

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	July 24, 2014	REPORT NO. HRB-14-044
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of July 31, 2014	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #6 – George Heston House	
APPLICANT:	Kevin and Jill Smith Family Trust represent Drafting and Heritage Architecture & Plann	
LOCATION:	1911 28 th Street, Greater Golden Hill Comm	unity, Council District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the George Hes Street as a historical resource.	ston House located at 1911 28 th

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the George Heston House located at 1911 28th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the detached former garage that was converted to a guest house. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a flat roof with simple parapet; clay pipe roof drains; skip trowel stucco over wood frame construction; a side-entry porch with arched openings covered by a shed roof with single barrel clay tiles; a stucco chimney with inset arch detailing; a second floor balcony with a shed tile roof supported by simple stucco brackets, with a wrought iron railing and simple decorative brackets supporting the balcony floor; and fenestration consisting of an arched wood frame window with 15 leaded glass lites, 9 lite wood frame and sash awning windows, and tripartite windows consisting of a fixed center pane flanked by 1-over-1 double hung windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed building modification or demolition of a structure of 45 years or more, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212. The building is a one and two story single family home located

Planning Department 1222 First Avenue, MS 413 • San Diego, CA 92101-4155 Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 446-5499 on a canyon lot in the residential subdivision of Seaman and Choate. The building is located on APN 539-211-16-00. The property was located within the boundary of the Draft 2011 Greater Golden Hill Survey, but was not identified in the survey as a potentially significant resource.

The historic name of the resource, the George Heston House has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the original owner who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Professional Design & Drafting, which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff disagrees, and finds that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property located at 1911 28th Street did not reveal an information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or South Park's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 1911 28th Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property located at 1911 28th Street was constructed in 1925 in the Spanish Eclectic style and features a flat roof with simple parapet; clay pipe roof drains; skip trowel stucco over wood frame construction; and a concrete foundation. The house appears as a single story from 28th Street, and grows to two stories as the lot slopes down to the canyon. The front features a side-entry porch with arched openings covered by a shed roof with single barrel clay tiles. To the right of the porch is an arched wood frame window with 15 leaded glass lites. To the right of the arched window is a stucco chimney with inset arch detailing, flanked by 9 lite wood frame and sash awning windows. The southern, side elevation, generally visible from the paper street/trail, contains a second floor balcony with a shed tile roof supported by simple stucco brackets, with a wrought iron railing and simple decorative brackets supporting the balcony floor. Fenestration

consists of 9 lite wood frame and sash awning windows, and tri-partite windows consisting of a fixed center pane flanked by 1-over-1 double and single hung windows, some of which have been replaced with aluminum sashes. David Marshall with Heritage Architecture and Planning was hired by the owner to assess whether the southern elevation was original or a later addition, and it was determined that it is original, with the window modifications noted. The northern, side elevation features two sets of paired multi-lite single hung windows. At the rear of the lot along the northern elevation, at the end of the Hollywood driveway, sits the garage, which was converted to a guest house. The rear, eastern elevation of the house features a recessed arch patio, a pop-out addition, and basic fenestration consisting of tripartite windows, a jalousie window and single lite wood frame and sash casement windows.

Modifications include replacement of two windows on the north, side elevation; construction of the pop-out at the rear and excavation of crawlspace to create habitable space; replacement of some of the original 1-over-1 double hung wood windows with aluminum windows on the south side and rear elevations; conversion of the garage space to a guest house; and construction of a wood deck at the rear. The modifications are minimal, and although they impact integrity of materials and to a lesser degree design and feeling, they do not result in a loss of integrity.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house, which retains integrity to its 1925 date of construction and period of significance, continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a flat roof with simple parapet; clay pipe roof drains; skip trowel stucco over wood frame construction; a side-entry porch with arched openings covered by a shed roof with single barrel clay tiles; a stucco chimney with inset arch detailing; a second floor balcony with a shed tile roof supported by simple stucco brackets, with a wrought iron railing and simple decorative brackets supporting the balcony floor; and fenestration consisting of an arched wood frame window with 15 leaded glass lites, 9 lite wood frame and sash awning windows, and tri-partite windows consisting of a fixed center pane flanked by 1-over-1 double hung windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The architect and/or builder of the property at 1911 28th Street could not be identified. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 1911 28th Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 11911 28th Street is not located within a designated historic district, and is therefore not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the George Heston House located at 1911 28th Street be designated with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C, as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains integrity. The designation excludes the detached former garage that was converted to a guest house. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Kelley Stanco Senior Planner

KS/cw

Attachments:

Cathy Winterrowd Deputy Director/HRB Liaison

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 7/31/2014

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 7/31/2014, to consider the historical designation of the **George Heston House** (owned by Kevin and Jill Smith Family Trust 04-13-12, 1911 28th Street, San Diego, CA 92102) located at **1911 28th Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92102**, APN: **539-211-16-00**, further described as BLK 47 LOTS 9 THRU 12 ST CLSD ADJ & in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as Site No. 0, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the George Heston House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1925 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a flat roof with simple parapet; clay pipe roof drains; skip trowel stucco over wood frame construction; a side-entry porch with arched openings covered by a shed roof with single barrel clay tiles; a stucco chimney with inset arch detailing; a second floor balcony with a shed tile roof supported by simple stucco brackets, with a wrought iron railing and simple decorative brackets supporting the balcony floor; and fenestration consisting of an arched wood frame window with 15 leaded glass lites, 9 lite wood frame and sash awning windows, and tri-partite windows consisting of a fixed center pane flanked by 1-over-1 double hung windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the detached former garage that was converted to a guest house.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY:

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH, CITY ATTORNEY JOHN LEMMO, Chair Historical Resources Board

BY:

CORRINE NEUFFER, Deputy City Attorney