

**CARMEL VALLEY COMMUNITY PLANNING BOARD
MEETING MINUTES**

7 p.m., 25 September 2014

Carmel Valley Library, Community Room
3919 Townsgate Drive, San Diego, CA 92130

CALL TO ORDER AND ATTENDANCE

Board Member	Representing	Present	Excused	Absent
1. Rick Newman	Neighborhood 1	X		
2. Nancy Novak	Neighborhood 3	X		
3. Hollie Kahn	Neighborhood 4/4A		X	
4. Debbie Lokanc	Neighborhood 5	X		
5. Christopher Moore	Neighborhood 6		X	
6. Steven Ross	Neighborhood 7		X	
7. Frisco White, Chair	Neighborhood 8	X		
8. Anne Harvey	Neighborhood 8A & 8B	X		
9. Steve Davison	Neighborhood 9			X
10. Laura Copic	Neighborhood 10	X		
11. Vacant	Pacific Highlands Ranch, District 11			
12. Jonathan Tedesco	Pacific Highlands Ranch, District 12	X		
13. VACANT	Business Representative			
14. Victor Manoushakian	Business Representative	X		
15. Allen Kashani, Secretary	Developer Representative	X		
16. Christian Clews	Investor Representative	X		
17. Brian Brady	Investor Representative	X		

Chair Frisco White stated that there had been a request to continue the discussion of St. John Garabed, scheduled for action by the Planning Board tonight. Board Member Anne Harvey noted that the San Dieguito River Park JPA has not seen the Final EIR, and she made a motion to continue the item (action item 4) until next meeting. Board Member Nancy Novak seconded motion. The Board discussed the motion. Board member Christian Clews stated that this item has been well noticed and there is strong representation from community. The motion failed on a vote of 4-6.

Chair White announced that he received a request for reconsideration of Motion #1 for One Paseo. Board Member Novak stated that no one had a chance to review the motion before the meeting and felt that the board was under duress and time constraints which impacted the way they voted. She asked for a reconsideration of that motion. Board Member Debbie Lokanc seconded the motion. Chair White noted that the group would have to suspend the bylaws in order to reconsider the motion and could not discuss the reconsideration until the October 23 board meeting. The project is going to Planning Commission on October 2. The Board discussed the motion. Due to lack of support for the motion no vote was taken.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Board Member Novak and seconded by Board Member Laura Copic to approve the minutes from the August 28, 2014 meeting. The motion passed 8-0-2.

Chair White announced that he received a list of additional supporters of One Paseo that attended the meeting on August 28. He would like to add this list to the September 11, 2014 minutes as an attachment. The following corrections were made to the minutes for September 11:

- Board Member Rick Newman asked to change the language on page 6 that referred to traffic mitigation from “can be mitigated” to “shall be mitigated.” The statement should be amended to “The traffic shall be mitigated without depending upon a major freeway improvement that may or may not happen in 14 -15 years.”
- Board Member Novak asked for clarification that the retail square footage on page 6 was inclusive of the cinema.
- Frisco suggested deleting the 410,000 square foot reference for residential use on page 6 and just refer to the number of units.
- Board Member Copic asked for an addition on page 3 under Transportation. She asked the city if there had been a case study for technology improvements to signals. She wanted to add that the city mentioned that they did a pilot study and they were convinced by this study that the technology would work.
- A type on page 5 was pointed out. Change “the provide” to “provide the” in the second paragraph under Project Alternatives.
- Board Member Novak asked to add to the bottom of page 2, in her comment about the City of Villages plan, that she stated that the City of Villages strategic framework states that "community plans are final arbiter on issues of land use, density, and intensity."
- Board Member Hollie Kahn asked to add information to page 3 under Transportation that she stated she had done a parking analysis and found that there was a deficit of parking space, and she offered to give the city a copy of her study.
- Board Member Novak asked that the following be added to the minutes, prior to the discussion of Motions on page 6: “Board member Nancy Novak stated the proposed project was too big and should be rejected and the Applicant invited to come back with a Reduced Mixed- Use Alternative project with a new EIR. A project whereby the traffic can be mitigated without depending upon a major highway improvement that may or may not happen in 15 years and a project that is in keeping with the Carmel Valley character.”

Board Member Novak made a motion to approve the minutes from the September 11, 2014 meeting, with the corrections noted above. The motion was seconded by Board Member Jonathan Tedesco and passed on a vote of 9-0-2.

CONSENT AGENDA

None.

PUBLIC COMMUNICATION

Jeanette Littler addressed the Board. She stated that she has observed the group for the last two years and she thanked the board members for their commitment. She noted that the Carmel Valley community is in desperate need of a community plan update. She would like to live in a community

where uses are contemporary and forward-looking instead of relying on a plan that was conceived when she was born. She indicated she wants to dedicate time and recruit volunteers to help with this effort. She also expressed concern about the ongoing treatment of applicants, noting that some appear to be more favored than others. She cited the approval of Donahue Schreiber's expansion, and said they were not in compliance with their own traffic mitigation (they have not constructed the required bus terminal), but other projects, like One Paseo, are held to a different standard. We should be asking Donahue Schreiber to fulfill this requirement. She feels that applicants should be treated equitably and held to the same standard.

Chair White asked if she would be willing to serve on the Community Plan Update Committee, and she indicated that she would.

Ken Farinsky addressed the board and indicated that he would also like to see the Community Plan updated. He thanked the board for listening to the community and rejecting the proposed One Paseo project. He encouraged members to attend and speak at the Planning Commission meeting for One Paseo on October 2.

Victor Manoushakian announced that his business is celebrating 25 years in business. He thanked people for 25 years of support for his business in Carmel Valley.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

None.

SAN DIEGO POLICE REPORT

Officer Williams reported that this Saturday from 10 a.m. to 2 p.m. there will be another prescription drug take back at the Northwest Division Substation on El Camino Real. He also reported that burglaries are up in the community recently. The latest series appears to happen during the day. He urged people to call the police if they hear glass breaking or they notice any suspicious people in the neighborhood. He handed out a flyer about how to help yourself not be a victim of crime. He also encouraged residents to sign up on nextdoor.com to get helpful information from the police.

Board Member Clews mentioned that there have been break-ins in his parking lot. The city is not doing a good job of maintaining the vegetation. He asked police to come check the area out and Officer Williams indicated they will drive through.

Officer Williams stated that he would be bringing the new Chief to a meeting soon.

WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS

None.

COMMUNITY PLANNER REPORT

None.

COUNCIL DISTRICT 1 PRESENTATION

Mel Millstein announced that the Mayor will be hosting a forum at Westfield UTC on October 6 at 5:30 p.m. at the Forum Hall. Councilmember Lightner will be in attendance.

MAYOR'S REPORT

None.

COUNTY SUPERVISOR'S REPORT

None.

STATE ASSEMBLY REPORT

Michael reported that Allen Kashani joined Assemblyman Maienschein recently for a meeting with the California Department of Fish & Wildlife to discuss the Del Mar Mesa Preserve. He stated that he understands that the outcome of the meeting was not what was hoped for, and the Assemblyman will be following up.

STATE SENATE REPORT

None.

US CONGRESS REPORT

None.

INFORMATION AGENDA

1. **Del Mar Union School District:** Update of District's Facilities Master Plan
 - Applicant - Holly McClurg, Superintendent, DMUSD

Chair White announced that this item has been postponed until the October 23 meeting.

ACTION ITEMS

1. **Electric Charging Stations:** Consider installation of four electric charging stations at CV Community Park.
 - Applicant - Jacques Chirazi, City of San Diego
 -

Mr. Chirazi made a presentation about electric vehicle charging stations. The city operates a number of electric vehicle charging stations and are proposing a station in this community. He presented to potential sites for a charging station in Carmel Valley: 1) At the Ocean Air Recreation Center, and 2) At Torrey Hills Community Park. He explained the proposed locations for each and how they would impact parking. Board Member Copic asked how the electric charge is paid for, and Mr. Chirazi answered that drivers pay for the charge with a credit or debit card. Board Member Copic noted that the Torrey Hills Community Park location is outside the Carmel Valley Planning Area, and she suggested that he present to the Torrey Hills Planning Group.

A motion was made by Board Member Copic to support locating the charging station at the Ocean Air Recreation Center site. The motion was seconded by Board Member Clews and passed 10-0-1.

2. **AT&T:** Consider proposed installation of wireless facility at Chipotle located at 3881 Valley Center Dr.

- Applicant - Shelly Kilbourn, PlanCom

Shelly Kilbourn presented on behalf of AT&T about their proposal to locate 12 cell antennas on top of a building in Carmel Valley. All antennas will be concealed inside screened boxes on the roofs. The equipment is located within the setback, so AT&T is seeking a variance. The equipment box is below the elevation of the road and not visible from the road. Board Member Clews asked if they were building this with an eye toward colocation. Ms. Kilbourn said they are always open to colocation but there will be a challenge finding location for equipment for other carriers. Board Member Manoushakian asked if this will provide revenue to landowners and Ms. Kilbourn indicated that the landowners will be paid rent. Board Member Copic asked if businesses were notified and Ms. Kilbourn said that they were notified. Board Member Lokanc asked about EMF, and Ms. Kilbourn answered that they comply with FCC standards. Chair White noted that the group's decision must be made based on planning issues and not EMF issues. Board Member Allen Kashani asked if there is a requirement for owners to disclose the location of the antennas to employees. Ms. Kilbourn did not know the answer to this questions but reiterated that businesses have been notified.

A motion was made by Board Member Clews and seconded by Board Member Manoushakian to approve the project, on the condition that employees be notified of the antennas being installed. The motion carried on a vote of 9-2.

2. **Corallina:** Consider the mixed-use Planned Development Permit, Rezone and Tentative Map for a 30ksf of commercial, 18 affordable units, 83 townhomes and 10 flats project in Pacific Highlands Ranch

- Applicant Randi Coopersmith, Latitude 33

Tara Lake with Latitude 33 presented an update on this mixed-use project. She showed elevations of the project and discussed design elements. She noted that alcoves have been added to the retail area for cafe seating and additional activation of the pedestrian areas. She noted that the last time they presented the project there was a concern that the project was too linear. Since then, the project has been redesigned to incorporate courtyards, articulation of the building, and decorative paving. She summarized that the project has kept a lot of what the community liked and made adjustments to the design to address concerns raised by the community. The applicant plans to resubmit the project to the city and keep working with the community group. She asked for a motion of support, but the applicant will keep working through the cycle review process and environmental document. Ms. Lake answered questions from the group about building height, interface with surrounding properties, affordable housing, parking, and pedestrian access.

A motion was made by Board Member Tedesco to support the conceptual rendering of the revised project as it has been presented, and that the applicant will continue to work with the Carmel Valley Planning Board throughout the project approval process. The motion was seconded by Board Member Clews.

Board Member Brian Brady expressed concern about making a motion at this stage in the project. Board Member Harvey pointed out that Pacific Highlands Ranch is a master planned community

with a master EIR that anticipated this development. Chair White suggested that the motion be rescinded and this be an information item. The motion maker and second were fine with this and the motion was rescinded. Chair White asked the applicant to show pedestrian linkages and connections next time they come back.

4. **St. John Garabed:** Consideration of St. John Garabed's request to approve a 350-seat church and three accessory buildings - Multi-Purpose; Cultural/Educational; and Youth Recreational. Project approvals include a Conditional Use Permit (CUP), Site Development Permit (SDP), Planned Development Permit (PDP), Coastal Development Permit and a MSCP Boundary Line Adjustment (BLA).

- Applicant - Ted Shaw, Atlantis Group

Board Member Kashani recused himself from this item.

Harry Kerkorian, volunteer and member of the St. John Garabed church introduced the project and provided some project history. He shared history of the Armenian community, and emphasized the importance of this church to San Diego's Armenian community. They purchased this property in 2008 to build a new church campus, and assembled a team and designed a project that would be compatible with the river valley and community.

Kathy Riser from Atlantis Group presented the details of the project. They have been going through the city process since 2011. She shared the project location and site details. The site is 13.4 acres and they are proposing to develop 4.2 acres with a 350-seat church and supporting uses. Nine acres of the property would be preserved. She indicated that the construction of this project would occur over many years, and the timing would be dependent on fundraising. In addition to the church, the project includes a 500-seat multi-purpose hall, a cultural and education center for religious instruction, and a youth center with recreational facilities.

She noted that many changes have been made as a result of comments from the community, city, and agencies. The location of the entrance road has been moved closer to the toe of the slope to avoid bisecting sensitive habitat. They have also pulled the buildings back 18 feet and lowered the youth center to reduce its massing.

The applicant is requesting some encroachments into setbacks. These encroachments are needed to implement some of the changes requested by the community. There is an encroachment into the setback of the adjacent vacant lot (next to the youth center). The owner of this property is OK with this, and the church will provide an access easement to the adjacent property owner. The other encroachment is into the setback for adjacent open space. Ms. Riser also discussed the height of the church and indicated that the proposed height is allowed per the zoning code. The highest point is the top of the cross at 93 feet. She noted that the project has been approved by the wildlife agencies.

Board Member Clews shared some history of the project and property and expressed his strong support. Board Member Brady stated he liked the project architecture and feels the applicant has done a good job preserving sensitive lands.

Board Member Lokanc asked why the educational building is not considered a school. Ms. Riser that it is for religious education, like Sunday school and would not be occupied every day.

Board Member Copic asked about the phasing of construction, and Mr. Kerkorian answered that it will all be driven by finances. They hope to be able to do all of the infrastructure, offsite improvements, and first building at the outset, but the rest will be constructed when the money is raised. She also asked about building materials. Architect Dennis Hyndman answered that it will have stone elements, but also stucco elements to fit in with the community.

Board Member Tedesco expressed concern that the church would be 50 feet taller than church next door at its highest point. He also expressed concern with the traffic as there are back-ups in that area during rush hour. Ms. Riser indicated that the traffic study found no impacts because the bulk of the church's use is on Sunday and the site will not be heavily utilized during peak traffic hours.

Board Member Harvey stated that this land was supposed to be a relief from urbanization, but the sanctuary is over twice as high as the adjacent church. The land was supposed to stay open or very low density residential.

Board Member Novak indicated she did not have time to read through the final EIR. She asked about access to the property from El Camino Real, and Ms. Riser answered that the access will be right in and right out. They have created an acceleration lane to allow cars to enter into traffic safely. There is also a 140 foot entrance lane for the right turn in.

Chair White indicated that the primary issue he has is the setback encroachments. He asked the design team if they have looked at all options for avoiding the setback encroachments. The team answered that they have looked at many different options and felt that the setback encroachment was a trade-off they made to preserve more sensitive habitat, and that the project looks less dense with more space between the buildings.

Board Member Clews compared the size of this church to other churches. St. Therese is a 1,500-seat church and this is a 350-seat church. The neighbor is not objecting to the setback encroachment and he is getting access to his property in return. Chair White clarified that it is the setback adjacent to the open space that he has an issue with. Architect Hyndman explained that if you moved the building to avoid the setback encroachment it could impact the hammerhead turnaround required for fire access. Chair White also asked about the MSCP Boundary Line Adjustment, and the representative from Dudek & Co. explained the areas that are being impacted, and the areas being enhanced.

Board Member Clews made a motion to support the project, as presented, and Board Member Manoushakian seconded the motion. The Board discussed the motion. Chair White asked the design team for a commitment to look at the youth center one more time to see if they have done everything possible to avoid the setback encroachment into the open space. The team said they would look at this, but cautioned that any adjustments cannot impact fire safety, parking, or sensitive habitat.

The Board voted and the motion carried on a vote of 6-4.

5. **Board Vice Chair:** Nominate and Vote on new Vice-Chair to serve remaining term.
- Applicant - Chair

Chair White asked for nominations from the board for someone to serve as Vice Chair for the remainder of the term until March 2015. He nominated Board Member Tedesco because he would like a Pacific Highlands Ranch representative in a leadership position. Board Member Clews nominated himself for the position. Board Member Tedesco was elected Vice Chair with nine votes, to Board Member Clews' two votes.

6. **Pacific Highland Ranch Appointment:** Confirm Chair's appointment of Shreya Sasaki to serve remaining term of PHR District 11.
- Applicant - Chair

Chair White asked for confirmation of Shreya Sasaki to fill out the remainder of the District 11 term, vacated by Manjeet Ranu's resignation. Ms. Sasaki lives in Pacific Highlands Ranch. She provided a summary of her background. She works in public health (Kaiser) and has served on the Parks and Livability subcommittees. Her primary interest is healthy communities and lowering obesity.

Board Member Novak made a motion to confirm her appointment, and the motion was seconded by Board Member Harvey. The motion carried on a vote of 11-0.

SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS

Subcommittee	Representative	Report	Next Meeting
1. Regional Issues & Design Review	Harvey, Jan Fuchs	None.	None noted
2. FBA	White	None	None noted
3. MAD	Newman	None	October 7, 4:30 p.m.
4. MAD N10	Copic	None	None noted
5. MAD PHR	Tedesco	None	None noted
6. Bylaws/Elections Policies/Procedures	Clews	An effort to amend the bylaws to take the San Dieguito River Valley into the planning area will be initiated soon.	None noted
7. Community Concourse	White	None	None noted
8. Trails	Harvey (Copic, alternate to LPCP CAC)	Manchester violations were unanimously approved by Planning Commission. CVPB will get \$250,000 for trail enhancements.	None noted
9. CVREP	Clews	City has not been maintaining their side of the parking lot and they have been allowing dumping.	None noted
10. San Dieguito River Park	Harvey	None	None noted
11. CPC	Novak	CPC approved the FBA fee deferral	None noted

Subcommittee	Representative	Report	Next Meeting
		program and final edits to policy 600-24.	
12. Signage	John Dean	None	None noted
13. Livability	Moore	None	None noted

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 10:40 p.m.