



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: August 18, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-052

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of August 25, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 – The J.W. and Dora Fleming/Hurlburt and Tifal House**

APPLICANT: Robert Macari and Julie Ferguson represented by IS Architecture

LOCATION: 2925 Cedar Street, 92102, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the J.W. and Dora Fleming/Hurlburt and Tifal House located at 2925 Cedar Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the J.W. and Dora Fleming/Hurlburt and Tifal House located at 2925 Cedar Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1924 under HRB Criteria C and D. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the retains its gable roof sheathed with clay tile and a flat roof with a parapet, wood multi-light windows, decorative wrought iron railing, decorative wing walls and circular clay vents.
2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Designer Ralph E. Hurlburt and Master Builder Charles H. Tifal and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource incorporates a subtle design and building articulation with an irregular floor plan that incorporates a courtyard, building façade setbacks, and a combination of roof styles showcasing the Spanish Colonial Revival style.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The house is located in South Park in a predominantly single family neighborhood.

The building is located on APN 539-354-12-00. The property was identified in the 1996 Mid-City Survey and identified as a contributor to a potential South Park historic district. The property was also identified in the 2016 Golden Hill Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey and listed as a contributor to a potential South Park residential historic district.

The historic name of the resource, J.W. and Dora Fleming/Hurlburt and Tifal House has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of J.W. and Dora Fleming who constructed the house as their personal residence and the name of Hurlburt and Tifal a Master Designer/Builder.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by IS Architecture which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D and Staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

Constructed in 1924 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style, the subject house is located at the corner of Cedar Street and Dale Street. The main entrance fronts on to Cedar Street and is comprised of three sections. The middle, which protrudes out slightly, features a flat roof with a parapet and a single front door. The door is covered by a small shed roof sheathed with clay tile and supported by stuccoed corbels. The entrance is accessed by a raised porch surrounded by a wrought iron railing. To the right of the front door, in this section, is a pair of divided light casement windows with rounded clay vents centered above the window. To the east of the front entrance is the gable end of the roof. This section is divided by a stuccoed chimney flanked by a multi-light casement window. Each window features a stuccoed sill and a decorative wrought iron railing. To the west of the front entrance, is a recessed, flat roofed with parapet section that features two pairs of multi-light casement windows with rounded clay vents center above each window.

Under the gable roof on the east façade of the house are two evenly spaced arched multi-light windows. The windows feature stuccoed sills and decorative wrought iron railing to match the north façade. The corner of this section of the house flare out to create wing walls. Stepped back slightly from the east façade is a portion of the house with a flat roof and parapets. This section has a tripartite window centered on the elevation with a squared vent above. This portion of the house helps to form a small courtyard on the south side of the house. The courtyard is accessed via a pair of five light French doors flanked by casement windows on the north wall (of the courtyard) and a single French door on the east wall (of the courtyard). Views of the courtyard are also provided from several multi-light windows. The southwest corner of the house features a number of paired double hung 6/1 windows spaced evenly on the wall plane. The north east corner of the house features a

small utility window and a single Bel-air style door that accesses the rear yard and the detached two car garage. The garage is complementary to the main residence.

There have been a few modifications to the property. Sometime in the past 25 years the exterior was re-stuccoed. Based on an area where the new stucco coat was not present, it appears that the existing texture was similar to the historic texture. Additional modifications include the replacement of the front porch rail with a less decorative rail, the replacement of a pair of French doors in the courtyard area, the reglazing of a pair of double hung windows from 6/1 to 1/1 and the replacement of the tripartite window on the east elevation. In ca. 2011, there were minor modifications to the garage and more recently in 2015, the rear door was replaced and the garage door was replaced. Overall, the modifications do not adversely impact the overall character defining features of the style.

The Spanish Colonial Revival style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. Its vocabulary is influenced by Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic or Renaissance precedents. The style became popular after the Panama-California Exposition of 1915 and reached its height in the 1920's and early 1930's before rapidly declining in the 1940's. Identifying features include a low-pitched roof with little or no eave overhang, red tile roof covering, stucco exterior wall finishes, an asymmetrical façade and arches above doors and principle windows. Common decorative details are patterned tiles, carved stonework, large focal windows, wooden or iron window grilles, decorative vents and balconies.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Colonial Revival style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a gable roof sheathed with clay tile and a flat roof with a parapet, wood multi-light windows, decorative wrought iron railing and circular clay vents. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Constructed in 1924 by Master Builder Charles H. Tifal and designed by Master Designer Ralph E. Hurlburt, the house is an early example of their collaboration. Tifal was established as a Master Builder in 2003 with the designation of HRB Site #613 and Hurlburt was established as a Master Architect in 2001 with the designation of HRB Site #464.

Charles H. Tifal was born in 1882 in Wisconsin and relocated to San Diego in approximately 1920. In the early 20s, Hurlburt and Tifal designed and constructed structures, primarily high-end custom residences, in a myriad of styles. In 1942 Tifal was no longer working with Hurlburt but was partnered with Scott King. The firm of Tifal and King installed the Alvarado Road Pump House, cottage, and garage. Charles Tifal died at the age of 86 in 1968. Houses built by Tifal on the San Diego Register include:

- HRB Site #613-Alfred LaMotte/Hurlburt and Tifal House, 3557 3rd Avenue
- HRB Site #697-Edwin and Rose Emerson/Hurlburt and Tifal House, 2645 28th Street
- HRB Site #824-Sam and Mary McPherson/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal House, 3133 28th Street

- HRB Site #904-Frederick and Helen Thompson/Charles H. Tifal House, 1232 Myrtle
- HRB Site #906-John Snyder/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal Spec House #1, 2315 Fort Stockton Drive
- HRB Site #933-John Snyder/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal Spec House #2, 4370 Trias
- HRB Site #1008-054-North Park Dryden Historic District Contributor, 3404 Pershing

Ralph E. Hurlburt was born in 1888 in Nebraska. He was trained by his grandfather in the construction trade. In 1916, he married and relocated to San Diego. Upon arrival, he was involved in real estate financing and law and later transferred to architectural design. Early in his career, Hurlburt partnered with builder Charles H. Tifal, a partnership that lasted until shortly before Hurlburt's death in 1942. Houses designed by Hurlburt and listed on the local register include:

- HRB Site #464-The Wonder House of Stone, 4386 Adams Avenue
- HRB Site #523-James C. & Lillie Byers / Ralph E. Hurlburt House, 4230 Arguello Street
- HRB Site #613-Alfred LaMotte/Hurlburt and Tifal House, 3557 3rd Avenue
- HRB Site #697-Edwin and Rose Emerson/Hurlburt and Tifal House, 2645 28th Street
- HRB Site #824-Sam and Mary McPherson/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal House, 3133 28th Street
- HRB Site #906-John Snyder/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal Spec House #1, 2315 Fort Stockton Drive
- HRB Site #929- Ralph Hurlburt/ Alexander Schreiber Spec House # 1, 3917 Hawk Street
- HRB Site #933-John Snyder/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal Spec House #2, 4370 Trias
- HRB Site #948- Ralph Hurlburt/ Alexander Schreiber Spec House #2, 3907 Hawk Street
- HRB Site #1008-054-North Park Dryden Historic District Contributor, 3404 Pershing

Significance Statement: The subject property, 2925 Cedar Street, is a notable work of Master Designer Ralph E. Hurlburt and Master Builder Charles H. Tifal, in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The house incorporates a subtle design and building articulation with an irregular floor plan that incorporates a courtyard, building façade setbacks, and a combination of roof styles showcasing the Spanish Colonial Revival style. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the property under HRB Criterion D.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the J.W. and Dora Fleming/Hurlburt and Tifal House located at 2925 Cedar Street be designated with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criteria C as a good example of Spanish Colonial Revival style architecture and Criteria D for its association with Master Designer Ralph E. Hurlburt and Master Builder Charles H. Tifal. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical

Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jodie Brown, AICP
Senior Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

JB/ks

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 8/25/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 8/25/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **J.W. and Dora Fleming/Hurlburt and Tifal House** (owned by Robert J. Macari and Julie Ferguson, 2925 Cedar Street, San Diego, CA 92102) located at **2925 Cedar Street, San Diego, CA 92102**, APN: **539-354-12-00**, further described as BLK 12 LOT 12 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the J.W. and Dora Fleming/Hurlburt and Tifal House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1924 period of significance. Specifically, the retains its gable roof sheathed with clay tile and a flat roof with a parapet, wood multi-light windows, decorative wrought iron railing, decorative wing walls and circular clay vents. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Designer Ralph E. Hurlburt and Master Builder Charles H. Tifal and retains integrity as it relates to the original 1924 design. Specifically, the resource incorporates a subtle design and building articulation with an irregular floor plan that incorporates a courtyard, building façade setbacks, and a combination of roof styles showcasing the Spanish Colonial Revival style. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
COURTNEY ANN COYLE, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney