



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 12, 2014 REPORT NO. HRB-14-059

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of September 25, 2014

SUBJECT: **ITEM #10 – Dr. Andrew and Augusta Wessels House (HRB Site #1120)**

APPLICANT: Matthew L. Richardson Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 4274 Randolph Street, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider an amendment to the Dr. Andrew and Augusta Wessels House (HRB Site #1120) located at 4274 Randolph Street to include designation under HRB Criterion B.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not amend the designation of the Dr. Andrew and Augusta Wessels House located at 4274 Randolph Street to include designation under HRB Criterion B.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board to consider an amendment to the designation of HRB Site #1120 located at 4274 Randolph Street, in accordance with SDMC Section 123.0205.

The subject property was designated by the Board on October 24, 2013 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style of architecture with a period of significance of 1927. At that time the Board also considered a proposed designation under Criterion B for association with James Dallas Clark and Mary Hollis Clark, local philanthropists and long-time residents of the property. Some Boardmembers expressed interest in Criterion B but felt that there was not enough information and analysis on the Clarks presented in the Research Report to designate. A motion to designate under Criterion B was made but not seconded and put to a vote. The Board ultimately moved to recommend that the owner and consultant return to the Board at a later time with more information and analysis in support of designation under Criterion B (Attachment 1).

Following the hearing, the property owner and consultant provided a Supplemental Research Report which included some more facts about the Clarks and their activities (Attachment 2). The owner wishes for the Board to review this information and consider amending the designation to include Criterion B.

ANALYSIS

A Supplemental Research Report was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc. which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion B. Staff finds that the site is not a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion B due to a lack of historical significance and associative integrity. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

James Dallas Clark and Mary Hollis Clark owned and occupied the subject property between 1956 and 2010. The Clarks were very philanthropically active and gave generously of their money and time to various cultural, educational, and research institutions around San Diego. Their charitable activities spanned many decades and normally involved serving on the boards of these institutions, contributing and raising funds, and general advocacy. Just some of the many institutions they supported include the Natural History Museum, the Old Globe Theater, the San Diego Zoo, the San Diego Museum of Art, the Timken Museum, and Rady Children's Hospital. The report provides additional information on the activities of the Clarks as well as biographical notes, but does not adequately expand on their significance. The report does not illustrate how the Clarks and/or their relatively recent achievements are demonstrably important to San Diego's history. Participation in civic leadership and philanthropy is surely critical to maintaining cultural standards; however its significance normally relies on collective efforts rather than on those of an individual. The Clarks contributions were vast and numerous; however in each they were one among many in an effort to support existing institutions and organizations that enhance the community. The report does not adequately demonstrate the historic significance of the Clarks, or why their charitable contributions were of any greater import than those made by others – others who may or may not have had as much to give as the Clarks.

The report asserts that the subject residence best represents the Clarks' productive period in San Diego. However, there is no documentation or explanation provided to indicate how the house is best identified as a reflection of the Clarks' and any historic significance they may represent. Furthermore, the report does not discuss whether other resources associated with the Clarks' achievements may be better representations of their significance. Staff finds that any historic significance in the Clarks' philanthropic contributions would be best represented in the many institutions and organizations they supported – some of which are already historically designated or located within an existing historic district. The Clarks appear to have been very humble in their charitable activities – often making anonymous donations; they were reported to have avoided the limelight. Their concern was on supporting organizations they were passionate about, and on encouraging others to do the same. In keeping with that interest, it would follow that the Clarks' significance is best embodied in those institutions such as the Natural History Museum, the Old Globe Theater, the Museum of Art, and many others.

Significance Statement: The report does not adequately demonstrate the historical significance of the achievements and contributions of the Clarks, nor does it detail the associative integrity of the subject property. Therefore staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion B.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property's designation is amended by the HRB to include Criterion B as proposed by the owner, the historic name of the resource will be amended in accordance with the Board's adopted naming policy to include the names of James and Mary Clark.

In regard to the period of significance, the supplemental report suggests a Criterion B period of significance of 1956-2010, marked by the Clarks' occupation of the building until Mary Clark's death in 2010. If the property's designation is amended by the HRB to include Criterion B a period of significance this long and recent is considered inappropriate by staff for an historic designation. Furthermore, for a designation under Criterion B based on the significance of the contributions of the Clarks, an "end date" based on Mary's death is inappropriate if it is to be understood that their contributions have had a lasting effect on the community. Alternatively, a date range of 1956-present would extend the period of time into the indefinite future without knowing whether the Clarks' contributions continue to serve their significant function. Staff maintains that any historic significance the Clarks and their contributions may have is best embodied in the institutions they supported, and that the period of significance for the subject property is best kept at 1927 if it is to retain any connection with the past.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted, it is recommended that the designation of the Dr. Andrew and Augusta Wessels House (HRB Site #1120) located at 4274 Randolph Street not be amended to include Criterion B. The resource would continue to be maintained in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards as HRB Site #1120. The benefits of the existing designation will remain, including the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Junior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Deputy Director/HRB Liaison

CP/cw

Attachments:

1. HRB Minutes from October 24, 2013
2. Applicant's Supplemental Research Report (under separate cover)

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF OCTOBER 24, 2013
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:05PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present <i>arrived @ 1:07pm</i>
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present <i>arrived @ 1:07pm</i>
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present <i>arrived @ 1:15pm</i>
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Interim Deputy Director
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Camille Pekarek, Junior Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR July 25, 2013 and September 26, 2013

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR THE JULY 25, 2013 AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 8-0-1

(Silvas)

Motion Passes

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR THE SEPTEMBER 26, 2013 AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Chair Lemmo

Vote: 5-0-4

(Garbini, Marrone, Larimer, Rivera)

Motion Passes

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Curry notified Staff that she would not be in attendance. Boardmember Silvas is running late.

• **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Draft Minutes for July and September 2013
- ✓ Request for Continuance for Item 6
- ✓ Request for Continuance for Item 10
- ✓ Correspondence for Item 7
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

• **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

• **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

• **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- Welcome Camille Pekarek
- December meeting date changed to Wednesday, December 11, 2013
- Appeal for HRB 1100 – 579 San Elijo Street (Designated 5/23/2013)
- Appeal for HRB 1102 – 372 Fourth Avenue (Designated 6/27/2013)
- Introduction of William Fulton

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

SOHO is requesting a continuance to the December 2013 agenda for Item 6 – 2382 Via Capri Court and the Applicant for Item 10- 2243 Guy Street is requesting a continuance to the December 2013 agenda.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO CONTINUE ITEMS 6 AND 10 TO THE DECEMBER HRB MEETING

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 8 – WILLIAM AND MINERVA WELTON HOUSE

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA
PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – ADMINISTRATIVE BOARD PROCEDURES

Applicant: City of San Diego, Development Services Department

Location: Citywide

Description: Consider an amendment to the Historical Resources Board Procedures related to time limits for Boardmember comment during HRB meetings in order to facilitate moving through the agenda in a more timely manner.

Today's Action: Approve the proposed amendment to the Historical Resources Board Procedures or do not approve the amendment.

Staff Recommendation: Approve the proposed amendment for a trial period of three Board meetings prior to final approval of the amendment to the Procedures.

Report Number: Staff Memo with attached proposed amendment dated October 10, 2013

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd; simple majority vote to approve

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Chair Lemmo clarified that it was 3 minutes per Boardmember per Item.

Boardmember Rivera questioned if it was three minutes for both Boardmember comments as well as additional board discussion time.

Boardmember Woods questioned if the three minutes included any additional questions or feedback from the consultant, she supports Staff’s recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh has put a lot of thought into this and thinks that it is worth trying for the three month trial.

Chair Lemmo also agrees that it is worth trying for the trial period.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff’s recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff’s recommendation.

Boardmember Larimer supports Staff’s recommendation.

Boardmember Bethke isn’t sure about this policy, has concerns that we are trying to speed up the process by rushing to them in and out.

Boardmember Silvas agrees with Boardmember Bethke's comments, would also like to hear other Boardmembers comments with regards to the consent items.

Boardmember Berge also has many concerns and does not feel there is a need to impose a time limit on the Board.

Chair Lemmo thinks the provision that makes this permanent after three months should be eliminated. He supports this and thinks that the Board should try it for the three month trial period; and then have another action to make it permanent. This will be helpful for him, as well as any future Chair's, to have some sort of a guideline to how long Board deliberations should be.

Boardmember Berge wants "shall" changed to "should" per Boardmember.

Chair Lemmo revise provision to state "Boardmember comments should be limited to three minutes per item agenda item, per member."

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE THIS ADDITION TO OUR PROCEDURE AS I JUST STATED IT BE REVISED FOR THREE MONTHS BUT THAT IT NOT BECOME PERMANENT AND THAT IT EXPIRE AFTER THREE MONTHS AND WILL BE REVISITED AT THE FOURTH MEETING

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 9-1-0
(Berge)

Motion Passes

ITEM 6 – ROBERT AND LILLIAN ORR HOUSE

Continued from September 2013

Applicant: Robert Lambert and Robin Felice represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 2382 Via Capri Court, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 6-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2382 Via Capri Court as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Robert and Lillian Orr House located at 2382 Via Capri Court as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1963 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 13-041

ITEM WAS CONTINUED TO THE DECEMBER 2013 HRB AT THE APPLICANT'S REQUEST

ITEM 7 – CHARLES RUTHERFORD SPEC HOUSE

Applicant: Patricia and Corey Cheney III represented by Legacy 106, Inc

Location: 3030 Dumas Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 7-D**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3030 Dumas Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Charles Rutherford Spec House located at 3030 Dumas Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1930 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 13-048

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek; affirmative vote of 6 to designate

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ron May, Kiley Wallace, Corey Cheney, Patricia Cheney

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge supports Staff's recommendation, but also supports designation under Criterion B.

Boardmember Silvas thinks this is a win-win for everyone, supports designation under Criteria B and C.

Boardmember Bethke supports designation under Criterion C. He thinks that argument for Criterion B is interesting, but questions whether or not the house is appropriate with regards to naming. It is more appropriate to name the ship after him. Not sure if designation under Criterion B is appropriate in preservation standards.

Boardmember Larimer is more focused on the architecture and has concerns with the windows and the awnings; they don't seem to be historic and don't quite feel right. Criterion B is a great opportunity to personify WWII through Chaplain Kirkpatrick. Agrees with Boardmember Bethke comments, plus he has already been recognized by the Navy.

Boardmember Marrone supports Criterion B, connection with Chaplain is good.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports designation under both Criteria B and C, would like the wrought iron to go back.

Chair Lemmo supports designation under Criterion C. He supports designation under Criterion B for the historical nature of this individual and significance as it relates to this particular house, this is a narrow path we have to weave here.

Boardmember Baksh supports designation under Criteria C and B.

Boardmember Woods is conflicted about B, but is leaning towards supporting. She wishes the connection was stronger to NTC.

Boardmember Rivera is leaning towards not supporting Criterion B, home was rented not owned. She is troubled by Criterion C with the doors, windows, awnings and wrought iron.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – CHARLES RUTHERFORD SPEC HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Vice-Chair Garbini

Vote: 9-1-0

Motion Passes

(Rivera)

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 –CHAPLAIN THOMAS L. KIRKPATRICK HOUSE UNDER CRITERION B BASED UPON THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS: THE RESOURCE IS A SAN DIEGO RESIDENCE ASSOCIATED THE LONGEST WITH HIS SERVICE TO HIS COUNTRY WHILE STATIONED IN SAN DIEGO, INCLUDING HIS SERVICE AS CHAPLAIN FOR NTC AND MCRD AND WHEN HE RECEIVED HIS ORDERS TO REPORT TO THE USS ARIZONA PRIOR TO HIS DEATH ABOARD THE USS ARIZONA AT PEARL HARBOR DECEMBER 7, 1941. KIRKPATRICK, ONE OF THE FIRST CHAPLAINS KILLED IN WWII, PUTS THE HUMAN FACE TO SAN DIEGO'S LOCAL AND NATIONAL MILITARY ROLE IN THE YEARS PRIOR TO AND INTO THE COUNTRY'S

MOBILIZATION FOR WWI. THIS IS SHOWN IN NEWSPAPER REPORTS AND THE NAVY'S COMMISSIONING OF THE DESTROYER ESCORT THE USS KIRKPATRICK DURING THE WAR. THE RESOURCES PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE IS FROM 1938-1940, WHEN CAPTAIN KIRKPATRICK RESIDED THERE AND THE RESOURCE RETAINS SUFFICIENT HISTORIC INTEGRITY TO CONVEY ITS SIGNIFICANCE. THESE FINDINGS ARE FURTHER SUPPORTED BY THE HISTORIC RESOURCES REPORT AND WRITTEN AND ORAL EVIDENCE PRESENTED DURING THE DESIGNATION HEARING.

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 8-2-0

Motion Passes

(Bethke, Rivera)

ITEM 8 – WILLIAM AND MINERVA WELTON HOUSE

Applicant Heidi Radaford and Barry Shubert represented by Heritage Architecture & Planning

Location: 3033 Elliott Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 **(1268 7-D)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3033 Elliott Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the William and Minerva Welton House located at 3033 Elliott Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 13-049

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 – DR. ANDREW AND AUGUSTA WESSELS HOUSE

Applicant: Mathew L. Richardson Trust represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 4274 Randolph Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 **(1268 4-H)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4274 Randolph Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Dr. Andrew and Augusta Wessels House located at 4274 Randolph Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the detached pool house at the south end of the property.

Report Number: HRB 13-050

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek; affirmative vote of 6 to designate

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Vonn Marie May, Matt Richardson

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge thinks that this is another example of whether or not to apply Criterion B. The previous owners were very active in San Diego, supports designation under Criteria B and C.

Boardmember Silvas also supports designation under Criteria B and C.

Boardmember Bethke supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Larimer supports Staff's recommendation, agrees with Boardmember Berge on Criterion B.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff's recommendation, would like to hear more on Criterion B.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff's recommendation, Criterion B is interesting.

Chair Lemmo supports Staff's recommendation, not enough information in report to support Criterion B.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation, but can't support Criterion B.

Boardmember Rivera supports designation under both Criteria B and C, owners established footprints in San Diego.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – DR. ANDREW AND AUGUSTA WESSELS HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Larimer

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER RIVERA TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – JAMES DALLAS AND MARY HOLLIS CLARK HOUSE UNDER CRITERION B AS SIGNIFICANT MEMBERS TO THE COMMUNITY FOR THEIR CULTURAL AND PHILANTHROPIC ENDEAVORS IN CORRELATION TO THE CITY MUSEUMS, SAN DIEGO ZOO, THE MILITARY AND LOCAL COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES WITH A 1956-2010 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE.

No Second

Motion Fails

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO RECOMMEND THAT THE OWNER AND CONSULTANT PREPARE ADDITIONAL INFORMATION REGARDING THE SIGNIFICANCE OF JAMES DALLAS AND MARY HOLLIS CLARK IN SAN DIEGO REGIONAL HISTORY AND BRING THE REPORT BACK TO THE HRB WITH THE ANALYSIS OF WHY THEIR ASSOCIATION IS IMPORTANT IN SAN DIEGO'S HISTORY

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 7-1-2

Motion Passes

(Bethke, Garbini)

ITEM 10 – 2243 GUY STREET

Applicant: Gary and Joy Spradling Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2243 Guy Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2243 Guy Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 2243 Guy Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB 13-051

ITEM WAS CONTINUED TO THE DECEMBER 2013 HRB AT SOHO'S REQUEST

ITEM 11 – JOHN C. AND MARIE O. TURNER HOUSE

Applicant: Brian Leslie

Location: 4747 Panorama Drive, 92116, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 3-C)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4747 Panorama Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John C. and Marie O. Turner House located at 4747 Panorama Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear detached garage and dwelling unit.

Report Number: HRB 13-052

Staff Report by Jodie Brown; affirmative vote of 6 to designate

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Samantha Strack, Brian Leslie

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Bethke likes the house, had previous concerns with the windows, patio and French doors at the front. He still has concerns with the French doors; they have the same surround and wood work as the original windows and are not differentiated.

Boardmember Rivera thinks that the work they did is significant enough, supports designation.

Boardmember Woods is not bothered by the French doors, the 8-light vs. 6-light windows are enough to distinguish.

Boardmember Baksh appreciates the changes, supports designation.

Chair Lemmo agrees that the French doors do not meet the Secretary of Interior Standards but still supports designation.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff's recommendation, is not bothered by the French doors.

Boardmember Larimer commends work by owner, supports designation.

Boardmember Berge is not bothered by the French doors, has more concerns with the flagstone on the front porch. She supports Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 – JOHN C. AND MARIE O. TURNER HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Chair Lemmo

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Wednesday, December 11, 2013

LOCATION:

City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:31PM