



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 20, 2014 REPORT NO. HRB-14-075

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of December 4, 2014

SUBJECT: **ITEM #13 – The Antonio and Estela Martinez House**

APPLICANT: Donohue-Hill Trust represented by Scott Moomjian

LOCATION: 1051 Myrtle Way, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Antonio and Estela Martinez located at 1051 Myrtle Way as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Antonio and Estela Martinez House located at 1051 Myrtle Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1930 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the enclosed porch at the southwest corner. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1930 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its character-defining features which include stucco facades, wood casement windows, centrally located front door with decorative stone work surrounding the door, clay tile roof with exposed roof rafters and open wrap around balconies.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is located in the Marston Hills subdivision in a single family neighborhood.

The building is located on APN 452-450-22-00. The property was identified in the 2007 Draft Uptown Survey and given a Status Code of 5D3, "Appears to be a contributor to a district that appears to be eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the Antonio and Estela Martinez House has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of owner who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Kathy Crawford which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A, C, D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not HRB Criteria A and D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The property is located in the Marston Hills subdivision, an upscale neighborhood of single family homes. The subject residence is located at the apex of the "horse shoe" street at the end of Myrtle Way. When the home was originally constructed it was located directly across from an arbor structure that lead into the canyon/park area. The consultant states that the house exemplifies the construction of Spanish Eclectic style popular at the time. Since the original date of construction, the arbor has been removed and additional homes have been constructed in its place. While the home is sited at the apex of Myrtle Way it does not reflect a special element of the City's, community's or neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

Constructed in 1930, the house was designed in the Spanish Eclectic style. The one and two story residence features a hipped clay tile roof with exposed rafter tails and a stucco exterior. The fenestration consists of wood divided light casement and fixed single light and divided windows. The front entrance is centrally located on stepped façade and features a decorative surround with a stained glass window and faux Juliet balcony directly above the door. The northwest corner features a wrap around balcony with a shed roof and wrought iron railing, supported by decorative corbels. The south façade features an attached two car garage. The west (rear) façade features several windows spaced sporadically on the wall plane including several arched window and door openings. The northwest corner features a cantilever second story with decorative corbels, while the southwest corner features a second story access to a deck above the garage.

There have been a number of alterations to the property. In 1962, the porch at the southwest corner of the house was enclosed. The west façade of this addition currently features a tripartite window and the south façade of this addition features French doors. In 2008, the roof was redone reusing the existing tiles. Also in 2008, the north façade was modified and two windows

on this façade were replaced with doors. As part of these renovations, the original front concrete steps, stoop, and sidewalk were replaced with stone pavers and decorative pottery was added. Additionally, a stone paver patio was added to the north façade. The limited modifications to the subject building do not alter its character defining features or significantly impair the integrity as it relates to the 1930 date of construction.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of Spanish Eclectic architecture by embodying the character defining features of the style including stucco facades, wood casement windows, centrally located front door with decorative stone work surrounding the door, clay tile roof with exposed roof rafters and open wrap around balconies. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C with a 1930 period of significance. The designation excludes the enclosed porch at the southwest corner.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.


The consultant has noted that the property was designed by Ralph L. Frank. After reviewing the report, it is noted that Frank sold the land to the Martinez family in 1929. The date of construction is 1930 based on the Lot and Block Book and the Water and Sewer records. The Notice of Completion is dated 1962 and appears to refer to the enclosure of the porch at the southwest corner. While the Deed from the Date of Construction indicates that Frank sold the house to the Martinez family in 1929, there is nothing else to link Frank to the property. The Water and Sewer records were signed by Martinez, there is no Notice of Completion from the date of construction and there is no other documentation that clearly links Frank to the property, such as articles, plans or advertisements. While it is probable that Frank designed the subject house it is speculative at best. Staff recommends that the consultant continue to research the subject property and return to the HRB at a later date with more information on the architect of the house. Given the speculative nature of Frank's connection to the house, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Antonio and Estela Martinez House located at 1051 Myrtle Way be designated with a period of significance of 1930 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style of architecture. The designation excludes the enclosed porch at the southwest corner. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jodie Brown, AICP
Senior Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

JB/ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 12/4/2014

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 12/4/2014, to consider the historical designation of the **Antonio and Estela Martinez House** (owned by Donohue-Hill Trust 07-05-09, 1051 Myrtle Way, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **1051 Myrtle Way, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **452-450-22-00**, further described as LOT 48 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Antonio and Estela Martinez House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1930 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its character-defining features which include stucco facades, wood casement windows, centrally located front door with decorative stone work surrounding the door, clay tile roof with exposed roof rafters and open wrap around balconies. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the enclosed porch at the southwest corner.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney