

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JANUARY 24, 2013
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:08 PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Absent
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Present <i>arrived at 1:13 PM</i>
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Assistant Deputy Director
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner
Camille Pekarek, Planning Intern
Sarah Vonesh, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR November 29, 2012

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE NOVEMBER 29, 2012
MINUTES AS WRITTEN**

Seconded by Boardmember Larimer Vote: 8-0-1 Motion Passes
(Bethke)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Marrone notified staff that she will not be in attendance. Vice-Chair Garbini and Boardmember Curry have to leave at 3:00PM.

• **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Correspondence for Item 8
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

• **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Boardmember Silvas will be serving on the County Historic Site Board.

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

• **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

• **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- We are pleased to announce that all of the individual designated properties are now available in CHRID. We are now in the process of imputing the Districts. We hope to have them available later this year.
- The next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, February 6, 2013. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, February 11, 2013. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, February 11, 2013.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 4 individual homeowner nominations, a revision to the Board Procedures; the Annual Certified Local Government (CLG) Report, and a national register nomination recommendation. There are 6 homeowner nominations in 2012 and 1 in 2013 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The applicant for Item 5 has requested the nomination be withdrawn until further notice.

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

- ITEM 6 – B. FRANKLIN AND HELEN MAHONEY/RICHARD REQUA HOUSE
- ITEM 7 – LOUIS AND CARMELITA FONTANEL HOUSE
- ITEM 9 – ANNUAL CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT (CLG)

ITEM 11 – SAN DIEGO ATHLETIC CLUB

Boardmember Berge pulled item 7 from the consent agenda.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 AND APPROVE ITEMS 9 AND 11 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 –560 SAN GORGONIO STREET

Applicant: Robert Ellis represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 560 San Gorgonio Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1288 3-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 560 San Gorgonio Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 560 San Gorgonio Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-12-078

ITEM WAS WITHDRAWN BY THE APPLICANT

ITEM 6 – B. FRANKLIN AND HELEN MAHONEY/RICHARD REQUA HOUSE

Applicant: James and Dori Cage Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4105 Alameda Drive, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 5-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4105 Alameda Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the B. Franklin and Helen Mahoney/Richard Requa House located at 4105 Alameda Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1921 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the service yard enclosure addition at the southeast corner of the structure behind the garage, totaling about 312 square feet.

Report Number: HRB 13-001

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 7 – LOUIS AND CARMELITA FONTANEL HOUSE

Applicant: Lawrence Frank represented by IS Architecture

Location: 4243 Jackdaw Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 5-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4243 Jackdaw Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Louis and Carmelita Fontanel House located at 4243 Jackdaw Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1922 under HRB Criterion C. The

designation excludes the circa 1950's detached garage and guest house, the 300 square-foot addition at the southeast portion of the house constructed in 1959, as well as the 2011 east elevation addition.

Report Number: HRB 13-002

Staff Report by Sarah Vonesh

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ione Stiegler, Lawrence Frank

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge was concerned that there wasn't a clear historic photo; and she is looking for clues in the existing house. She is troubled by the lack of clarity on what was originally there. The set of French doors next to the front entry door leading to the same room is unusual. She does not support designation.

Boardmember Rivera is on the fence due to the numerous modifications.

Boardmember Larimer is on the fence and wanted to know what it looked like prior to the modifications. Massing expressed is not typical/characteristic of Craftsman; something doesn't feel right.

Boardmember Bethke agrees with what has been said. The design does not seem typical for a Craftsman which may be significant. More detailed history and comparison to similar homes would be helpful.

Vice-Chair Garbini also agrees. French doors are unusual; if it was an enclosure it would make more sense.

Boardmember Baksh is on the fence, but could support.

Boardmember Woods agrees with Boardmember Baksh.

Boardmember Curry can support designation based on character defining features. The findings in the Staff report supports designation as Craftsman. Modifications comply with Standards and can be considered acceptable.

Chair Lemmo thinks the testimony is helpful, but the information isn't in the report. The Board could act on designation or the owner could request a continuance and revise the report to provide more information on restoration and modifications.

Boardmember Berge could make a motion to return the report for revision.

Boardmember Larimer wants more concentrated analysis on this home, rather than comparative analysis.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO CONTINUE ITEM 7- LOUIS AND CARMELITA FONTANEL HOUSE FOR THREE MONTHS

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 8 – 4747 PANORAMA DRIVE

Applicant: Brian Leslie

Location: 4747 Panorama Drive, 92116, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 3-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4747 Panorama Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 4747 Panorama Drive under any adopted HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB 13-003

Staff Report by Jeff Oakley

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Brian Leslie (*Samantha Strack*)

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Curry said the modifications would be difficult to reverse and have affected the historic integrity. Resource has to feel the story of what it was. She wants to hear more from other Boardmembers.

Boardmember Woods cannot support designation as it currently appears. Porch, French doors and windows are the most significant issues.

Boardmember Baksh agrees with Staff's report.

Boardmember Silvas agrees with Staff's report.

Chair Lemmo agrees with issues raised by the Staff report. Design Assistance could provide input and assistance. He can't support designation as it sits today, but there are things that could be done.

Vice-Chair Garbini thinks the house is beautiful and would like to see it come back.

Boardmember Bethke agrees with everything.

Boardmember Larimer agrees with other Boardmember comments. Home has great bones and is a beautiful home, but it is the minor details, the materials, walkway, doors and windows have been changed. Needs to go to DAS, cannot support today.

Boardmember Rivera also thinks it is a beautiful home but needs to reverse changes. Look at Criterion A as a possibility.

Boardmember Berge supports designation now; photo evokes significance of Storybook cottages.

Chair Lemmo would recommend that the owner withdraw the nomination and work with DAS, then come back when the work is done.

ITEM WAS WITHDRAWN BY THE APPLICANT

ITEM 9 – ANNUAL CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT (CLG) REPORT

Applicant: City of San Diego, Development Services Department

Location: Citywide

Description: The Historical Resources Board Annual Report to the State Office of Historic Preservation, Mayor and City Council consistent with the City's Certified Local Government (CLG) responsibilities and Municipal Code Section 111.0206 (d)(7) requirements.

Today's Action: Review, comment and approve the Annual Report.

Staff Recommendation: Direct staff to forward the Annual Report to the State Office of Historic Preservation and the San Diego City Council, or revise the Annual Report and forward as appropriate

Report Number: HRB 13-004

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 10 – REVISIONS TO BOARD PROCEDURES TO ELIMINATE AFFIRMATIVE MOTION REQUIREMENT

Applicant: City of San Diego, Development Services Department

Location: Citywide

Description: Consider an amendment to the Historical Resources Board Procedures related to designation procedures.

Today's Action: Approve the proposed amendment to the Historical Resources Board Procedures or do not approve the amendment.

Staff Recommendation: Approve either Amendment Option 1 or Amendment Option 2, revising the Board Procedures to eliminate the affirmative motion requirement.

Report Number: Staff Memo dated January 10, 2013

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Chair Lemmo supports option 1.

Boardmember Berge concurs.

Boardmember Rivera also supports option 1.

Boardmember Larimer is fine either way.

Boardmember Bethke had no comments.

Vice-Chair Garbini agrees.

Boardmember Silvas concurs.

Boardmember Baksh concurs.

Boardmember Woods agrees.

Boardmember Curry agrees.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO ADOPT STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION OPTION 1 WHICH STRIKES SECTION 2C OF THE BOARD PROCEDURES IN ITS ENTIRETY

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

