicative of the Craftsman style.

### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a two-and-a-half story, single-family residence constructed in 1905 in a transitional Colonial Revival/Craftsman Style. The building is located on a corner lot at the intersection of Quince Street and Second Avenue with its primary façade facing south towards Quince Street in the Bankers Hill section of the Uptown Community.

The building is located on APN 452-615-06 and was given a status code of 5D3 (appears to contribute to a district that appears eligible for local listing) in the 2016 Draft Uptown Survey.

The historic name of the resource, the A.F. Cornell House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of A.F. Cornell, who constructed the house as a personal residence.

## ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Archeos, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

*CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.*

Research into the history of the property at 140 Quince Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Uptown's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

*CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.*

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 140 Quince Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

*CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject resource is a two-and-a-half story, single-family residence constructed in 1905 in a transitional Victorian/Craftsman Style. The building is located on a corner lot at the intersection of Quince Street and Second Avenue with its primary façade facing south towards Quince Street. Additionally, the original detached single-car garage is located west of the house. The house is symmetrical in appearance with a medium pitched end gabled roof. The plan is essentially rectangular with a two-story center gabled pedimented porch projecting from the primary façade. On the rear a secondary entrance is enclosed in a shed roofed one-story bump out. The lower portion of the house is clad in wood shingle and the upper portion is stuccoed. The building features a second floor overhang on the front façade with decorative beams on the underside of the projection. The roof is covered with composition shingles with overhanging boxed eaves.

The primary entry is accessed from the porch on the south façade. The porch has walls on three sides with a wooden bench and a fixed window with a 20-lite upper pane at the west end. The primary entrance is a wide wooden door with a paneled lower and a single fixed pane upper with wrought iron grille and diamond-hatched sidelights. The windows are wood framed, double hung with most being the multi-pane (12, 10, 8 or 4) over single pane variety. On the first floor some of

the windows are grouped together in sets of threes consisting of a central fixed pane flanked by two double hung. There are also three-window bays on the east and north walls.

Several alterations were made to the property early in its lifetime. These include the enclosure of the second story of the porch, the removal of a chimney top on the north wall and the replacement of the original porch floor with scored concrete. In recent years, the owners have worked with staff to restore previously modified aspects of the house per the Secretary of the Interiors Standards. Work included the replacement of damaged wood shingles and replacing metal with wood frame windows that would have been similar to the original. The house was restuccoed following the window replacement because of a resizing of the openings. The stucco texture was matched to a surviving sample of the original. Additionally, two small non-original windows are located on the west wall.

Following the Centennial Exposition of 1876 America experienced a rebirth of interest in its colonial past. Primarily popular from 1880 to 1955, Colonial Revival buildings reference the early English and Dutch homes of the Atlantic seaboard, particularly the Georgian and Adam styles. As with their prototypes, Colonial Revival structures generally have a symmetrical front façade with the principal areas of elaboration being entrances, windows and cornices. Roofs can be hipped, gable or gambrel and some variations feature a center gable projecting slightly from the primary façade. Windows are typically double-hung sash with multi-pane glazing in one or both sashes and are commonly found in pairs, triples or bay windows.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Significance Statement: The house conveys the characteristics of a transitional period between the Colonial Revival and Craftsman styles by embodying some historic characteristics associated with both. The structure's central pedimented gable; symmetrical primary façade and triple windows with multi-pane upper sashes are typical of the Colonial Revival. Craftsman influences are found in the house's decorative beams; half walled porch; overhanging eaves and wide windows. The stucco and wood shingle wall treatment are also indicative of the Craftsman style. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

*CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.*

Research into the construction of the property at 140 Quince Street failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - *Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.*

The property at 140 Quince Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - *Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.*

The property at 140 Quince Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

#### OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

#### CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the A.F. Cornell House located at 140 Quince Street be designated with a period of significance of 1905 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that exhibits the distinctive characteristics of a transitional Colonial Revival/Craftsman Style. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Suzanne Segur  
Assistant Planner



Kelley Stanco  
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

SS/ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A  
ADOPTED ON 6/23/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 6/23/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **A.F. Cornell House** (owned by James A Freeman Separate Property Trust 11-18-05 ET. AL., 140 Quince Street, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **140 Quince Street, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **452-615-06-00**, further described as BLK 351 LOT G in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the A.F. Cornell House on the following finding:

1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies a transitional period between the Colonial Revival and Craftsman styles and retains integrity to its 1905 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the structure's central pedimented gable; symmetrical primary façade and triple windows with multi-pane upper sashes are typical of the Colonial Revival. Craftsman influences are found in the house's decorative beams; half walled porch; overhanging eaves and wide windows. The stucco and wood shingle wall treatment are also indicative of the Craftsman style. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
JOHN LEMMO, Chair  
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,  
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
CORRINE NEUFFER,  
Deputy City Attorney