



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: March 18, 2014 REPORT NO. HRB-14-019

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of March 27, 2014

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – 3745 3rd Avenue**

APPLICANT: Darren Bwy represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 3745 3rd Ave, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property at 3745 3rd Avenue as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 3745 3rd Avenue under any adopted HRB Criteria.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application to determine whether or not the building is historically significant as part of a constraints analysis for future development. The property is located in the Uptown community in an area of single and multi family homes.

The building is located on APN 452-063-21-00. The property was identified in the 2007 Uptown Survey and given a Status Code of 5S3, “Appears to be individually eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation.”

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Scott Moomjian which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

There is no information provided to illustrate that the subject property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development of the City or Pacific Beach. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Chain of Title and City Directory research revealed past owners and tenants of the subject building, none of which appear to be historically significant individuals. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property was constructed ca. 1913 in the Craftsman style, the house features an intersecting gable roof sheathed with asphalt shingles and horizontal lap siding. A gabled front porch extends the width of the house and is supported by four brick columns. The foundation stem wall features decorative concrete block with extends up on to the lower portion of the porch columns and a low wall surrounding the porch. Fenestration on the house consists of the original wood divided light casement and fixed windows, in addition to replacement double hung vinyl window in the original openings. The exterior of the subject property includes a number of decorative details including dentil molding, knee braces, exposed rafter ends with a decorative end that match the header trim of the windows.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frames and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

There have been a number of modifications to the building that have adversely impacted its integrity. An addition that is not readily visible from the front façade of the house was constructed at the rear. The addition protrudes on the north elevation by approximately four feet. The addition features a low pitch gable roof and is sheathed with siding to match the original house. The addition wraps around the north east corner of the house and extends slightly on to the rear façade. More impactful to the character of the house is the replacement vinyl windows and the addition of two brick columns on the front porch. While the vinyl windows are located within their original openings they are simple 1/1 double hung windows and do not depict the

multi-light style present on the remaining original windows. Additionally, brick columns have been added to the front porch. The columns flank the front steps and rest on top of low half pillars that are sheathed with decorative concrete block. The columns are differentiated from the original columns at the end in that they are tapered with a smoother brick, but the placement of them detracts from the original design of the open porch. The new columns created a heavy closed in addition to the porch which would have normally had a long open span with the low wall. Based on the number of modifications to the house that have adversely impacted its character defining features, staff does not recommend designation under Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The property is not associated with a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers, and is therefore not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property is not located within a designated historic district, and is therefore not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.


OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.


CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is not recommended that the property located at 3745 3rd Avenue be designated under any HRB Criteria. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical

Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jodie Brown, AICP
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Deputy Director/HRB Liaison

JB/cw

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover