

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	September 10, 2020	REPORT NO. HRB-20-044
HEARING DATE:	September 24, 2020	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #8 – Frederick Thomas House	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Data	<u>base (CHRID) link</u>
APPLICANT:	6 th and Thorn LLC; represented by Marie Burk	e Lia
LOCATION:	540 Thorn Street, Uptown Community, Council District 3 APN 452-555-20-00	
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Frederick Tho Thorn Street as a historical resource.	omas House located at 540

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Frederick Thomas House located at 540 Thorn Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1909 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the enclosed balcony along the south elevation and the northeast two-story addition which were both constructed outside the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style with Richardsonian Romanesque and Tudor Revival style influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1909 period of significance. Specifically, this rare resource is one of the two known residential properties that features a Craftsman style layout in its cross-gabled, medium pitched roof with wide overhanging eaves along, asymmetrical facades and wooden windows as well as Richardsonian Romanesque and Tudor Revival details like rough-faced sandstone along the first floor and three chimneys, false half timbering in the gable ends, stucco cladding, and decorative stone arches above the entrance porches.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed building modification or demolition of a structure of 45 years or more, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212.

The property was identified in the 2016 Uptown Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey Report and given a Status Code of 7R, "Identified in Reconnaissance Level Survey: Not evaluated."

The historic name of the resource, the Frederick Thomas House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Frederick Thomas, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

<u>Prior HRB Review</u>

The property was previously brought before the Historical Resources Board in 2007 and in 2008. In 2007, a report prepared by Heritage Architecture and Planning concluded that the resource was not significant under any HRB Criteria; staff disagreed and found that the property was significant under HRB Criterion C for its Tudor Revival style with Craftsman Influences. In 2008 another report was submitted that was prepared by Kathleen Crawford of the office of Marie Burke Lia, which also concluded that the resource was not significant under any HRB Criterion; staff disagreed and continued to support the finding that the resource was significant under HRB Criterion C for its Tudor Revival style with Craftsman Influences. In 2008 another report was before the Historical Resources Board Members had the opportunity to discuss and vote on a motion.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Marie Burke Lia which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff disagrees and finds that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 540 Thorn Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Uptown's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 540 Thorn Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject property is a single-family residence located on a corner parcel between Thorn Street and Sixth Avenue in a mixed-use area of the Uptown community. The property features a crossgabled roof clad in asphalt shingles with wide, overhanging eaves with white painted half-timbering in the gables below. The second story features a modern textured stucco finish while the first story features a rough faced sandstone. Additional features include three sandstone chimneys, divided lite and single lite wooden windows, decorative stoned archways and brackets around the entrance porches. The property was constructed during a transitional time for American architecture and features a combination of styles such as a Craftsman style layout in its cross-gabled, medium pitched roof with wide overhanging eaves along, asymmetrical facades and wooden windows. Richardsonian Romanesque features are present in the use of rough faced sandstone along the first floor, three stone chimneys, as well as the decorative stone archways around the entrance porches. Tudor Revival style influences are also present on the structure in the use of half timbering in the gable ends as well as stucco. Elements of these three styles are not readily found on the same resource within the City of San Diego with only one other known example at 2404 F Street, HRB #130-055.

Modifications have occurred to the property since the 1909 date of construction and include the removal of the decorative wood detailing in the gable ends of the roof, the removal of most of the divided lite upper sash wood windows, and the use of a modern stucco texture along the second story that matches the texture on the boxed addition. Additional modifications on the primary, south façade include the enclosure of a second story balcony and removal of the original balcony railing, a new entrance door along the first floor accessed by the entrance porch, the change of a window to a door along with the addition of a deck and stairs. Modifications on the east façade, facing towards Sixth Avenue include the possible removal or infill of an entrance porch, the addition of a marquee and stairs along the first floor that allows access to a two-story, square shaped, flat roof addition. Modifications on the west elevation include the addition of modern stairs that allow access to the balcony with a modern railing. Lastly, modifications on the rear, north facade include a continuation of the of the two-story addition, the change of the central portion of a tripartite window to a door, and the addition of modern stairs for second story access. While the property has undergone substantial alterations and modifications since its 1909 date of construction, staff finds that it continues to retain integrity as it is one of two residential resources that feature a rare blend of Craftsman, Richardsonian Romanesque, and Tudor Revival details. Overall these modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling related to HRB Criterion C.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were 3 highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; multiple roof planes; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; decorative attic vents; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Henry Hobson Richardson, whose namesake is identified with the architectural style, began constructing properties in the Romanesque adaptation primarily in the northeastern United States in the 1880s. The buildings he constructed and are best associated with are usually large, publicly used buildings. These structures almost always feature masonry or some form of rough faced stonework along the first or first and second stories. Additional character defining features of the Richardsonian Romanesque style include the use of the wide, Romanesque arches, that may be present above windows, entranceways, or porch supports, single lite wooden windows, column capitals or wall surfaces with ornamental details, rounded bays, and towers. By the 1900s, the Richardsonian Romanesque style had faded out of favor.

Popular in the 1920s and 1930s, Tudor Revival architecture is loosely based on a variety of late Medieval English styles and influences, but unlike some English prototypes, Tudor Revival style houses exhibit steeply pitched gable roofs that dominate the facades. Other character defining features include decorative half-timbering; tall, narrow windows, usually appearing in multiple groups and with multi-pane glazing; massive chimneys, sometimes with decorative chimney pots; entry porches with round or Tudor arches; and gable dormers. Relatively uncommon before World War I, widespread adoption of masonry veneering techniques in the 1920s accompanied a dramatic rise in the style's popularity as even the most modest examples began to closely mimic the brick and stone veneers of their English prototypes. Tudor Revival style houses usually include the use of stucco as well as wood cladding and brick or stone veneer, depending upon the subtype.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style with Richardsonian Romanesque and Tudor Revival style influences by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; specifically this rare resource is one of the two known residential properties in the City of San Diego which features a Craftsman style layout in its cross-gabled, medium pitched roof with wide overhanging eaves along, asymmetrical facades and wooden windows as well as Richardsonian Romanesque and Tudor Revival details like rough-faced sandstone along the first floor and three chimneys, false half timbering in the gable ends, stucco cladding, and decorative stone arches above the entrance porches.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 540 Thorn Street was designed by Elmer Bayless and built by James Cassidy. Neither Bayless nor Cassidy have been established by the Historical Resources Board as Master Architects, Designers or Builders, and there is insufficient information to designate either one of them as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 540 Thorn Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 540 Thorn Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Frederick Thomas House located at 540 Thorn Street be designated with a period of significance of 1909 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Craftsman style with Richardsonian Romanesque and Tudor Revival influences. The designation excludes the enclosed balcony along the south elevation and the northeast two-story addition which were both constructed outside the period of significance.

Emma Haggerty Associate Planner

EH/ss

Attachment(s):

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner Development Services Department

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover
- 3. Staff Memo 2008
- 4. Staff Report 2007
- 5. 2008 Attachments, included within 2020 HRRR

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 9/24/2020

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 9/24/2020, to consider the historical designation of the Frederick Thomas House (owned by 6th & Thorn LLC, 3565 7th Avenue, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **540 Thorn Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92104**, APN: **452-555-20-00**, further described as BLK 387 LOTS G& H in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Frederick Thomas House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style with Richardsonian Romanesque and Tudor Revival style influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1909 period of significance. Specifically, this rare resource is one of the two known residential properties that features a Craftsman style layout in its cross-gabled, medium pitched roof with wide overhanging eaves along, asymmetrical facades and wooden windows as well as Richardsonian Romanesque and Tudor Revival details like rough-faced sandstone along the first floor and three chimneys, false half timbering in the gable ends, stucco cladding, and decorative stone arches above the entrance porches. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the enclosed balcony along the south elevation and the northeast two-story addition which were both constructed outside the period of significance

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY:

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY:

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney

CITY OF SAN DIEGO M E M O R A N D U M

SUBJECT:	Item #11 – Frederick F. Thomas House – 540 Thorn Street
FROM:	Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner, Historical Resources
TO:	Historical Resources Board
DATE:	April 10, 2008

This item was continued from the July 26, 2007 Historical Resources Board meeting at the request of the applicant. Heritage Architecture & Planning prepared a historical assessment report and found the building ineligible for designation as a San Diego Historical Site due to a lack of integrity. The original HRB Staff report dated July 12, 2007 acknowledged the issues related to integrity, but nevertheless recommended that the building be designated under Criterion C as "an excellent and unique example of Tudor Revival-influenced Craftsman architecture incorporating ashlar stone, rarely used to such a degree in extant residential architecture within the City. A second consultant's report prepared by Kathleen Crawford of the office of Maria Burke Lia agreed with the conclusions of the Heritage Architecture & Planning report and found the property ineligible for designation as a San Diego Historical Site due to a lack of integrity.

The Crawford report did provide a copy of a December 30, 1908 article from the *San Diego Union* which featured the subject in an article about the death of the architect, Elmer Bayless. Staff obtained a clearer copy of the article which provides a photograph of the property taken from the southwest (Attachment 2). The Heritage Report and July 12th staff report speculated that a balcony may have been located above the entry porch where an addition now sits. The photograph from the *San Diego Union* provides a clear view of the entry porch and confirms that a balcony was indeed present at this location originally. The photo also reveals that the original railing, which appears to be made of decorative stone, has been removed. The photo also confirms that the west elevation remains largely unaltered, with the exception of the alterations to the balcony, the replacement of one window to the north, and the addition of the exterior stair. In addition, information from the article reveals that the ashlar stone present at the porch and much of the original ground floor is California sandstone.

Staff continues to recommend designation of the building located at 3330 Sixth Avenue under HRB Criterion C. However, in light of the additional modifications noted, the staff recommendation has been modified slightly as follows:

Page 2 4/10/2008

Designate the Frederick F. Thomas House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a unique and good example of Tudor Revival-influenced Craftsman architecture incorporating ashlar stone, rarely used to such a degree in extant residential architecture within the City.

Kelley Saunders Senior Planner

Attachment(s):

1. Staff Report No. HRB-07-040

- 2. December 30, 1908 article from the San Diego Union
- 3. Applicant's report, prepared by Heritage Architecture and Planning, under separate cover
- 4. Applicant's Historical Report, prepared by Kathleen Crawford of the Offices of Marie Burke Lia, under separate cover



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	July 12, 2007	REPORT NO. HRB-07-041
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of July 26, 2007	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #10 - Frederick F. Thomas House	
APPLICANT:	CHEL Holdings, Ltd, owner (referral from Development Services)	
LOCATION:	540 Thorn Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2	
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Frederick F. Thomas House located at 540 Thorn Street as a historical resource.	

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Frederick F. Thomas House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as an excellent and unique example of Tudor Revival-influenced Craftsman architecture incorporating ashlar stone, rarely used to such a degree in extant residential architecture within the City.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's constraints assessment for a potential project at this location involving one or more buildings of 45 years more under SDMC Section 143.0212. The house is a two story, Tudor Revival-influenced Craftsman style home with stucco and ashlar stone walls on a concrete foundation constructed in 1909 by an unknown builder for Frederick F. Thomas. The house was converted to government offices in 1957 and then to a multi-family use c. 1990.



City Planning & Community Investment 202 C Street, MS 4A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865 Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Eileen Magno of Heritage Architecture, which concludes the resource is not historically significant. Staff disagrees, and recommends that the site be designated as a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C as follows:

CRITERION C -*Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The house at 540 Thom Street is a two story Tudor Revival-influenced Craftsman residence built in 1909 by an unknown builder and features a moderately pitched cross-gable roof with asphalt shingles; overhanging eaves with widely spaced rafters and fascia board; decorative halftimbering in the gable ends; three ashlar stone chimneys; stucco walls on the second story and decorative ashlar stone on the fist story over wood frame construction on a concrete foundation. The house is situated on a comer lot fronting Sixth Avenue on the east and Thom Street on the south.

The main entrance is located on Thorn Street at the southwest comer of the property and is accessed via five concrete steps leading to a massive ashlar finished comer porch with decorative arched openings. To the right of the entry porch are two 1-over-1 wood frame and sash windows flanking a door which replaced the original single pane window in order to accommodate the building's change in use. A new wood deck is also present at this location. At the second story above, a tri-partite window with double hung windows flanking a single pane window are present below a smaller window located just under the gable peak. Above the entry porch, a small addition has been added under a clearly distinguishable shed roof extension. The report speculates that a balcony was enclosed at this location, although no such balcony is shown on the Sanbom Maps.

The east elevation fronting on Sixth Avenue features primarily tri-partite windows consisting of 1-over-1 double hung wood frame windows flanking single pane windows. One of these tripartite windows on the lower floor has been enlarged, removing the ashlar stone between the windows. Based upon historic postcards provided in the report, it appears that the original windows throughout the house featured a multi-lite pattern in the upper sash of the double-hung windows and the upper portion of the fixed windows. With the exception of the windows at the attic in the gable peak, these multi-lite windows are no longer present. However, the window frame and sash are wood, indicating an earlier replacement. At the northeast comer of the property, a two story flat-roof stucco addition was added between the cross-gabled portions of the original house. The addition is clearly distinct and is set back a few inches from the main facade. Although not consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the original form of the house is clearly evident. A long, shallow wood shed roof element replaced the original element above the northernmost portion of the east facade and has been brought across the new addition at the comer.

The north elevation, although not a primary elevation, is visible from the right-of-way due to a small parking lot located to the north of the house. A staircase to the second floor has been added at this location, providing access to the second floor through a door which replaced a single pane

window. Finally, the west elevation, also not a primary elevation, has been modified with a second exterior staircase to facilitate the multi-family use.

Although the house has undergone a number of modifications, it is nevertheless an impressive and unique example of Tudor Revival-influenced Craftsman architecture. The massing and design intent remain clearly evident. The building retains most of its original materials, with the exception of some divided-lite windows and wood accents, and retains its most distinctive and rare feature, the ashlar stone. The additions and modifications, although not consistent with the Standards, do not detract from the resource to such an extent that it not longer conveys it significance as a substantial and excellent example of Tudor Revival-influenced Craftsman architecture utilizing materials rarely used in residential architecture in San Diego. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the Frederick F. Thomas House located at 540 Thorn Street under HRB Criterion C.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staffs field check, it is recommended that the Frederick F. Thomas House be designated under HRB Criterion C as an excellent and unique example of Tudor Revival-influenced Craftsman architecture incorporating ashlar stone, rarely used to such a degree in extant residential architecture within the City. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Kelley Saunders Senior Planner

Catery Fritend

Cathy Winterrowd Senior Planner/Program Coordinator

KS/cw

Attachment(s):

Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover



the complaint, the enable value of 215,-ent for 11, however, ent for II, however, lexed, was to accost



Tuth 2" "Tuth," a dissipated, appearing French poolle, had been trying to choke the other dog to death by in-serting her threat in her opponent's mouth. Frantle kicks on the part of her mistress had only served to tight-en the mongrel interloper's frenzied grip, and Tutu was having a stormy voyage through life. With a courage worthy of better

"High jinks and stunts" is the pro-rram arranged by the members of San Diego ledge No. 168 B. P. O. Elks for the entertuinment of wives, sisters and sweethearts tomorrow evening at the home of the local lodge. From early evening until the old year has passed out and the new year has been ushered in, the fun will wax fast and furious. Musical numbers by Messrs. Coop. Kendall and McKenzie, the latter be-ing an out-of-town member; Thomas Octz, and others have been arranged. In addition specialties will be a fea-ture and the Elks' orchestra and Elks' quartet will contribute their part to ward the entertainment of the guests. Dancing and card games are to be

THE SAN DIEGO UNIC

