



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 8, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-002

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of January 22, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – Roy and Anna Ridgeway House**

APPLICANT: JLMR Investments LP represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 1053 Myrtle Way, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Roy and Anna Ridgeway House located at 1053 Myrtle Way as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Roy and Anna Ridgeway House located at 1053 Myrtle Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the modified rear detached garage. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical façade, medium-pitched gabled roof of Mission clay tile combined with flat roof with parapet; minimal eave overhang enclosed by a rounded stucco cornice; moderately textured stucco cladding; accented windows along the primary elevation; and fenestration consisting primarily of wood double hung windows of various light patterns.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application to determine whether or not the building is historically significant as part of a constraints analysis for future development. The resource is a one story single family residence built in 1927 in the Spanish Eclectic style, and located on the south side of Myrtle way, west of Vermont Street in the Marston Hills Subdivision of the Uptown Community.

The building is located on APN 453-450-20-00. The property was identified in the 2007 Draft Uptown Survey and given a Status Code of 5D3, “Appears to be a contributor to a district that appears to be eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation.”

The historic name of the resource, the Roy and Anna Ridgeway House, has been identified consistent with the Board’s adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Roy and Anna Ridgeway, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is not eligible for designation under any HRB Criterion. Staff disagrees with the conclusion of the Research Report and finds that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City’s, a community’s or a neighborhood’s historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 1053 Myrtle Way did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City’s or Uptown’s historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 1053 Myrtle Way did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not recommended for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a one story Spanish Eclectic style single family residence with detached garage built in 1927. The building is of standard wood frame construction on a concrete foundation with floor joists, and maintains an original simple “L”-shaped footprint sited on a flat, rectangular lot in the Marston Hills subdivision. The building exhibits an asymmetrical primary façade and is clad in moderately textured stucco. The roof is predominantly flat with parapet, with a combination gable and shed roof of Mission clay tile at the front. Eave overhang is minimal and enclosed by a rounded stucco cornice. Fenestration consists primarily of wood double hung windows. A front-gable is offered at the west end of the façade and exhibits five round clay tile attic vents and an inset wood fixed accent window with wrought iron railing

below. The primary entry door faces east, on the left side of the front-gable, sheltered by a shed roof porch cover with hand-hewn beams and columns. A pair of ten-light wood French doors with matching full-size sidelights is also accessed from the recessed porch area. The east end of the façade presents a projecting bay with a low-pitched hipped roof of Mission clay tile and wood double hung windows with multi-light upper sashes. An 8-over-1 wood double hung window sits between the bay window and recessed porch. A stucco chimney is located along the west (side) elevation. A scored concrete driveway along the east property line leads to the rear detached garage with matching stucco and flat roof.

Modifications to the structure are negligible and do not impair integrity or detract from the building's character-defining features. These modifications are limited strictly to miscellaneous site improvements at the rear and alterations to the detached garage structure, including garage door replacement and the installation of a window and sliding glass door along its west (side) elevation. Known modifications have resulted in no direct impact to the primary residential structure. Considering the alterations to the garage and its scarcity of architectural detail linking it to the residence, the structure does not add any meaningful, character-defining value to the resource. Therefore, staff recommends any designation exclude the rear detached garage.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, and unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

Significance Statement: The resource retains a high degree of integrity due to very limited modifications. The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including asymmetrical façade, medium-pitched gabled roof of Mission clay tile combined with flat roof with parapet; minimal eave overhang enclosed by a rounded stucco cornice; moderately textured stucco cladding; accented windows along the primary elevation; and fenestration consisting primarily of wood double hung windows of various light patterns. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C, excluding the modified rear detached garage.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

According to the Notice of Completion, Clarence R. Bayless was contracted to construct the subject building in 1927. Bayless is not established as a Master Builder nor is there sufficient information available to grant Master status at this time. The architect (if one was obtained) could not be identified. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 1053 Myrtle Way has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 1053 Myrtle Way is not located within a designated historic district, and is therefore not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Roy and Anna Ridgeway House located at 1053 Myrtle Way be designated with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style. The designation excludes the modified rear detached garage. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Associate Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

CP/ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 1/22/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/22/2015, to consider the historical designation of the **Roy and Anna Ridgeway House** (owned by JLMR Investments LP, PO Box 34626, San Diego, CA 92163) located at **1053 Myrtle Way, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **452-450-20-00**, further described as LOT 46 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Roy and Anna Ridgeway House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical façade, medium-pitched gabled roof of Mission clay tile combined with flat roof with parapet; minimal eave overhang enclosed by a rounded stucco cornice; moderately textured stucco cladding; accented windows along the primary elevation; and fenestration consisting primarily of wood double hung windows of various light patterns. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the modified rear detached garage.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
HEATHER FERBERT,
Deputy City Attorney