



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: June 16, 2016 REPORT NO. HRB-16-035

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of Jun 23, 2016

SUBJECT: **ITEM #9 – 1445 Granada Avenue and 2885 Beech Street**

APPLICANT: Christoph Krieg and Gwendolyn Toczko represented by IS Architecture

LOCATION: 1445 Granada Avenue and 2885 Beech Street, Greater Golden Hill
Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 1445 Granada Avenue
and 2885 Beech Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 1445 Granada Avenue and 2885 Beech Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building identified as 1445 Granada Ave is a two-story single family residence built in late 1911 to early 1912 in the Craftsman style, and the building identified as 2885 Beech Street is a two-story garage with apartment built in 1928 in the Spanish Eclectic style as an accessory building to the 1445 Granada Avenue residence. Staff located a sewer connection permit dated January 1912 suggesting the property was completed between late 1911 and early 1912 (Attachment 1). The buildings are located on a west-facing rectangular lot at the southeast corner of Granada Avenue and Beech Street in the South Park Addition of the Greater Golden Hill Community.

The buildings are located on APN 539-402-01-00. The 1445 Granada Avenue structure was identified in the 1996 Mid-City Survey as a potentially individually significant structure within the South Park Potential Historic District; and as "Non-Contributing" to the potential South Park Residential Historic District in the Draft Greater Golden Hill 2011 Historic Survey.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by IS Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff finds that the site is not a significant historical resource under any HRB Criteria. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property includes a two-story single family residence built in the Craftsman style in 1911-1912 identified as 1445 Granada Avenue, and a two-story garage with apartment built in the Spanish Eclectic style in 1928 identified as 2885 Beech Street. The 2885 Beech Street building was constructed as an accessory structure to replace the original detached garage for the 1445 Granada Avenue residence. Both buildings are of standard wood frame construction on concrete foundations with floor joists.

The 1445 Granada Avenue residence exhibits a rectangular plan form with asymmetrical façades and a partial-width covered porch at the front. The front-gabled roof is low-pitched, sheathed in composition shingle, and exhibits wide eave overhang with decorative exposed roof beams and rafter tails. Wood lattice attic vents mark the primary gable ends at the front and rear. A heavy textured stucco cladding marks the first floor, and wood shingle cladding is on the second floor with a flare just above the belt-course. Distinction between the first and second floors is continued in the exterior chimney on the north (side) elevation with unpainted brick appearing on the second floor and stucco on the first. A modified concrete walkway leads to the front porch supported by massive stucco columns with the entry beyond consisting of a pair of 20-lite French doors. Other features include a small secondary entry porch along the Beech Street elevation to the north and a second story open sleeping porch and balcony partially covered by the principal roof at the northwest corner of the building. Copious fenestration consists primarily of 4-over-1 wood casement windows, appearing frequently in groups.

The 1445 Granada Avenue residence was originally constructed with a small detached garage structure located at the southeast corner of the property, as seen in the 1920 Sanborn map provided in the report. In 1928, the original detached garage was replaced with a two-car garage with apartment above, identified as 2885 Beech Street and built in a generally Spanish Eclectic style with a stucco texture to match the existing Granada Avenue residence. The applicant's report proposes the 2885 Beech Street structure be designated under HRB Criterion C only, as it was not constructed by the proposed Master Architect Joel L. Brown. Staff finds that the 2885 Beech Street building, which was constructed as a replacement accessory structure for the 1445 Granada Avenue residence, does not relate to the significance of 1445 Granada Avenue as a Craftsman style structure built in 1911 by the proposed Master Architect, and is not individually significant in its own right as a Spanish Eclectic style residence. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation of the 2885 Beech Street building under any HRB Criteria.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled

roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Most of the modifications to the resource are fairly minor. These include the addition of a short balustrade to the second floor balcony; a small jalousie window to the right of the secondary entry along the north elevation; a rear deck and modified stair and landing at the rear of the garage structure; a stucco wall between the residence and garage structure; and various fencing and minor hardscape alterations detailed in the report. Also noted in the report is the infill of a pair of double hung windows at the rear of the south (side) elevation.

Among the various modifications, the most critical one impacting the building's integrity as it relates to the potential 1911-1912 date of construction and period of significance is the loss of the original tile roof material and its replacement with modern composition shingle. As indicated on the Assessor's Building Record, and shown in two San Diego Union ads provided in the report and dated 1911 and 1920, the 1445 Granada Avenue residence was originally designed and built with a tile roof. While the existing composition shingle roof appears a relatively benign replacement for the original, and while there are numerous Craftsman style homes of similar quality and appearance to the subject home listed on the local register (many of which have replacement composition roofs), the tile roof was clearly advertised as special feature on the subject house and was a unique, character-defining feature particular to this individual property. The loss of the tile roof material is a significant impact to the building's integrity of design, materials and feeling such that it no longer conveys its historic significance as a uniquely designed Craftsman structure of quality materials. Therefore, staff cannot recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The residence at 1445 Granada Avenue was built by Joel L. Brown, who is proposed as a Master Architect by the applicant's report. Brown was born in Indiana in 1870. In the late 1890s and until around 1906-1908, Brown worked for the Indiana architecture firms of Powers & Kibele and Brown & Houck, and designed such locally prominent buildings as the Hartford City Public Library and the Hartford City High School built between 1902-1904. Brown moved to San Diego with his wife Edith between 1908 and 1909 and quickly became a prominent building contractor and architect. Brown was responsible for the development of a number of properties throughout San Diego, particularly in Mission Hills. His designs were primarily residences in the Craftsman and Prairie styles.

The report notes four properties currently listed on the local register that are attributed to Joel L. Brown:

- The Katherine H. Wagenhals/Joel Brown House built in 1913 at 2124 Sunset Boulevard (HRB Site #593)
- The Kirkland Apartments built in 1912 at 2309 5th Avenue (HRB Site #483)
- The J. L. Brown Spec House built in 1912 at 2858 Evergreen Street (HRB Site #575)
- The Joel L. and Edith M. Brown House built in 1916 at 4141 Lark Street (HRB Site #777)

The subject property was designed and built by Joel L. Brown in 1911. As shown in the San Diego Union advertisements in the report, the property was prominently displayed as a quality home for sale with unique and superior features, including a tile roof. As a result of the aforementioned alteration affecting the original character-defining tile roof, which is critical to the building's conveyance as a uniquely designed Craftsman home, the 1445 Granada Avenue residence lacks the historic integrity to honestly convey the original design and intent of the architect Joel L. Brown. Therefore, staff does not recommend the HRB establish Brown as a Master Architect at this time, and does not recommend designation of the 1445 Granada Avenue residence under HRB Criterion D.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the property located at 1445 Granada Avenue and 2885 Beech Street not be designated under any HRB Criteria. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Associate Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

CP/ks

Attachments:

1. Sewer Permit No. 7536 dated Jan 29, 1912
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

OFFICE OF THE
DEPARTMENT OF SEWERS

No.

7536

SEWER PERMIT NO. 7536 79

San Diego, Calif., ~~Jan 1912~~ 1912

In consideration of the sum of \$2.50 for this permit and the sum of \$ 25.00

for the construction of a sewer lateral from the main city sewer on

Street, between

Ash

and

Baych

Streets,

to the property line of Lot 2, Block 76

Addition, paid to this Department by

E. J. Chantier

Owner, the

receipt of which is hereby acknowledged, said Owner is hereby granted permission to connect

to said lateral, in accordance with the provisions of Ordinance No. 4280.

DEPARTMENT OF SEWERS,

A. E. Johnson

SUPERINTENDENT

BY

W. Van Buren